CENTRE FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT POLICY STUDIES
(CSDP)

RESEARCH REPORT
GENDERED MARKET SELECTION AND MAPPING FOR ECONOMIC
LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT OF RAGLAI WOMEN IN BAC AI
AND THUAN BAC DISTRICTS, NINH THUAN PROVINCE
(Final)

Ha Noi, October 2010
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Research on “Gendered Market Selection and Mapping for Economic Leadership Development of Raglai Women in Bac Ai and Thuận Bac District, Ninh Thuan Province” funded by Oxfam Great Britain (OGB) and was conducted by a team of researchers from the Centre for Sustainable Development Policy Studies (CSDP) and its associates. The purpose of research was to analyse main local agricultural products in order to develop community enterprises in which Raglai poor women can participate in and benefit from. The research team was also requested to come up with recommendations on relevant future development interventions for local governments and OGB.

The research team would like to express its sincere thanks to leaders and government officers in Ninh Thuan province (DPI, DARD, Department of Industry and Trade, DONRE, Women’s Union, Farmers’ Association and Confederation of Cooperatives); leaders and officers of People’s Committee and various sections of Thuận Bac and Bac Ai Districts (Finance and Planning, Agriculture and Rural Development, Industry and Trade, Women’s Union and Farmers’ Association); leaders and officers of Phước Thang and Phước Tân communes (Bac Ai District), Lợi Hải commune (Thuận Bac District) for their valuable support and cooperation during the process of gathering information and field work.

This research would be impossible to complete without the collaboration of village heads and people in Ma Ty and Cha Dung villages (Phước Thang commune), Ma Ty and Da Trang villages (Phước Tân commune), Kien Kien 2 and Suoi Da villages (Lợi Hải commune) who spent their time in group discussions and household interviews. The research team is deeply grateful for their active participation and shared opinions.

The research team is grateful to Oxfam GB’s staff in Hà Nội and Ninh Thuan offices, namely Mr. Nguyễn Quang Minh, Mr. Nguyễn Ngọc Hưng, Mr. Hoàng Ngọc Ty, Ms..Pinang Thị Phuoc and Ms. Nguyễn Thị Thu Huyen for their professional support and technical inputs in defining and conducting this research, as well as for the comments made during the drafting and finalisation of the research report.

Last but not least, the appreciation should go to CSDP staff, namely Ms. Đỗ Thị Thanh Thúy and Ms. Trần Châu Giang for their effective logistic support.

The research team is well aware of some limitations and errors in this report and therefore, is grateful for receiving feedbacks from readers for further improvement.

On behalf of the research team
PhD. Nguyen Van Huan

1 The team members are: PhD. Nguyen Van Huan (team leader), MA. Vu Ngọc Anh, Eng. Hoàng Xuân Trường, PhD. Mai Thành Sơn, PhD. Đại Thị Hoàng Mai, MBA. Trường Đức Tùng, PhD. Lê Anh Vũ, MB. Nguyễn Thị Tu and MA. Phạm Thị Văn.
# TABLE OF CONTENT

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT 2  

TABLE OF CONTENT 3  

ACCRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS 6  

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY 7  

I. INTRODUCTION 17  

1.1 Research objective 17  

1.2. Research contents 17  

1.2.1. Analysis and general evaluation of socio-economic situation in surveyed areas 17  

1.2.2. Analysis of current agricultural product value chains with market development potential 17  

1.2.3. Necessary and sufficient conditions for WEL of Raglai women in value chains of agricultural products in Ninh Thuan province 18  

1.3 Research approach and methodology 18  

1.3.1. Research approach 18  

1.3.2. Research methodology 19  

1.3.3. Selection of surveyed areas 20  

1.4. Research constraints 20  

II. BACKGROUND INFORMATION 21  

2.1. The concept of women’s economic leadership 21  

2.2. Change of supporting poverty reduction direction from subsidising/giving aid to facilitating a better access to market opportunities 21  

2.3. Main characteristics of surveyed areas 22  

III. MAIN RESEARCH FINDINGS 25  

3.1. Production situation and life of Raglai people after 20 years of “Doi moi” and moving towards market-oriented economic development 25  

3.1.1. Livelihoods of Raglai people 25  

3.1.2. Poverty and its reasons 28  

3.2. Market development situation in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts through studying value chains 29  

3.2.1. Selection of surveyed products 29  

3.2.2. Analysis of input markets 33  

3.2.3. Analysis of production and consumption 41  

3.2.4. Local socio-economic development directions for period 2011-2015 48  

3.3. Participation of Raglai people in value chains of agricultural products 50  

3.3.1. Horizontal linkage 50
3.3.2. Vertical linkage 51
3.3.3. Potentials for consumption market development 52

3.4. Raglai women’s participation in market development 52
3.4.1. Level of women’s participation in market development 52
3.4.2. Barriers preventing Raglai women’s participation in the market 54
3.4.2. Barriers preventing Raglai women’s participation in the markets 55
3.4.3. Sufficient and necessary conditions for Raglai women’s participation in the market 56

IV. RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS 58

4.1. Summary of big issues related to rural market development for Raglai communities and Raglai women 58
4.2. Recommendations 59
4.2.1. General recommendations 59
4.2.2. Recommendations for local governments 60
4.2.3. Recommendations for Oxfam Great Britain 62
4.3. Conclusions 65

V. ANNEXES 66
ANNEX 1: COW VALUE CHAIN 66
ANNEX 2: BLACK PIG VALUE CHAIN 66
ANNEX 3: MAIZE VALUE CHAIN 66
ANNEX 4: TOOL FOR IDENTIFYING LOCAL MAIN PRODUCTS 67
ANNEX 5: LIST OF INTERVIEWED OFFICERS 69
ANNEX 6: LIST OF INTERVIEWED PRODUCTION HOUSEHOLDS 70
ANNEX 7: LIST OF INTERVIEWED VALUE CHAIN ACTORS 74

LITERATURE Error! Bookmark not defined.

List of Tables
Table 1: Main agricultural products in Bac Ai district, Ninh Thuan province............................... 29
Table 2: Main agricultural products in Thuan Bac district, Ninh Thuan province........................ 30
Table 3: Ownership over cultivated land .............................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4: Level of education of interviewees ....................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 5: Proportion of households with productive loans ................................................................. 36
Table 6: Purposes for raising cow ....................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 7: Purposes for raising pig ................................................................. 45
Table 8: Decision making in cow raising ............................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 9: Decision making in maize production ....................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 10: Decision making in pig raising ............................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 11: Labour division in families by gender ........................ Error! Bookmark not defined.

List of Charts
Chart 1: Bac Ai District: Attractiveness Matrix ................................................... 31
Chart 2: Thuan Bac District: Attractiveness Matrix ................................. 32
Chart 3: Accumulation from family income of Raglai and other ethnic groups ........... 36
Chart 4: Markets for inputs ................................................................................. 38
Chart 5: Relationship between actors in the Maize chain .............. Error! Bookmark not defined.
Chart 6: Participation of women in the Cow chain .............................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
## ACCRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BARD</td>
<td>Bank of Agriculture and Rural Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSDP</td>
<td>Centre for Sustainable Development Policy Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DARD</td>
<td>Department of Agriculture and Rural Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DONRE</td>
<td>Department of Natural Resources and Environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPI</td>
<td>Department of Planning and Investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FA</td>
<td>Farmers’ Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M&amp;E</td>
<td>Monitoring and Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOLISA</td>
<td>Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OGB</td>
<td>Oxfam Great Britain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PC</td>
<td>People’s Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEEST</td>
<td>Policy, Economic, Environmental, Social and Technical (aspects for analysis)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PIM</td>
<td>Participatory Irrigation Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PWEL</td>
<td>Poor Women’s Economic Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SED</td>
<td>Socio-Economic Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPB</td>
<td>Social Policy Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWOT</td>
<td>Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VND</td>
<td>Vietnamese Dong (currency unit)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTO</td>
<td>World Trade Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WEL</td>
<td>Women’s Economic Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WU</td>
<td>Women’s Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YO</td>
<td>Youth Organisation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Research entitled “Gendered Market Selection and Mapping for Economic Leadership Development of Raglai Women in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac District, Ninh Thuan Province” funded by Oxfam Great Britain (OGB) has aimed at providing OGB with necessary information for design of a new project on developing Poor Women’s Economic Leadership (PWEL) and informing its new Programme Implementation Plan in Ninh Thuan province for the period 2011 – 2015. The research team consists of researchers from the Centre for Sustainable Development Policy Studies (CSDP) and its associates.

The research report analyses value chains of three local main agricultural products (local cows, maize and black pigs) based on the information gathered during the field mission and from secondary sources. It has also come up with findings and recommendations for local government in Ninh Thuan province and OGB about their possible development interventions for Raglai community especially Raglai women for the period 2011-2015.

Following are some main findings:

1. **Raglai people are among the poorest in surveyed areas and face great difficulties in their life.** Despite the fact that Raglai people have made strides and received considerable support from government, as well as from local and international organisations, for poverty reduction and economic development, the poverty rate of areas with high concentration of Raglai people is much higher than of provincial average (for instance the poverty rate in Bac Ai district was 54% in 2009, while it was 24% for Thuan Bac district all in comparision with the average rate by 10% of whole Ninh Thuan province). In Bac Ai district there are still 2,257 poor women households and woman-headed households account for 14.3% of total poor households\(^2\). **Sustainable poverty reduction for Raglai people is, and should be considered, as the top priority of local government and communities.** This is a very difficult task that requires times, efforts and concerted contribution of all stakeholders (governments at all levels, local people, local businesses, mass organisations and international organisations).

2. **During the past five years, the central government and local governments in Ninh Thuan province, in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts have invested their efforts and money to improve significantly infrastructure (roads, systems of reservoirs and canals, electricity grids, post and telecommunications, schools, health centres, market places, etc.) in the two districts.** In addition, a number of development policies (Programme 135, Programme 134, Programme 30a…) have been implemented and brought about significant improvements in local extension sysytems (forestry, agriculture and animal husbandry), in credit provision to farmers, in public social services, and in poverty reduction. Several international organisations including OGB have been suppoting poverty reduction interventions for Raglai people. **An emerging issue here is how to make best use of these investments and support to improve the production method of Raglai people to a higher level so that they will be able to overcome poverty, access market opportunities and improve their life in a sustainable way.**

---

\(^2\) Provincial Women’s Union of Ninh Thuan Province: *Report on survey on the situation and needs of poor women in Bac Ai district.* January 2010.
3. Raglai people follow a matrilinean system, in which women have a voice in decision making and are the owners of family assets. This, on the other hand, often makes Raglai men feel being dependent and less motivated to work hard for better living conditions of their family members. However, in modern life, the master role of Raglai women faces a number of constraints. The power of women often stays within their family domain whilst men assume a bigger role in participating social activities and making decision outside the family territory.

4. Raglai people’s main livelihood is agricultural production (plantation of food crops and animal husbandry) with backward techniques and very low productivity. Recently a number of Raglai households signed contract with local government on protecting forest land for fees around 200,000-250,000 VND per hectare per year. Handicraft production is almost non-existent and there are very few Raglai households, who provide services or trading. A vast majority of Raglai people still pursue traditional upland cultivation (planting mixed maize and bean in their upland plots) without putting fertilizer. Main products are maize (hybrid maize and local varieties), rice, bean, casava, cows, pigs and chickens. Besides, poor Raglai people also work as labour to earn about 40,000-75,000 VND per day depending on the nature of work. Women are often hired to do light work not far from their house, whilst men do more physical work for better paid such as land preparation, construction work. Improving the level of production techniques and productivity of agricultural production for Raglai people, and then helping them with better access to the markets should be considered as a key development strategy for local governments and international organisations during the period 2011-2015.

5. Market awareness of Raglai people in general, and of Raglai women in particular, is very limited. It was obviously seen during the field work that a vast majority of Raglai people – interviewees did not know how to calculate costs of their plantation and animal raising. Backward production knowledge and self-reliance is deeply rooted in local minds. Traditional barter practice with its simple measurement units is still popular. Raglai people consider social factors (kinship, friendliness, neighbourhood, long term relationship etc.) as a basis for exchange, not market factors (cost and profit). Raglai people are very simple and faithful. Speculation and bargaining are something strange to them. They do not know how to calculate profit thus tend to be on the loser side when doing business. The most marketable product of Raglai people is hybrid maize, simply because they plant this variety but neither use it nor know the way to store it. They sell maize along with other local products such as cow, pig, fruits, etc... only when their family need cash. Otherwise, bartering is a very common practice.

6. Regarding participation in the value chains, Raglai people tend to participate in phases that produce little profit such as production and selling products to local traders/middlemen. Provision of inputs (goods and services) and purchase of agricultural products is almost entirely under the control of Kinh or Cham traders. Only very few Raglai traders in surveyed areas buy local products, but none of them buy animal. Therefore in order to empower Raglai women to take on the economic leadership role, local government and mass organisations (Women’s Union, Farmers Association) at grassroots level need to encourage and support several Raglai households (or a group of households) in each village to work as traders.
7. Most of Raglai women lack both knowledge of doing economy and experience of social interactions. Women work longer than men 4-5 hours every day, thus have little time for rest not mentioned on attending community events. Women’s work (taking care of crops and animal, harvest, housework, etc.) is often seen as easy and less important compared to men’s work. Given all of the above-mentioned reasons, the chance of access to market and taking on economic leadership role is rather limited for Raglai people in general, and for Raglai women in particular. it should be seen as potential for future undertaking.

8. The market for agricultural products in two surveyed districts are still quite limited but with great potentials for future development. The market in Thuan Bac district seems more developed than the one in Bac Ai district because Raglai people in the former posses better productive knowledge than people in the latter. In spite of the fact that the productive level of Raglai people is very low, their products such as beef, pork, chicken, been, maize (all local varieties) are of high market demand because of its high quality. This is a great potential for market development in Raglai community.

9. Support from local government and mass organisations to local population, though are the most crucial and decisive contributors to the socio-economic development, has so far targeted entire local population but not specifically for Raglai people. There is still lack of supporting policies for local businesses and people to have a better access to market. Development strategies and plans of local governments have so far dealt mainly with economic inputs and outputs without highlighted markets for products. This ofcourse has failed to deal with market-related issues (including lack of supporting policies for producers and businesses). Development of experimental models in Raglai communities has so far focused only on production models, not on business models.

10. Barriers to the development and economic leadership role of Raglai women:

- The existing matrilinean system and its division of labour among Raglai communities to which women are assigned to play a leading role only within their family territory (giving birth, taking care of children and housework, family production, etc) whilst men are to take care of matters outside family territory such as keeping social relations. Thus, Raglai women face limitation in participating social life and in enhancing their capacity as most of their times is reserved for taking care of chores and family matters.

- Limited capacity because of the fact that a majority of Raglai women have very little contact with outside society and their mentality of disliking going far from home. Many Raglai women are illiterate and have limited social experience. These factors prevent them from participating in the market. In addition, training courses have so far been organised at commune PC premises and thus not many women could take part, and consequently only very few of them had opportunity to improve their knowledge and skills.

- Although there have been a number of government programmes and activities targeting poor ethnic minorities, there was no specific programme for Raglai people. WU (and international organisations) seems the only organisation which carries out activities to support Raglai women. On the other hand, local WUs have also been facing difficulties in terms of low capacity of its grassroots cadres and lack of resources, etc., thus their work has brought about only limited results.
Access to commercial credit sources and to land sometimes is limited, particularly for woman-headed households. Interviewed people said that men are registered as heads of households and land certificates are often in the names of husbands, thus women face difficulty when they need to borrow from commercial bank that requires collateral in form of land certificate.

12. Necessary and sufficient conditions for economic leadership of Raglai women:

- **Access to resources** (natural, financial, human and social, etc.): in general Raglai women have little difficulty in accessing natural resources and government credit sources such as the Bank of Social Policies; they, however, face difficulty in terms of human, financial and social resources. These matters require interventions from local government, mass organisations and from Raglai communities.

- **Power to make decisions**: it seems that Raglai women have power to make decisions. However, it is best, and recommended, that men and women reach an agreement before making decisions.

- **Support from local government, mass organisations and NGOs**: is considered a crucial factor for Raglai women to enhance their capacity, and have opportunity to learn useful things so that they can play a leading role. It is very important to strengthen the capacity of local WU, because it is the organisation which works closely with women and protect women’s rights.

- **Improving women’s capacity and participation (in economic and social matters)**: so that Raglai women are capable to make right decisions including participating the markets. It is a difficult task because it will affect the traditional labour division of labour among Raglai communities.

- **Own efforts of Raglai Women**: successful Raglai women who currently assume various governmental positions at provincial, district and commune levels are very good examples that Raglai women can overcome traditional and ethnical barriers to become leaders in economic and social fields.

- **Proactiveness of Raglai men** (husbands) in overcoming the dependant mentality and in making better contributions for their families. Local government and mass organisations (WU, FA, Youth Organisation) need to explain and persuade Raglai men to be more proactive in sharing tasks with their wives, in order to reduce work burden for women. It is necessary to provide gender training for local male official and Raglai men.

**General recommendations:**

- Poverty reduction and socio-economic development for Raglai communities in general, and for Raglai women in particular, requires a lot of time, efforts and contributions of all stakeholders (central government and local governments, mass organisations and businesses, international organisations and local people). In order to help Raglai people access to the markets, the first step to do is to help them overcome poverty, followed by helping them gradually develop a commodity production.

- It is important to define clearly roles and functions of each and every stakeholder:
- Government: a key player in charge of long term and big undertakings such as developing development strategies and plans; issuing policies and mechanisms for good governance; investing in infrastructure; building quality cadres of civil servants including Raglai cadres...

- Mass organisations (WU, FA, Fatherland Front, Youth Organisation, etc.): to implement their mandates such as political education and for its members, community mobilisation, running credit funds, building cultural villages, models for poverty reduction and doing good farming, etc.

- Oxfam Great Britain and other international organisations: to link local communities with government, build capacity for both, and, at the same time implement relevant development interventions to support disadvantaged communities and people (ethnic minorities, poor people, women, etc.). These organisations have strengths in applying participatory and gender sensitive approaches to community development work (community mobilisation and training), introducing and piloting best practices, building some infrastructure (canals, schools...)

- Raglai communities: to make their own efforts in improving their productive knowledge and techniques, addressing (and gradually abandoning) backward customs and dependency mentality, etc. The first thing for them is to learn how to calculate costs of their production, once they have acquired this knowledge and skills it is very likely their production will be more effective and productive, generate more income for a better life This, however, will take times and great efforts and the people to start with are local Raglai officers and youths.

- Local businesses: to be committed to provide a good quality of services and buying local products at reasonable prices. It is important that local government should issue some supporting policies for local businesses (e.g. simple licensing procedures, preferential credit, tax exemption for certain period, etc.)

Recommendations for local government:

- A shift towards the market economy at different pace has been set in policy documents and five year socio-economic development plans (SEDP) for the period 5 năm 2011-2015 of Ninh Thuan province, as well of Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts. It is encouraging that the above mentioned documents have also set a clear goal of enhancing the scale and productivity of agricultural production of common products of Raglai people (maize, rice, water buffaloes, cows, pigs and chicken). What local governments, especially district and commune People’s Committees, need to do now is to prepare its annual SED plans with specific measures and activities, as well as with corresponding resource allocation and implementation responsibility.

- It is necessary to renovate the process and procedures of local SED planning at all levels taking account of market economy principles, identifies most potential value chains of local products for intensification of its specialised production, and links them with broader domestic markets. By doing so, Raglai farmers will have an opportunity to gradually participate in relevant market value chains.
- Current planning of local agricultural products should not be prepared in a general way, rather it should be done specifically on the basis of in-depth and comparative analysis of main products of Ninh Thuan province as well as of two districts.
- There should be a sound inter-sectoral approach to local SED planning that integrates different resources into local SEDPs: investments in infrastructure, completing land planning and land use certification, improving agricultural extension and veterinary services at both district and commune level … with a goal of helping Raglai people develop their production process so that they can earn more for a better life and chances for for market opportunities.
- Concerning the implementation of poverty reduction policies, it is recommended that local governments make a right balance between provision of direct support (giving) and improving access to the markets for poor people (development). In order to do so, local governments in Ninh Thuan need to: i) identify and classify target groups among Raglai communities – who actually need aid, and who need just knowledge and credit for their economic activities; ii) enhance capacity of local cadres (extension worker, veterinarian, WU officers, etc…) who work directly with Raglai communities. Besides common technical knowledge, these officers also need to be equipped with basic knowledge on market economy.
- To issue specific supporting policies for Raglai women, and avoid the gap, in which WU is the only responsible organisation to involve in poverty reduction and development for Raglai women.
- To conduct campaigns and training courses on new productive knowledge and skills for Raglai people with the hope of being able to promote commodity production. Grassroots cadres (commune and village officers) should be trained and act as core groups for these activities. Promote models of “excellent households in doing economy” through forming and running clubs, interest groups in villages and communes. In terms of effectiveness and gender sensitivity, it is important to organise training courses and different activities in villages so that more women can participate. Local language should be used to help people understand better training contents). Local mass organisations and OGB can play an active role in these matters.
- To make best use of favourable conditions including natural resources, newly built reservoires and canal systems to expand scale of farming and breeding for Raglai people (maize, rice, beens, cow, pig, chicken, etc…).
- PWEL: to establish a pilot of women production groups in Raglai communities in which local female officers play a pivotal role. They can start with production of some local products of high market demands (cow, chicken, pig, fruits).
- District and commune WU and FA can pilot some business models (groups or households of Raglai people) that supply inputs for agricultural production (seeds, fertilisers, tools, etc…) and buy products. Provincial and district PCs to issue favourable policies for these special businesses (provision of business training and preferential credit, and applying tax exemption for first 3-5 years, etc…).
Recommendations for Oxfam Great Britain

Broad interventions:

- Oxfam’s mission is to work with others to eradicate poverty and suffering. Thus, OGB needs to define its role and functions towards Raglai communities in Ninh Thuan for the period 2011-2015. The research team is of the opinion that OGB should play a bridging role between Raglai communities and local government in order to ensure that rights and interests of the former are fully realised. OGB needs to provide continuing support to Raglai communities, especially women in implementing poverty reduction and socioeconomic development activities with clearer market orientation. Participation and capacity building for communities and grassroots partners should be the main approaches.

- In order to fulfill the above-mentioned objectives, on the one hand OGB needs to work closely with local government partner at various levels, in particular with PCs, Planning, Agricultural and Industrial sectors to ensure that matters of concern with Raglai people are put into local SEDPs and implemented properly. On the other hand, OGB needs to continue its strong partnership with WU and grassroots governments, and work closely with Raglai communities in implementing development activities, applying participatory and gender sensitive approaches, introducing and fostering new development initiatives for poverty reduction and market access.

- OGB should consider a good coordination with other international organisations working in Ninh Thuan (e.g. IFAD, UNICEF…) in order to ensure a good synergy of development initiatives. One area is to help local governments in Ninh Thuan, particularly in project areas with large Raglai communities, to improve their SED planning towards the market orientation and strong participation of all stakeholders.

- It is advised that OGB evaluates results of its current interventions in Ninh Thuan (projects RVNA60 and RVNA63), draws useful lessons before designing new development interventions for Raglai communities for the period 2011-2015.

- Though OGB’s new strategy of market oriented poverty reduction is in the right track, its realisation is not simple because the level of market development of Raglai people (including of local government officers) in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac district is very low. Therefore, OGB should consider implementing in tandem traditional community development approaches (rural development and Poverty reduction) with a new market-oriented approach (commodity production).

- Key OGB partners for the period 2011-2015 include the current “traditional partners” such as PCs and Agricultural sector (extension, veterinary, water); WU, FA, YO; commune and village officers; interest groups; national consultants. In addition, there should be new partners such as district sections for Finance and Planning, Industry and Trade (play key roles in local SED planning, setting market orientation and providing support to local businesses); local businesses (suppliers of inputs and buyers of local products); other international organisations active in Ninh Thuan province (e.g. UNICEF, IFAD…) with whom OGB can work on advocacy and share experiences, etc…)
- Working approaches: advocacy and campaign, provision of technical support, capacity building for both partners and communities, piloting new development models/initiatives, monitoring and evaluation, networking and information sharing.

- OGB needs to work with local government in building a pool of development workers with good understanding of rural markets. This means that commune and village officers (PC, WU, FA, YO…) will be trained and updated with knowledge and information on community development under the conditions of market economy. For that purpose OGB can use national consultants in fields of development, poverty reduction, gender and market economy…. They will provide consultancy services (research, surveys, M&E and training) for local partners and people.

- OGB needs to work with communes on detailed plans to improve capacity of technical staff (extension staff, veterinarians) as well as of mass organisation officers so that they will be capable of helping Raglai women participate better in socio-economic development processes, contribute more actively to improving their family economy.

- OGB needs to work with relevant local government agencies (PCs, Planning, Industry and Trade, Agriculture) and with mass organisations (WU, FA, YO…) on a roadmap and conditions to help realise PWEL and better participation of Raglai women in developing local value chains.

**Specific Interventions:**

- Conduct participatory poverty assessment (PPA) in combination with rapid market assessment (RMA) exercises of project sites in Ninh Thuan province in order to identify big development problems, potentials, opportunities and threats, as well as reasons and priorities for poverty reduction, rural development and market development. It is advised OGB should implement these activities at the same time with the evaluation of its interventions in Ninh Thuan during the period 2006-2010: this should be conducted end 2010 or the first half of 2011 at the latest.

- Based on the information gathered from the above exercises and on OGB’s Country Strategy for the period 2011-2015, OGB should develop its Strategy for Ninh Thuan for the period 2011-2015 with participation of OGB staff, key partners in Ninh Thuan and national consultants: first half of 2011.

- Some main activities recommended for OGB’s programme in Ninh Thuan during the period 2011-2015:

  1. **Continue poverty reduction interventions for Raglai people** in which local governments and communities play a key role (allocating and stabilising cultivated land, providing preferential credit and production techniques for cultivation of crops and animal, improving infrastructure, capacity building for grassroots cadres, etc…) OGB and mass organisation play a catalist and supplementary role (policy advocacy with provincial and district governments, promoting and applying participatory and gender sensitive approaches, piloting new development initiatives for poverty reduction and accessing markets…) OGB should consider continue activities of RVNA60 and RVNA63, but within a framework of a single project only.
2. *Enhance capacity* on community mobilisation, participation, economic activities for both grassroots partners and communities, however, priority should be given to women officers and Raglai women.

3. *Strengthen partnership and networking*: one of important tasks for OGB is to ensure the realisation of government poverty reduction and development policies in local communities, particularly in Raglai communities. In order to accomplish this task effectively and efficiently, it is advised that OGB works closely with international organisations, mass organisations, experts and local communities. OGB needs to understand well what other international organisations are doing in Ninh Thuan so that they can design supplementary activities and not overlapping with other activities.

4. *Help Raglai people and women have a better access to the markets*: to help them become aware of commodity production, and know calculation of production costs. It should start first with “relevant” Raglai people such as local officers and better off households, as role models. OGB can implement this kind of activity by working closely with local government and mass organisations (WU, FA, YO...), hiring national consultants to work on value chains of local agricultural products, piloting new development initiatives (promoting models of farming economy and interest grups).

Raglai people need only improve production of their traditional products with good market potentials such as water buffaloes, cows, black pigs, chicken, beans, fruits, maize, etc..., and OGB can help them in applying new production techniques to increase productivity and outputs.

5. In order to pilot *WEL for Raglai women* OGB should consider designing a new project with WU in two districts with an objective of building some pilots in villages where Raglai people and Raglai women can run same business activities currently managed by Kinh and Cham people (supplying input materials and services for planting rice and maize, raising cows, black pigs and chicken). After 2-3 years, this project should be evaluated and its possibility of replication be assessed. Potential targeted groups are current female officers, retired Raglai officers and young people with good technical and productive knowledge. WU and local government can play an important supporting role: provision of technical knowledge and skills, preferential credit...

6. *Gender issue*: OGB works with WU and domestic consultants on raising gender awareness for not only Raglai women, but more importantly, for local male officers and Raglai men. In addition, encouragement and mobilisation of Raglai women’s participation in communities events is another area of priorised work.

7. *Community development*: OGB needs to focus on promoting good traditional values of Raglai people, and gradually abolishing backward customs.

8. *Other OGB traditional activities*: emergency preparedness and aid, small-scale infrastructure projects, etc...

9. *For specific recommendations on three value chains: see Annexes 1, 2 and 3*
Approach to poverty reduction for ethnic minority people, which is based on market-oriented production development and promoting WEL, is a suitable approach. If it is applied successfully it will not only help local government officers and people overcoming the mentality of dependence and relying on outside support, but more importantly, it will also help mobilising local internal resources for economic development, improvements in living conditions and integration with mainstream development.

However, application of this approach with Ragali people in the two districts of Thuan Bac and Bac Ai, Ninh Thuan province is not simple, rather it requires times and concerted efforts of all stakeholders including local government, mass organisations, businesses and people. International organisations including Oxfam Great Britain certainly have a vital role to play in this undertaking.

At present, the markets for traditional agricultural products of Raglai people in Thuan Bac and Bac Ai districts are still very small, but it has a great development potential as shown by results of this research. Raglai women, though face many difficulties in assuming their economic leading role, will be capable to do so with support from the above mentioned actors along with their own efforts.
I. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Research objective

**Overall objective:** To identify opportunities in agricultural product markets in Ninh Thuan province to develop community enterprises that are viable where women can participate and benefit from.

**Specific objectives:**
- To identify possible sub-sectors/agricultural products through process of gendered market selection (suitable for Raglai women).
- To analyse potential for business and for women’s economic leadership through process of gendered market mapping, including participatory value chain analysis.
- To identify barriers preventing women from accessing and controlling economic resources within value chain and strategic to overcome such barriers.
- To identify critical resources for women, especially those who are at household level.
- To provide recommendations regarding project future operation focusing on PWEL (intervention components, key activities under each component, working approach and potential partners)

1.2. Research contents

1.2.1. **Analysis and general evaluation of socio-economic situation in surveyed areas**
- Clarifying the social-economic development directions of surveyed areas, focusing on the directions related to key target groups of this research who are Raglai people and Raglai women in the two districts of Bac Ai and Thuan Bac in Ninh Thuan province.
- Analysing strengths and constraints in terms of resources, mechanisms and policies relating to the above directions (analysis of resources).
- Analysing current policies, mechanisms and public investments; mechanisms and policies relating to women’s participation in livelihood development.

1.2.2 **Analysis of current agricultural product value chains with market development potential**
- Identifying localities with agricultural products which have potential of market development in the 2 districts of Bac Ai and Thuan Bac; assessing the potential for development of some existing value chains of agricultural products in these two districts.
- Analysing selected value chains: actors and their linkages in these chains; assessment of actors’ participation: advantages and disadvantages of every actor; role and development level of small and medium enterprises in the chain, level of services.
- Potentials of market development of the value chains: analysis of market demands, impact of public investments, other social and economic impacts...
- Gender issues in the development of value chain: level of women’s participation, especially Raglai women’s in value chain; supportive policies and mechanism facilitating
Raglai women’s participation in and benefit from the chain; barriers preventing women from participating in the chain.

1.2.3 **Necessary and sufficient conditions for WEL of Raglai women in value chains of agricultural products in Ninh Thuan province**

- Resources for development (Raglai cultural values and traditions, technical capacity and skills of Raglai women, etc…)
- Institutions: government development policies, mechanism and programmes; support from non-governmental organisations.
- Supporting services for development of value chains of local agricultural products.
- Potentials of market development for the above value chains.

1.2.4 **Recommendations:**

- General recommendations
- Recommendations for local authorities (institutions, policies, activities, targets, etc…)
- Recommendations for OGB (interventions, targets, partners, timeframe, methodology).

1.3 **Research approach and methodology**

1.3.1 **Research approach**

*Livelihood analysis*

Analysis of resources and the environment in which livelihoods of Raglai households in two district of Bac Ai and Thuan Bac take place in order to clarify advantages and constraints to its development, barriers to WEL. The analysis of livelihoods and value chains was to show the opportunities and potentials for business development of Raglai people, especially Raglai women. Analysis of actors participating in the input markets in order to find out the inner reasons that hamper the development of value chains of current agricultural production.

*Value chain analysis:*

Analysis of value chains in two surveyed districts was conducted to clarify the economic relationships between main local products. The value chain analysis has aimed at:

- Linking various business activities (product design, inputs, production, outputs, etc…) in order to provide customers with good quality of products or services.
- Clarifying positive and negative actors in a value chain from which indentify measures promoting the chain development.
- Analysing the participation level of poor Raglai people and women in various steps of, and their benefits from, value chains. From the analysis one can see the reasons limiting their participation in development of these chains.

The combination of livelihood analysis and value chain analysis helped clarify policies and mechanisms for improving the business environment and for development of businesses participating in value chains in rural areas.
1.3.2 Research methodology

Qualitative methods:
- In-depth interviews with local government officers and experts at all three levels in order to collect information of i) socio-economic, market, environment, policy mechanisms affecting the development of market and businesses in the agricultural sector; and ii) supporting policies mechanism towards ethnic minority and business women in selected areas.
  - Provincial level: Department of Planning and Investment, Department of Industry and Trade, Department of Agriculture and Rural Development, Women’s Union, Farmers’ Association, Co-operative Alliance and Department of Resources and Environment.
  - District level: PC’s, Sections for Finance and Planning, Agricultural and Rural Development, Industry and Trade, Women’s Union and Farmers’ Association.
  - Commune level: leaders of Party’s Organisation, People’s Committee and People’s Council, sectoral cadres, Women’s Union, Fatherland Front, Farmers’ Association and Youth Union.

Group discussions of commune officers and households in village: aiming at collecting information to build linkages of actors in the value chain and developing value chains of main agricultural products in the selected communes. From this, it is possible to find out advantages and disadvantages of the production process of main products and at the same time, understand solutions to help households overcome these difficulties.

SWOT and PEEST tools were used to analyse effect of policies and barriers to the development of value chain.

Quantitative methods:
- A purposely categorised sample selection method was employed to select households participating in various actors in a value chain. In theory, based on a list of categorised households (as producers, suppliers of input materials, buyers/collectors of outputs, etc…) in each surveyed commune, the research team would select households in each category randomly and interview them using structured questionnaires. However, in reality in the two surveyed districts the research team managed interview only producer households, retailers and small collectors. As for collectors, slaughter houses, the interviews (20 in total – see Annex 7) were conducted outside the surveyed areas (e.g. in Tan Son township, Ninh son district and in Phan Rang-Thap Cham City). Concerning household interviews, a total of 74 household heads were interviewed, of which 36 were men (48.6%) and 38 women (51.4%); by economic ranking 31.8% of interviewed households were poor, 5.41% near poor, 56.76% middle and 6.76% were better-off (see Annex 6).

Analysis of selected value chains: the research team worked with a group of district and commune leaders in Thuan Bac and Bac Ai districts, using “classification of market
potential products” tool, to identify main agricultural products before the survey conducted in the field. In listing all existing agricultural products, criterias such as “market opportunities” and “Women’s participation and their benefits in value chain” were prioritised (See Annex 4). As a result three key products were thoroughly discussed and selected by participants for value chain analysis.

1.3.3. Selection of surveyed areas

- Criterias for selection:
  o Area where the majority of population are Raglai people
  o Area where a relatively developed value chain of an agricultural product exists.
  o Area where a value chain of a agricultural product has a potential to develop
  o 2 villages in each commune: One poor village and one better-off village.

- For Thuan Bac district, Loi Hai commune and its two villages of Suoi Da and Kien Kien 2 were selected to survey Black Pig value chain.
- For Bac Ai district, Phuoc Thang commune and its two villages of Ma Ty and Cha Dung were selected to survey Cow value chain; Phuoc Tan commune and its two villages of Da Trang and Ma Ty were selected study for Maize value chain.

1.4. Research constraints

- Lack of information: by the time the report has been written the Comprehensive Master Plan of socio-economic development for period 2011-2020 of Ninh Thuan province, and SED Five Year plans of Ninh Thuan province and Bac Ai district haven’t been provided. In addition, information at village level is still missing from 2009 Statistical Yearbook of Bac Ai district. Therefore the information about SED orientations for the period 2011-2015 of Ninh Thuan province came from the 5 Year Plan 2011-2015 of the Department of Agriculture and Rural Development, and documents collected in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts.

- Time constraints: the time allocated for field mission from 13th to 20th September was too short for surveying a large area (2 districts and 3 communes) and for interviewing a large number of people (officers at all three levels, village heads and villagers). In addition, the research plan in the field had to change due to busy plans of local partners.

- Group discussion and households interviews took place mainly in commune and village office premises, not at households, because of long survey questionnaires, language barrier and large number of interviewed households. It was a real issue that the research team did not have a chance to visit villagers’ houses.

- Conducting surveys of value chains of three different products in three different communes in such a short period of time was not sufficient to collect all required information. The selection of black pigs in Loi Ha commune of Thuan Bac district for value chain analysis was made at the recommendations of district partners. At the end of field trip, the results revealed that black pig was only a potential product whilst other more developed products were bean, maize and cow.
II. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

2.1. The concept of women’s economic leadership

Women’s Economic Leadership (WEL) is a development approach which facilitates women to gain socio-economic power in poverty reduction. Women’s participation and socio-economic ownership framework involves the following four interactive aspects:

- Women are those who make a final decision
- Women are those who control resources
- Women are those who earn the living
- Women are those who have an equal relation

In order to ensure women’s participation to design and implementation of projects/programmes/activities in which women takes an active role in decision making processes effecting their lives, including livelihoods, decision, Oxfam has suggested the following:

- **Women’s better and visible role in economic development:** This is considered as the primary and important step in order to open more opportunities for women to participate in the decision making process and to undertake key positions in economy.

- **Change of attitude on leadership and women’s participation:** The traditional belief refers to the importance of men than women should be changed. Women can also do and hold the same positions as men do.

- **Addressing obstacles relating to women’s limited time and mobility:** women often lack time because they have to do lots of chores, particularly houseworks, without being paid. Men tend to think that these types of work are easy and only for women, and therefore they don’t appreciate efforts made by women in doing houseworks. Limited mobility also prevents women from participation in socio-economic activities and from undertaking positions of leaders. This traditional culture should be adjusted too.

- **Encouragement and support provided for women so that they can take on leader position:** by providing them with capacity building on leadership skill, management skill and knowledge of political structure etc.

2.2. Change of supporting poverty reduction direction from subsidising/giving aid to facilitating a better access to market opportunities

Over the past 20 years since the Doi Moi (renovation policy) with a shift towards a market-oriented economy, the Vietnamese government has issued and implemented a number of development policies/programmes aiming at poverty reduction and social security. The government has prioritised its support towards remote and isolated areas especially areas where ethnic minorities live. The budget allocated to these programmes were big up to thousands of billions VND coming from different sources, mainly from government budget, from international official aid assistance (ODA), from local enterprises and communities. It is worth mentioning the

---

3 Gendered Market Selection and Mapping for Women’s Economic Leadership. Oxfam GB
total budget of the two biggest programmes (Programme on Poverty Reduction and Programme 135 phase II) for the period 2006-2010 is over 55 trillions VND and it helps cover most of poor people including ethnic minorities throughout the country.

The above programmes have brought about both positive and negative impacts. It has helped reducing poverty significantly in many areas, but at the same time, it also created a strong dependence mentality among some groups of poor people and even among some local government officers on external support. In addition, gender issue has not yet been addressed properly in these programmes.

In most recent years, after the country’s accession to the World Trade Organisation (WTO) Vietnam has been shifting strongly towards a market-oriented economy with state. International organisations in Vietnam have also changed their approach, from provision of direct support to facilitating farmers with better access to market opportunities, in particular helping farmers move towards commodity production, improve productivity... thus to enhance and stabilise their incomes. The government’s Poverty Reduction Strategy for the period 2011-2020 also pursues a similar approach of helping the farmers enhance their capacity to better access market opportunities, through which to enhance the proactiveness and initiatives of local communities and people, and to mobilise local resources for poverty reduction and development.

Local governments in Ninh Thuan province have also selected market-oriented development as their key development direction for the period 2011-2015.

2.3. Main characteristics of surveyed areas

Ninh Thuan is a coastal poor province located in the harshest climate zone of south-central Vietnam. According to the general census in April 2009, the total provincial population is 565,700 people from 28 different ethnic groups, of which the Kinh account for 78.5%, the Cham 11.3% and Raglai people make up 9.4%. Its official poverty rate in 2009 was 10%.

As for economy, Ninh Thuan is an agricultural province with the contribution of major sectors to provincial GDP as follows: Agriculture, Forestry and Aquaculture account for 45.6%; Industry and Constraction 19.9%; and Services 34.5%. Of the crop plantation, food crop production makes up 51.8%; and cash crops and fruits account for 49.2%. The main agricultural products: food crops (260,359 tons, of which rice 208,225 tons); grape (23,933 tons); sugar can (66,560 tons); tobacco (1,406 tons); casava (56,495 tons) and cashew (1,465 tons). Concerning animal husbandry there is 118,160 cows; 143,910 goats and sheeps; 68,890 pigs and 1,217,230 fowls. The number of animal herds has remained stable but number of pigs increased by 17% compared to 2008 figure, and number of fowls also increased significantly due to market demands5.

Thuan Bac District is situated 10 km north to Phan Rang-Thap Cham City. It has a total land area of 31,924 ha, and population of 37,850 people (50.2% men and 49.8% women), 90% of them are farmers. It is a district with large proportion of Raglai people. There are two communes of Phuoc Khang and Phuoc Chien where almost 100% of population are Raglai people. Other communes with Raglai people as majority population are Cong Hai, Loi Hai and Bac Son. The

---

poverty rate in 2009 was 24.56% and two communes with largest Raglai population are also poorest (42.95% in Phuoc Khang and 37.71% in Phuoc Chien)\textsuperscript{6}.

**Bac Ai** is the northernmost and poorest district of Ninh Thuan province. It is a large district and the home land of largest Raglai communities. The total population is 24,350 people (50.15% men and 49.85% women), 94% of them are Raglai people. The poverty rate in 2009 was staggering 54% and since this year Bac Ai has been in the list of the 62 poorest districts of Vietnam and entitled to receive special support under the government Resolution No.30a.

The main target group of this research is Raglai women. Raglai is one of five ethnic groups of Malayo-Polynesian language system (together with the Cham, Churu, Ede and Giarai), but do not have their own letters\textsuperscript{7}. Raglai people follow the matrilineal system in which the custom of one man and one wife marriage is widely practised. In Raglai culture women marry husband, and after marriage man moves to wife’s house to live. The family name and inheritance are among the female line. Children bear mother’s family name. The youngest daughters are the obvious inheritesses (as they are expected to be responsible to take care of their parents at old age). Thus, Raglai women have an important voice in family decision making including decisions on economic matters. Decisions on family’s daily matters are subject for discussion of both husband and wife, but the person with more contribution to family will have the final word.

The traditional economy of Raglai people in Ninh Thuan province is subsistent agricultural production. Farming in the uplands and animal husbandry are their main livelihoods but the level of production is very backward – “slash and burn” and “dig holes and put seeds” practices, which leave the crops and animal for mercy of the nature, usually result in very low productivity and yields.

**Some Oxfam’s activities in Ninh Thuan province:**

Currently, OGB implements two projects in Ninh Thuan province, mainly in Bac Ai district:

1. **Project “Community Forestry Management for poverty reduction”** (CFM or RVNA60) has been implemented in two provinces of Lao Cai and Ninh Thuan (particularly in Bac Ai district) with DONRE, commune PCs and Community Forestry management groups as main partners. The project life time is 2008 - 2010 and its total budget is 433,082 GBP (around 690,000 USD). The project goal is to empower poor ethnic communities in Lao Cai and Ninh Thuan provinces to gain secured access to forest and forestland for sustainable livelihood development and poverty reduction. In order to achieve that goal, the project sets four expected results as follows: **Result 1:** Access and control over forest resources of poor ethnic men and women has improved; **Result 2:** Local ethnic minority farmers’ technical and institutional capacities in forestry production and management have improved; **Result 3:** Local forestry production services are more responsive to the similar and different needs of ethnic men and women; **Result 4:** Local

\textsuperscript{6} Statistical Year Book 2009 of Thuan Bac District.

\textsuperscript{7} In literature, Raglai people are called differently as Ra-glai, Ra-dlai, Ra-glay, Raklai, etc... The word Raglai means mountanous people. Most Raglai people occupy the eastern sides of the Truong Son mountains and are scattered across territories of Khanh Hoa, Ninh Thuan, Binh Thuan and Lam Dong provinces. Ninh Thuan province has the largest proportion of Raglai people (47,600 people or over 50% of the total number of Raglai population) mainly in Ninh Hai, Ninh Son, Thuan Bac and Bac Ai districts.
forestry development strategies focus on poverty reduction and social (ethnicity and gender) equity.

Project’s activities include capacity building activities for communities and local government in participatory land and forest land use planning and land allocation; provision of technical and institutional support to poor men and women to better manage and benefit from the natural resources on which they depend; provision of experiences in community based and pro-poor forest management for provincial and national levels. One of main activities is to establish so-called Village Forest Management Groups to work with local authorities and technical staff using the process of Participatory Land Use Planning/Land Allocation.

2. Project “Empowerment of Raglai communities through livelihoods and market interventions” aims at improving food and income security for poor Raglai men and women living in Bac Ai district. The project contributes directly to achieving OGB’s Vietnam programme long-term impact of “20,000 poor men, women and children in Lao Cai, Ninh Thuan, Tra Vinh and another provinces in Central Highlands and North-West regions achieve food and income security by ensuring rights to access land, forests, production services, markets and decision making.” The total budget of the project is 210,034 GBP (around 330,000 USD) for the 2007-2011 period. Together, the two projects will facilitate the access to and control over the most important livelihoods resources of poor Raglai people, namely water, land, forests and production services.

Project RVNA33 has eight components: 1. Building models of participatory irrigation management at commune and village levels (PIM); 2. Land planning and land allocation; 3. Community agreement on extension needs; 4. Training for poor households in knowledge of family economic management; 5. Training in market skills; 6. Update of market information; 7. Gender trainings and campaigns; 8. Capacity building and integrating mitigation of natural disasters. There are number of partners from provincial partners (Extension Centre, Irrigation Centre) to district and commune PMUs, WU at thee levels.

Main project activities include: establishment of, and support to commune water users’ associations; training on PIM skills; support in issuing land use certificates in Phuoc Tan and Phuoc Tien communes; Pilot models of hybrid maize and wet rice; Establishing fund of 200 million VND to support 100 poorest woman-headed households to reclaim cultivated land; Provision of F2 breeding cow and training on its use for improving local cow herd; exposure trips; Training for credit users on production planning and dealing with bank procedures for lending; Reassessment of district cow revolving fund (project A33) in Phuoc Tan and Phuoc Tien communes; Establishment and support to 7 women groups to work on issues such as food hygieny and safety, infectious diseases, personal hygieny, women’s reproductive health; Education contests on gender equality and anti-family violence; Training on skills for natural disaster mitigation for Red Cross officers, youth task force members and people.

---

8 Oxfam GB: RVNA60 Project Document
9 Oxfam GB: RVNA63 Project Document and RVNA63 Project Management Unit of Bac Ai District: Report on activities in financial year 2009-2010
III. MAIN RESEARCH FINDINGS

3.1. Production situation and life of Raglai people after 20 years of “Doi moi” and moving towards market-oriented economic development

3.1.1. Livelihoods of Raglai people

Main traditional livelihoods of Raglai people include reclamation of forest land for upland cultivation and animal husbandry. Raglai people often cultivate on the two kinds of upland as follows:

- Land filled with alluvia along rivers banks or streams, which tend to be flooded/submerged during the rainy season (September-October). People usually grow maize or pumpkin to harvest before the land is submerged by water.
- Highly located upland or plots which are not threatened by flood in rainy season. These are the main cultivated land of Raglai people. They usually grow maize, rice, beans and root plants.

When the upland soil is worn out (after 3-4 years of consecutive cultivation) Raglai people fallow their land, wait until forest regrown and soil’s fertility recovered, and reuse their land again. During this period, the upland still belongs to those who first reclaimed it. Together with government’s resettlement policies, Raglai people have learnt water rice growing, cashew-nut and recently sugarcane and tobacco growing. However, the level of their knowledge and production skills is rather backward, relying almost entirely on natural conditions and with no investment, all that results in very low yields.

Through interview and discussion with district/commune officers and farmers in 3 surveyed communes as well as through the study of different reports from local authorities, it is found out that the current main livelihoods of Raglai people are crop production, animal husbandry and working as labourers. Besides, forest exploitation (hunting, timber cutting and exploitation of forest products) which used to be the main form of livelihood of Raglai people is no longer important activity. Instead of that forest exploitation provides an important income for newly separated young households who do not have any plot to cultivate. Most recently, a number of Raglai households have signed contracts on forest protection with local government and state farms that pay them fees around 200-250,000 VND per ha per year.

As for production skills, there is no big difference compared to their traditional past. Most Raglai people, especially poor households, still pursue subsistent agricultural production with backward techniques and tools - they grow rice, maize, etc. without any serious investments, they even do not know how to calculate costs of their production. All these result in very low productivity. For

---

10 An opinion of a farmer in Kien Kien 2 village (Loi Hai commune)
11 Interviews of officers in Bac Ai district.
example: the yield of upland rice in Phuoc Tien commune is just 800kg per ha, and a mere 400kg per ha in Phuoc Tan commune (Bac Ai district¹²).

*The only observed difference is the wider variety of food crops and animal.* Nowadays, Raglai people grow more wet rice and it gradually becomes a main food crop. Other new crops are hybrid maize, cashew, sugarcan, tobacco, cotton, etc... New types of animal are goat, sheep and fish... They contribute to improving life of Raglai people.

*Particularly worth mentioning here are new infrastructure constructions (reservoirs and irrigation systems, roads, electrical net, etc) built by government investments, together with the establishment of extension and veterinary systems, etc... all have contributed greatly to positive changes in the life of Raglai people. They can expand the area of wet rice cultivation, grow animal even during the dry season, buying and selling more products and goods.*

*Main food crops are rice and maize* (hybrid and local variety) in this area. The price of local maize varieties is 8,000 VND per kg, which is two times higher than the price of hybridize maize. Local maize is sold more easily than hybrid maize but the former’s yield is much lower – just one third of the latter’s yield¹³. In addition, people plant hundreds of hecta of casava in each district. For Raglai communities in Bac Ai district rice accounts for 70% and local maize accounts for 30% of daily consumption food¹⁴.

*Vegetable and beans, though planted in upland plots as secondary crops, are favourable crops of Raglai women (require low investments, less labour) and bring about good economic value for Raglai households. Year 2010 is the successful year for Raglai people who planted green bean and sold at 25,000 VND per kg. Ms. Pinang Thi Nguyen in Phuoc Tan commune (Bac Ai district) shared her family earned 7 million VND from selling bean. Similar information also came from interviewees in Thuan Bac district.*

Cashew is another cash crop grown in large areas (Bac Ai district has 863 ha and Thuan Bac district has 1,460 ha of cashew) as results of implementation of governmental reforestation programmes. However, cashew trees produce very low yield and people are cutting down old trees that do not bear fruit¹⁵. Some new types of crops that have been introduced recently by local government are sugarcane and tobacco. However, there is no output market for sugarcane and its price is pretty low, and tobacco planting is still in the experimental phase¹⁶. Some local fruit trees such as jackfruit, banana, pineapple, etc... are grown in large number in gardens, forest land, land strips along the streams because these trees are considered as having great potential of bringing about income for Raglai people.

*Division of work: in farming work, men are often in charge of soil making given their natural physique and tradition as well. Tasks related to rice planting and maize growing are shared between men and women. Other tasks are carried out by women. As for woman-headed households the women have to hire labour for soil making or asking for help from their relatives (in form of labour exchange), even in some cases they have to do it themselves. Labour cost for*

---

¹² Oxfam GB: Report on gender issues in Bac Ai District. 2004
¹³ Interview of officers of Thuan Bac District Section of Agriculture and Rural Development
¹⁴ Leaders of Bac Ai District PC
¹⁵ Interviews of district officers of Thuan Bac and Bac Ai districts, and Statistical Year Book 2009 of Ninh Thuan province
¹⁶ The same sources as above
ploughing is about 70,000-80,000 VND per sao\(^{17}\) (Note: one sao here equals to 1,000 square metres).

**Animal husbandry:** along with farming, animal husbandry is also a very important livelihood for Raglai community. Cow, pig, sheep, buffaloes, chicken, etc... are the most common types of animal. The number of buffalo herds in the two districts account for 50%, and the number of cow herds accounts for only 25% of the whole province while number of sheeps and goats are very small. It was shared during the interviews that local buffaloes, cows and chicken are of high market demands because of the good quality of their meat.

*Raglai people follow traditional techniques for raining animal.* Each household keeps about 5-10 chicken and few pigs and cows. Tieing cow to a tree or a pillar is a popular way of grazing in this area, pigs and chicken are raised in open space without being taken care off. This often results in their death, especially during the dry season (because of lack of water and food). 100% of households do not know using processed foods in animal husbandry, neither reserving grass for livestocks during the dry season (that lasts for 7-8 months every year).

**New forms of animal husbandry such as animal farm model are not yet popular because it requires more investments and advanced techniques.** All existing farms are owned by local officers and Kinh people. For example: there is a big farm with around 5,000 chiken in Cong Hai commune. Interviewed officers in Thuan Bac said that they liked this model but were unable to do it because of lack of supporting policy and capital.

*Raglai people are not familiar with application of advanced techniques in raising animal in order to make this industry a commodity production.* Most of raised animals are local breedings whilst cross-breedings account for a very smal percentage of local herds. Raglai people prefer local breedings to cross-breedings because of the former are easier to raise and their meat is of good quality. Raising cross-bred animals require more investments and advanced techniques. The in-and-in phenomenon has been found quite common and often resulted in the high death rate of livestocks. What worrying is the finding that many Raglai people are still not aware of this threat.

Amongst common diseases of cows and pigs are liver worms, blood infection, and cholera. However, veterinary services in surveyed villages do not meet the needs of local people. Some commune veterinarians have limited capacity and lack commitment to help local communities. This situation requires local government to work on and improve the quality of commune veterinary systems.

Raglai people often pay higher prices for purchasing cows and pigs from other households in their community (than buying from outside sellers) because they tend to trust themselves more than the ousiders. Many Raglai people are illiterate and have very little contact with outsiders. In addition verbal contracting is the most common form of contract as Raglai people are not familiar with written contracts\(^{18}\).

**Looking after cows for better-off families for the fees of 30,000 VND per month and/or for shared profit becomes popular nowadays.** In the second case the cow owners do not pay fees for labourers but share the profit earned from selling newly born calves. Especially, there has been

---

\(^{17}\) Interviews of WU officers in Phuoc Tan commune.  
\(^{18}\) Interview of a collector in An Dat village, Loi Hai commune
a “Revolving Cow Fund” in Bac Ai district since 1992, which is a sort of poverty reduction activity. Within the framework of this fund each poor household is provided a mother cow as loan for about two years, during which it is expected the mother cow will give birth to one or two calves. The borrowers are allowed to keep the calves and give the mother cows to other households. This fund is reported very successful: currently there are 800 cows being raised in 456 households under this programme.

Work as labour: some groups of Raglai people especially young people earn their income by working as labour (cutting down sugar-cane trees, weeding, ploughing the field, making soil, etc...). Currently, the average fee for such types of work is from 40,000-60,000VND per head per day. If they are hired to work in construction sites each labourer can earn up to 75,000VND per day. According to the survey’s result in Phuoc Tan commune, 30% of households have hired labour, all of them live in the commune. Men and women are equally paid for the same work. However, a gender research funded by OGB in 2004 found out that Raglai women were reluctant to work as labour because they felt shy when being hired to work for Kinh people in the same village. This is one of the factors hindering Raglai women to participate in labour maket.

Other livelihoods:
- Leasing land to Kinh people who plant water melon (interviewees in Phuoc Tan commune)
- Leasing land plot to other Raglai households during the dry season under a condition that the land is ploughed before returned back to its owner (information from Phuoc Tan commune).

Handicraft: there is no traditional craft village in the two districts. Bac Ai district government is planning to set up 2 craft villages – one on bamboo weaving in Phuoc Thang commune, and one wine making in Phuoc Trung commune respectively. Thuan Bac district has plan to develop 2 craft villages namely Tap La and Dong Thong in Phuoc Chien commune specialised in bamboo weaving.

3.1.2. Poverty and its reasons

Through group discussions amongst villagers as well as officers, following are the symptoms of poverty of Raglai people:
- Low income
- Lack of food (for many months each year)
- Bad health
- No valuable assets
- Little land or land of bad quality, or even having no land.

Reasons of poverty: i) lack of water especially during dry season results to the ineffective use of land and less crops; (ii) lack of cultivation land especially for newly seperated households who do not have land for wet rice. While forest land has not been programmed for use and most of local women headed households haven’t been paid for forest protection due to lack of labour. According to regulations of forest protection work, that household must have enough labour; (iii)

lack of production experiences: Most of Raglai households still apply the old traditional production method of extensive farming without applying advanced technics though they were provided with trainings on agricultural extension; iv) limited market oriented thoughts: Raglai households mainly grow food plants and raise livestock for their families’ needs but not for the commodity purpose, producing low productivity; v) underdeveloped market: local people often purchase/sell at forced price; vi) networks of agricultural extension and veterinary at grassroots level are very weak which result in the loss of farming and livestock; vii) practising some old & backward customs costs lots of money. According to local officers, one particular reason of poverty in Raglai community is the matrilineal system which hinders men from feeling confident and motivated in doing business. Hence, improvement of men’s role is a great challenge for the development of Raglai community.

3.2. Market development situation in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts through studying value chains

In order to understand better about the level of market development in the two surveyed districts, the research team conducted participatory discussions with local officers at district and commune levels in each district. The discussions aimed at finding out main agricultural products and its locations. Based on the gendered favourable criteria, the team analysed value chains of three local key products namely cow, maize and black pig. Below are main findings from the analyses.

**Note:** The three value chains analysed in this report are just a demonstration of how to conduct a survey of market products. Given the time constraints and the large number of agricultural products in two districts, the research team recommends that OGB conduct more surveys on other main agricultural products such as bean, rice, chicken, cashew etc.

3.2.1. Selection of surveyed products

The survey on agricultural products that are suitable for Raglai women and have market potential in the two selected districts, Bac Ai and Thuan Bac, has revealed that the two districts have a similar number of products (9) but differ from production scale, capacity and productivity. The table below describes in details:

**Table 1: Main agricultural products in Bac Ai district, Ninh Thuan province**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Product</th>
<th>Main cultivated areas</th>
<th>Total volume of product</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Rice</td>
<td>3 crops per year</td>
<td>5,251 tons</td>
<td>Average yield 27.2 quintal/ha; areas for cultivation can be expanded thanks to newly built reservoirs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#</td>
<td>Product</td>
<td>Main cultivated areas</td>
<td>Total volume of product</td>
<td>Remarks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Rice</td>
<td>Bac Phong (560ha), Bac Son (468ha), Cong Hai (321ha), Loi Hai (649ha)</td>
<td>24,088 tons</td>
<td>Average productivity 52.2 quintal/ha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Maize</td>
<td>Phuoc Chien, Cong Hai, Loi Hai, Phuoc Khang</td>
<td>5,624 tons</td>
<td>Average yields 19.6 quintal/ha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Bean</td>
<td>All 6 communes</td>
<td>4,854 tons</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Sources: Statistical Year Books 2009 of Ninh Thuan province and Bac Ai district and data collected during the field mission)
| 4 | **Sugar cane** | Phuoc Chien (40ha), Cong Hai (13.4ha), Phuoc Khang (16.5ha) | 2,985 tons |
| 5 | **Cashew** | Phuoc Chien (250ha), Phuoc Khang (340ha), Cong Hai (383ha), Loi Hai (417ha) | 393 tons |
| 6 | **Fruit trees** | All communes | 5,739 tons | Increasing cultivated areas |
| 7 | **Cow** | All 6 communes. Pargest heards are in Loi Hai (4,675), Bac Phong (3,356) | 16,060 heads | Tends to increase during the last 2-3 years but the volume of beef remains unchanged |
| 8 | **Pig** | Phuoc Chien, Cong Hai, Loi Hai, Bac Phong | 7,023 heads | The volume of pork increased fast in most recent years |
| 9 | **Goat** | All communes but Bac Phong | 7,902 heads | Tend to reduce in quantity Cong Hai has the largest herds of 2,110. |
| 10 | **Sheep** | Công Hải, Bắc Sơn, Bắc Phong, Loi Hai | 3,458 heads | decreased in quantity but increased volume of meat |

*(Sources: Statistical Year Books 2009 of Ninh Thuan province and Thuan Bac district and data collected during the field mission)*

Analysing the above products against the two dimensions: market demands and women’s participation, the research team constructed two attractiveness matrices of Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts (see chart 1 and chart 2 below).

**Chart 1: Attractiveness Matrix of Bac Ai District**
Chart 2: Attractiveness Matrix of Thuan Bac District

One can see from the charts the products that meet two criteria of having market potential, and being suitable for women in Bac Ai district are cow, maize, chicken and bean. In addition, rice, cashew, black pig, fruit trees need to be considered as well. As for Thuan Bac district, the potential products are bean, maize and black pig. Other products need to be considered are cow, goat, sheep and fruit trees.

**Identification of some key products for value chain analysis:** First, group discussions with district officers and commune leaders in charge of economic issues focused on identifying all agricultural products in two surveyed districts. The next step was introduction of a market assessment tool called “Table for identifying main marketable products” which has six key criteria (including two closely relating to women) and 12 sub-criteria (see Annex 4) to participants (local officers). The officers then discussed and ranked the products accordingly to a set of criteria and sub-criteria. As a result three products that had highest scores in terms of market potential and suitability for Raglai women in each district have been selected as follows:

- For Bac Ai district: cow, maize and chicken.
- For Thuan Bac district: bean, maize and black pig.

Based on the selection criteria and agreement with leaders in Bac Ai district, Phuoc Thang commune was chosen for surveying Cow value chain, Phuoc Tan commune selected for surveying Maize value chain. As for Thuan Bac district, due to the change in agenda and unavailability of local officers, only an hour meeting with them was held on 13th September and after that the research team was asked to make a survey of black pig value chain in Loi Hai commune (where 70% of commune population are Raglai people).
3.2.2. Analysis of input markets

i) Development resources as inputs of the production process

In market economy, production resources become commodities and can be traded in the markets. Thus there are labour markets, land markets (cultivated land, grazing land), capital markets, etc... Therefore prior to assessing the development level of local input markets the research team analysed the local resources that could be brought into the market as exchanged commodities for production process.

Natural resources

- Both Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts have natural topography suitable for livestock raising, crop planting and forest growing. The areas of forest land are quite large which account for four fifths of area of Bac Ai district and for half of area of Thuan Bac district. However, the unfavourable weather conditions with frequent draught, low level of precipitation (700-1100mm per year) and long dry season (January – August) all cause carcity of water for agricultural production as well as for daily consumption of local population.

- Agricutural land: Bac Ai district has a small population but a quite big area of agricultural land (92,200ha), of which 10,000ha are for cultivation (average of 0.42ha per head). However, the soil quality is very poor and only 20-25% of agricultural land is well irrigated. In addition, a large area of cultivated land has recently been taken for construction of irrigation systems and hydropower stations. As for Thuan Bac district, the average agricultural land per head is just about half of the average of Bac Ai district, and it is almost impossible to expand. On the other hand, Thuan Bac has very good irrigation systems that supply water up to 70% of cultivated area for wet rice22.

- Land ownership: in surveyed area there exists a conflicting situation between the two patterns of land ownership - the “official ownership” granted by the government in form of land use rights certificates and the “traditional ownership” of Raglai people. Results of field interviews show that the former pattern recognises husbands as the owners (as their name are usually written in the certificates (see Table 3), whilst Raglai women, who are the real owners of their land, do not have their names on the certificates. This situation will create difficulty for Raglai women, especially those from woman-headed households, in accessing credit from commercial banks (such as the Bank for Agriculture and Rural Development or BARD) because they cannot use the land ownership paper in their husband’s names as collateral for loan.

Table 3: The ownership of agricultural land

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Husband</th>
<th>Wife</th>
<th>Both</th>
<th>Have no certificates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>63.3%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>6.7%</td>
<td>30.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Results from interviews in the field)

22 Result from interview in the field and Statistics Yearbook of Thuan Bac and Bac Ai, 2009
- **Water source**: the two selected districts are located in the driest areas of Vietnam, with the very low precipitation, in average 700-800mm per year. Sometime, the dry season can last up to 9 months and results in a serious lack of water for agricultural production as well as for daily consumption of local population. In Thuan Bac district, surface water comes from Trau river, small streams and Ba Rau, Suoi Kien Kien and Suoi Vang reservoirs. However, these sources often get dry in the dry season. Underground water is both scarce and salinised or acidified therefor of little use for people, especially for people in costal areas. In Bac Ai district, the main water source comes from Sat river and the Sat river reservoir. The reservoir has a capacity of 69 million cubic metres and can supply water for 3,800ha of cultivated land (so far just 1/3 of its capacity is used). Currently, some big reservoirs are under construction including Tra Co, Phuoc Trung, Tan My, etc… with the hope to end the water shortage and supply enough water for agricultural production and consumption of people in the two districts.

Water supply does not only affect the production scale and productivity of crops, but also the scale of animal husbandry. The communes located close to water sources or have irrigation system built such as Phuoc Chinh (Bac Ai district), Cong Hai and Loi Hai (Thuan Bac) have more developed crop plantation and can produce more by-products (straw) for livestocks during the dry season. The communes located far from water sources and without irrigation system such as Phuoc Tan commune (Bac Ai district) will face a lot of difficulties (limited area for wet rice and by-products for livestocks) and thus the scale of livestock raising there is small.

- **Foodstuff for livestoock**: grass is the main and important food that decides the scale of livestock raising (bufallo, cow, sheep and goat). This is particularly true for areas where agricultural production skills of local people are very low as in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts. Currently in Bac Ai district, there are hundreads of hecta of grass field along forest edges (abandoned upland plots) and around reservoirs. These are easily available sources of animal food which can be exploited for livestock raising at large farm scale. However, these sources are currently unused by local Raglai population given the long distance from their home – around 2.5km-10km to the grass fields. Another reason is that each household there tends to keep only few cows, hence, they have no need to go too far for food. Unlike Bac Ai district, Thuan Bac situation is quite difficult as Raglai people have to rely on hill and forest land for their liverstocks. Local governments have been encouraging people grow high yield grass for cow’s food, but so far achieved limited result - only a small area has been planted with high yield grass and this area has not yet been expanded. For example, the area with high yiel grass in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac remains unchanged at 5.72ha and 22.3ha respectively. Raglai people tend to use locally available sources such as rice straw and banana tree-trunk as foodstuff to feed their cows and pigs.

**Labour force**

Low quality labour force is a big problem for the development in general, for and market-oriented development of Raglai communities in particular. According to the general census in April 2009,

---

23 Survey result in Phuoc thang commune, Bac Ai district
the Raglai population in Ninh Thuan is 47,600 people (or 9.4% the total population). 54% of the Raglai population is of working age but it is much lower than the country’s average of 62.7% and each Raglai working person has one dependant. Though there is no official and specific statistic in two districts about labour distribution by sector, district and commune leaders and officers are of a view that the vast majority of Raglai people work in the agricultural sector. Only a few of them work in non-agricultural sectors and/or are government civil servant. Instead of the the system of supporting policies for human resource development (including policies on education and health care, etc...) implemented in Thuân bac and Bac Ai districts, the quality of labour force in Raglai community with a very high percentage of unskilled labour remains a matter of big concern. According to a MOLISA’s survey on jobs and labour, 87.96% working age persons in rural and agricultural sector in Ninh Thuan are not trained, of which 97.89% are Raglai people.

In reality, besides the cadre of commune and village officers who have lower secondary education and speak Vietnamese, most of villagers participating in the groups discussions in surveyed communes have not even completed primary school, and many of them have difficulty understanding and communicating in Vietnamese (see Table 4).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4: Knowledge of Vietnamese among the interviewees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Phuoc Thang commune</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12,0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phuoc Tan commune</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loi Hai commune</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Result from interviews in the field)

During the survey of maize value chain, most of interviewed farmers in Phuoc Tan commune said that they were trained on technical aspects of maize growing through exposing to practical models or step-by-step guiding. The research team received the same answers when asking local farmers involved in the cow and black pig value chains. However, the team’s observation on the level of understanding of Raglai farmers on production techniques and markets in both surveyed districts was very limited. Result from questionnaire processing reveals about 20% of farmers have been trained on livestock raising. However a vast majority of Raglai farmers does not know how to calculate the costs of their production. The labour division amongst Raglai communities is mainly by gender and age. Their livelihood activities still rely on the quantities (number of planted crops and raised animal), rather than on quality (intensive and specialized production) towards commodity production for the markets. Looking at Table 4 also gives readers the picture of the low level of quality of labour forced in surveyed areas.
Financial resources

Raglai farmers have very little capital to save. Chart 3 below illustrates the very low level of capital accumulation from agricultural production which is considered as their own financial resource. The accumulation just fluctuates from 3.55% in 2004 to 3.67% in 2008 among Raglai community, which is much lower than the Kinh at 15.4% and 18.42% the same years.

Chart 2: Comparison of capital accumulation rates from family incomes of Raglai and other ethnic groups

Thus, with such low capacity in capital accumulation, Raglai people will find difficult to participate in the unofficial credit markets.

Credit sources

In general, Raglai people in two districts do not have any difficulties in accessing credit for agricultural production. The main credit source is the Ban for Social Policies (BSP) with very simple borrowing procedures, which do not require collateral. In addition, WU and FA are also active channels for transferring BSP loans to poor farmers. However, it was surprising that most interviewed poor households answered they did not borrow despite the fact that they did need money for their production. The common reason given by them during the survey was that they were afraid of not being able to repay their loan.

Table 3: Proportion of households with loan for production

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Purpose of borrowing</th>
<th>Proportion (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Raising cow</td>
<td>72,0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Growing maize</td>
<td>28,1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raising pig</td>
<td>5,9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Results from field interviews)

Results from the field survey reveal that more people borrowed money for cow raising (72%) than for growing maize (28.1%). Only a very few applied for loan for raising pig (see table 5). A
possible reason for this situation could be that raising cows require more investment and thus people, who raise cow for first time, need to borrow from the BSP with favourable interest. As for growing maize local people were provided with free hybrid maize by the government until 2009. For growing local maize it requires very little care and investment, hence, there very few people need to borrow the money. The little investment can be seen through raising pig as well. Interviewed households in Loi Hai commune shared that they let the pigs wandering and provided feed pigs only once per day with vegetables, trunk of banana tree and. They only invest in pig when purchasing breeding pig and treating sick animal. According to group discussion in Kien Kien 2 village, Loi Hai commune, local veterinarians do not charge for their labour but just medicines.

Culture and social source

Through observation in the field, it is quite common that Raglai people tend to borrow seeds, agricultural materials and other daily necessities from Kinh retailers and wholesalers inside and outside their villages. They then repay the debt with their products to the borrowers. A special custom of the Raglai people is that they only sell their products to familiar traders those who offer them with loan and/or advance. Other unfamiliar traders can hardly get products from them even at a higher offer price. Forced price between farmers and traders is quite a common phenomenon in Raglai communities. Only those who are local officers or experienced farmers know how to check the price before buying/selling their products. Interviewed Raglai people said that they preferred buying breeding cow/pigs from Cham traders to Kinh traders. Such cultural and social mindsets have been considered as the main barrier hindering Raglai people from accessing to local markets that are mainly controlled by Kinh people.

In summary, amongst development resources natural resources (weather, land, water) and credit resource are easily available for Raglai communities. On the other hand, human financial and social resources are considered constrained ones that limit their access to market.

ii) Development of input markets

Through the field survey, one can concludes that input markets for agricultural products of Raglai people are very underdeveloped. The markets in Bac Ai district are even less developed than those in Thuan Bac district. The input markets are mainly controlled by Kinh and Cham traders. Moreover, actors who provide inputs are not fully specialised as those in localities of higher developed market economy. These actors in two districts either play a dual role of providing inputs and buying products (as in the case of maize value chain), or work on a seasonal basis in the community (as in the case of cow, black pig and maize value chains). In many cases, they are located outside the surveyed areas. For example, inputs providers and collectors of cow and maize are based in Tan Son township, Ninh Son district.

Surveys in villages also show that the production level of Raglai people is very low, mostly at the subsistent level, and thus far from the level of commodity production. Most people do not know how to calculate the costs of production. Households tend to work individually and there is a very little purchasing/exchange activities within a community (see Chart 4).
Chart 3: Input markets

For maize production:

For animal husbandry:

Animal husbandry:
Provision of seed and breed livestocks

It was observed during the field trip that majority of Raglai people are not aware of the importance of good seedlings and breedings in their production. Hence, technical requirements during the selection process of seedling and breedings are often neglected. Most households try to get seedlings and breedings from within their community (for example, seeds of local, rice, maize and bean, etc…) and leave animals for natural cross-breeding (cow, pig, chicken etc).

As for hybridize maize, households themselves cannot produce seeds and therefore have to buy from outside dealers. However, they tend not to care about, and have no experiences of, controlling and assessing the quality of seeds. Seeds for the hybrid maize currently grown in large quantity in Bac Ai district is supplied by Nha Ho joint-stock company which has main office in Ninh Son district. Most households in Bac Ai district buy seeds from dealers in Tan Son township (Ninh Son district) or from grocery stores in their villages who get the seeds from dealers.

Currently, the improvement of breeding livestocks is carried out through pilot models within the framework of the agricultural extension programme. In Bac Ai district, local yellow cow breed still accounts for 80% of the total herds. Cross-bred Sindh and Zebu cows, though are better in terms of having larger skeleton, but also require larger quantity of food for proper growth. In addition, their ability of withstanding local harsh climate conditions, and consuming locally available foodstuff, is very limited, and that are the reasons Raglai people do not like them. It is worth mentioning about the “Cow Revolving Fund” - a herd of 1,000 cows that PC of Bac Ai district has been used as a poverty reduction project since 1992. According to its regulations, each poor household in the district is entitled to borrow a mother cow for 2-3 years. Once the mother cow gave birth to calf, the borrowing household can keep the calf but has to return the mother cow to the fund. Thousands of poor households have benefited from this fund and the project is now managed by the Section of Agriculture and Rural Development. In Thuan Bac district, the Extension Centre is piloting cross-breeding wild male pig with local black pigs.

Credit support: compared with other minority groups in Vietnam, Raglai community in Bac Ai district and poor Raglai households in Thuan Bac district have received plenty of support from government credit programmes because they are both the targets of poverty reduction programmes, and at the same time are ethnic minority people. Most of interviewed households said that they got loan from the BSP. Whilst poor household have to pay an interest at rate of 0.6% per month, better-off households pay 0.9% per month.

Access to land: at present, upland cultivation still plays an important role in production of Raglai people. They still exploit land plots in mountain slopes and hills to grow maize and bean mainly for family consumption. It is not easy to measure the area of this land because it depends on the labour capacity of each household. In terms of ownership, Raglai traditions recognise the people who first reclaimed the land, but officially, at the time of the survey (September 2010), there is no government paper dealing with ownership of upland plots.

Meanwhile, after resettlement each household in Phuoc Thang and Phuoc Tan commune (Bac Ai district), was allocated with 5,000 square metres of land. The issue here is people do not use
their allocated land properly. One reason is that Raglai people have no habit of using fertilizer for improving the soil quality. They tend to cultivate their land until it becomes infertile after several crops. Thus, many households abandon their allocated but infertile land, and go to mountain to cultivate in their upland.

Newly separated households often lack land for cultivation. They have to work as labour or go to forest to exploit forestry products. In addition, Raglai people do not know using their garden for animal husbandry (building cages), and still let their castle run freely.

**Access to market information:** In general, knowledge of market is something completely unknown to Raglai people. Their purpose of agricultural production is to ensure the food security for their own families. They just grow crops or raise animal in a traditional way, sell them and earn some little money to cover very small daily needs. They have no idea or do not care of growing or raising something that bring them more income and are liked by the market.

There is no any means available in both surveyed districts to provide farmers with prompt market information. Farmers have to search information themselves from grocery, collectors and traders. Raglai people often sell cows to who they trust, hence, strangers find difficult to buy cows from them. This refers to the importance of familiarity of collectors in doing business with Raglai people.

In Thuan Bac district, information on price and black pig market provided by collectors differs very much from those provided by officers in Loi Hai commune. This explains black pig is not yet a main product in this area. Often, local people have to seek information from their neighbours who have already done the same business. Currently, given the low supply of pigs, local people do not meet any difficulty in selling their products, hence, do not care about what happens in the pig market. In the future, if pig herd is raised on a large scale, the current information system needs to improve significantly in order to meeting market demand.

**Services and agricultural materials:**

This is the weakest part in terms of accessing markets of agricultural products. Given the fact that production of Raglai people relies mainly on natural conditions, and there is almost no technical intervention, thus the demand for agricultural materials is minimal.

As for farming most Raglai households, especially 100% poor people do not use fertilizers and pesticides properly as they are instructed by local extension workers. Many households even do not use fertilizer at all. In Bac Ai district, there is only one shop specialising in agricultural materials by the section of the highway No.27B crossing Phuoc Thang commune. This shop is an outlet of a company based in Phan Rang-Thap Cham City. However, the shop looks idle throughout the year because there is almost no activity taking place. In addition, only households who grow hybrid maize need to buy fertilizer, hence, maize dealers in Ninh Son district also supply fertilizer and seeds.

As for animal husbandry, especially cow raising, natural food and by-products cover all the inputs, another type of inputs are medicines for animal. The concept of industrially prepared food is unknown to most of local people.
The inoculation against epidemic of animal is only provided for livestocks within the framework of government programme. People never pay themselves for such inoculation, and they only pay for medicines when their livestocks get sick. In general, people’s knowledge of livestock diseases is very limited. Interviewed people including farmers and butchers in all three communes had no ideas of why their cows or pigs died.

3.2.3. Analysis of production and consumption processes

i) General situation

Results from the survey in 2 districts draw a picture of an agricultural production and economy which is subsistent, polycrop and heavily dependent on nature. Traditional approach of Raglai people to agricultural production has resulted in low yields and degradation of crops and breeding. Local food varieties, though offering good quality of products, give very low yields (the yield of local maize is just one third of hybrid one’s, yield of upland rice is mere 4-8 quintal per ha, much lower compared to the yield of wet rice at 27-52 quintal per ha). As for livestock, being affected by in-and-in the immunity of cow and pig is very low and often results in increasing rate of sick livestocks.

The level of participation in the markets for agricultural products of Raglai people is very low. Results of analysis of products such as cow, maize and black pig in two districts show that the scale of consumed products is very small compared with the potential consumption needs of the market.

The survey of households in Phuoc Tan commune shows that only very few households sell local maize, if they do so, just sell a small quantity because it is the main food for Raglai people. It is the same for the case of selling cow - less than 10% of interviewed households answered they sold their cows during the past three years. The reason given was that cow was considered as a saving means. People sell it only when they need money for some big events such as wedding, purchase of motorbike or construction of a house, treatment of illness, etc…. Besides, villagers in Loi Hai commune shared they sold porkers mainly to Kinh traders. More details are described below.

ii) Maize value chain

The research team analysed the maize value chain as a case study. Though a traditionally popular product for Raglai people, one can say that the level of productive knowledge and the scale of production maize, as a commodity is very low (at embryonic stage). Maize production has not yet linked different parts of the markets in the two surveyed districts to form a value chain.

Though hybrid maize has been introduced to Raglai people in Bac Ai district for the purpose of commodity production since 2000, it has not been able to change the traditional thinking and farming approach of Raglai people. Local people often sell hybrid maize right after it has been harvested because they do use it for any purpose (including as food for livestock). Another

24 Interview with officer at the Department of rural and agricultural development, Thuan Bac district
reason is in their inability of reserving maize. To this effect, most of households sell maize to collectors at a very cheap price though knowing that they can be sold at a higher price in 1-2 months time.

A special characteristic of Raglai farmers during their interviews was their lack of knowledge on market and on calculation of the production-related costs. Discussion with a group of Phuoc Tan commune officers revealed that expenses for hired labourers (land preparation, taking care of maize, harvest, transportation of product, etc...), sometimes exceeded the income from selling maize. There have been Raglai households who left maize unharvested in their upland plots and went there for maize only in case of need.

Apart from the above, local people also lack market information (e.g. prices and quality of inputs materials and output products). During the survey, all households were not able to mention the quality criteria for of seeds, fertilizers and pesticides, as well as criteria for product classification. Thus, Raglai people tend to play a passive role (and are losers) in doing business with market actors.

The maize market in Bac Ai district is quite simple with 100% of trade volume goes to dealers, all of them are based in Tan Son township, Ninh Son district. Because the total cultivated area for maize here is relative small, the dealers are capable to purchase all the outputs of maize. In addition, the cultivated area for hybrid maize in Bac Ai district has been shrunk significantly during the past two years due to the end of government subsidy in 2009, and due to the falling price of hybrid maize. In comparison with 2008, the area for maize planting in 2009 reduced by 678ha and the total output reduced by 2,204 tons respectively.

Though exact statistical figures concerning production of local maize were not available, results from group discussions and household interviews revealed that only a small quantity of local maize was sold and almost all of it went to Dong Nai province. The main markets for hybrid maize are Lam Dong province and Ho Chi Minh City. Just a small quantity of hybrid maize is consumed by pig farms within Ninh Thuan province. Currently, there are about 20 pig farms and most of them are located in Ninh Son district.

**Potential for development of maize markets:**

At present, the demand for maize is increasing at global scale because maize is not only used as food for human consumption and for animal husbandry, but it is also used for production of biological fuel. Among key food crops, maize is known for its highest increase in yield. According to the data from the US Department of Agriculture (USDA), the total area for maize is larger than the one for wet rice, and maize becomes the second most popular food crop (after wheat).

In the domestic markets maize supplies are lagging behind demands, and Vietnam imports about a half million tons of maize every year. Since the early 1990s thanks to multiplication of hybrid maize and application of improved farming techniques, the maize production has increased considerably. It is noted that maize productivity of Vietnam has constantly increased during the last 20 years.
iii) Cow value chain

*The research team conducted a detailed survey on Cow value chain in Bac Ai district so as to acquire the information on the level of development, as well as the scale of commodity production of livestock raising in selected areas (similar approach can be applied for Thuan Bac district).*

The total number of cows in Bac Ai district in 2009 was 13,060, which made up 11.5% of the total number of cows in Ninh Thuan province. The average number of cows increased by 5.5% during the period 2006-2009, but it increased by 7% during 2007-2008 due to an increase in the number of households, who moved to new resettlement areas and started raising livestock. However, the annual increase dropped to 4% for the period 2008-2009 because by that time almost every resettled household already bought enough breeding cows and the grazing fields were shrinking, etc... In average each household here has 3 cows which is lower than that of the provincial average of 5 cows per household²⁵.

Cows in Bac Ai district consist mainly of local breed and cross-bred cows. Local cows account for 70% of the total number of herds and the Sindh and Bradman cross-bred cows account for 30%. It is shared by the local people that many villages do not have good breeding bulls. As a result young bulls in rut often cross accidentally with the mother cows in grazing lands and causing a high percentage of in-and-in. Natural grass, rice straw and maize leaves and trunks comprise the main sources of food for cows. All households in Bac Ai have no idea of neither using staple food for fattening cows nor reserving dried food for cows during the dry season which lasts 5-6 months per year.

*Tieing cows to trees* or pillars and then letting them graze is the most common practice of Raglai people. The research team could not find Raglai households who planted high yield grass as food for cow fattening (so far only Kinh people, who have come and settled in Bac Ai district, practise cow fattening). In addition, none of Raglai households has stall for cows.

*Raglai people do not apply advanced techniques in raising cows*, including in raising cows for slaughtering. They tend apply traditional (backward) techniques and every family assigns one member who has more time to look after their cows. Raglai women participate in every steps of cow value chain from making decision on cow purchasing to taking care of, and to selling cow.

*Veterinary and agricultural extension services:* 90% of services are provided by government programmes on extension and veterinary through training, campaigning and piloting. Nearly 10% of technical knowledge is provided by Oxfam-funded projects. However due to limited knowledge of Raglai people and the language barrier, top-down approach, weak organisation of training, etc... training courses have not brought about the expected results. In addition, there is a lack of advanced training with practical exercises, lack of guidelines on techniques for raising cows suitable for Raglai people, and lack of good practical model for them to learn and follow.

²⁵ Hoang Xuan Truong et all: Report on Cow value chain in Ninh Thuan province, April 2010
**Innoculation/vaccination against diseases:** all are carried out by networks of district, commune veterinarians and village collaborators. The rate of innoculation/vaccination is very low - just only 50% of the total number of cows. The innoculation of diseases such as ulcerated mouth and hooves and congestion achieves around 40-50% only. This is because of the ineffective coordination between farmers and veterinarians and lack of appropriate and scientific education. There is a serious shortage of qualified veterinarians in Bac Ai district. Interviewed people shared wrong doing of some veterinarians who make use their work (giving treatment for personal profit). They pretend unable to cure the disease and then offer the sick cows at a very cheap price.

**Treatment of sick cows:** only 30% of commune veterinarians are capable of giving good treatment whilst the remaining are inexperienced, some of them have just finished high school. Raglai people don’t know how to take care of cows when they get sick. They just rely on the support from commune/district veterinarians. Cows in Bac Ai mainly suffer from diseases such as arthitis, diarrheoa, intestinal flat worm. Two dangerous diseases – foot and mouth, and congestion become rare due to vaccination and low density of herds.

**Increasing cow raising is considered one of key objectives for poverty reduction of people in the district, especially of Raglai people.** As mentioned above, Bac Ai district has been running a revolving cow fund for this purpose since 1992 up to present.

Most interviewed Raglai people shared the main purposes of cow raising are for ploughing their land and for bearing calves. Only few people said they raised cows for sale and for poverty reduction (see Table 6 below).

**Table 6: Purpose of raising cow of Raglai people**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Number of interviewees</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For ploughing</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>76.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For bearing calves</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>80.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For slaughtering</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For saving</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For manure</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Results from interviews in the field)

According to the district statistics there are households in all 9 communes who raise cow mainly for bearing calves and as ploughing power. The largest herd of cows is found in Phuoc Thang commune with 2,018 cows. There is a big different in scale of livestock raising from one commune to another. Phuoc Chinh has the largest scale of household breeding with 5.65 cows per household. It is so because the commune has a good irrigation system which helps increase the cultivated area for wet rice. In addition to that by-products such as rice straw can be used as foodstuff for livestock during the dry season. Other communes do not have such favourable conditions for livestock raising thus the herds of cow there are smaller. It is expected that the number of cows in communes like Phuoc Thang and Phuoc Tan will increase in the next few years when the construction of irrigation system is completed and agricultural production increased and more by-products are produced.
Consumption of product: available data at the time of the survey show that annually about 600 cows are purchased by collectors in Bac Ai, which accounts for 0.5% of the total number of cow herd. About 300 female cows is resold to local households for the breeding purpose. The remaining of 300 including old and sick cows, are slaughtered for meat. Bull and male calves are sold in greater number than female cows and calves, because local people keep the latter for reproductive purpose. For example, in Phuoc Thang commune there are over 700 households who raise a total of 1,860\(^{26}\) cows but only 20-30 cows are sold each year, which accounts for 1-1.6% of the total number of cows.

iv) Black pig chain

Black pig is a popular house animal of Raglai community. Black pig possesses some superior characteristics compared to cross-bred pigs such as good quality of meat, capability of living in harsh condition, not labour intensive. On the other hand the biggest disadvantage of black pig is its slow growth - it takes one year for a black pig to weight of 30-40kg while for other cross-bred pigs it would take only six months to weight of 70-80kg.

Similar to the cases of cow and maize, only a small quantity of black pigs is for consumption and it varies by seasons. The total number of black pigs in Thuan Bac district in 2009 was 8,360. As one can see from Table 7 below, only 47% households raise pigs for slaughtering and the remaining households raise pigs for the purpose of saving or expenses for big events (wedding, funeral etc.).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>For meat</th>
<th>For reproduction</th>
<th>For sale</th>
<th>For saving</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No. of interviewees</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage %</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Results from interviews in the field)

Breeding pigs are traded mainly within villages. The markets for pork are larger. Like with cow raising, Raglai people in Thuan Bac district raise pigs by letting them run freely and take little care of them. Pigs are fed only once a day and the main food is cut banana trunk. They cook mixed food for sows only in case the sows are going to give birth to baby piglets. Every member in the family can take care of pigs. Raglai women participate in every steps of black pig value chain from making decision on purchasing to taking care of, and to selling pigs.

In the meantime, black pig raising in Thuan Bac district faces some challenges as follows: i) lack of pure black pigs, the current so-called black pigs are often cross-bred with other pigs; ii) black pig raising requires larger area which is not easy for poor Ragali people; iii) considering that black pig is raised naturally, it could lead to the pollution of environment; iv) if fed with industrially

---

\(^{26}\) Report on soci-economic situation of Phuoc Thang commune, Quarter 1, 2010

45
prepared food, the quality of black pigs will be reduced; v) raising black pig of good quality takes
times and investments, low profits.

Around late November and early December, local collectors begin visiting local households for pigs (for slaughtering), and, at the same time, contact with collectors in other localities in the province for their outputs. It is difficult to know the exact figure of how many pigs have been purchased for slaughtering during the time of Tet festival. Partly because of the small quantity of pigs local collectors can buy from producers purchase, partly because Raglai people tend to sell their pigs to familiar collectors who pay in advance.

**Market potentials:** there is an advantage that black pigs are of high demands and local farmers face no difficulty when they want to sell their pigs. Smaller pigs are sold more easily than the bigger ones. At the time of conducting survey, the price for hybrid pigs was 25,000 VND per live kg whilst the price for black pigs was over 30,000 VND per live kg.

v) **Some characteristics of Raglai people in selling their products**

**Good quality but small quantity of products:** breeding products from Raglai people are preferable by the market because of its quality especially beef, pork, chicken and local maize. However, their current traditional farming results a low economic effectiveness. There is almost no products made for commodity, hence the consuming market has’nt yet been formed.

**Lack of motivation to participate in the markets:** It was shared by a farmer that “Nobody raises pigs to buy motorbike or build house. If a family doesn’t have money to send their children to school, they will sell pigs. People don’t earn much money from raising pigs but it helps when we have to pay for some incidental expenses. We don’t invest in raising pigs because they takes a long time to grow up. We have to wait for even one year to sell a brood of pigs to earn a little money”. There is a lack of good model of raising pigs from which people can have motivation to learn and share experiences.

**Incapability of managing the budget effectively and ignorance of selling time.** As it has mentioned above, this is one of the main barriers that prevent Raglai people to have an access to the market. Their education is very low. Most of interviewed people only finised grade 2 or 3 and many of them do not know how to write. Hence, the idea of how to calculate the cost effectiveness of farming or breeding is very vague for them. This can be explained why they keep their livestocks (cow/pig) for a long time and considered them as family property. In addition, Raglai people have no idea of time to sell their products to make a good profit. They only sell their agricultural products when they need money. Specifically, one cow can be kept for 10 years or even longer if their health is good. When they want to sell, their cow is already too old and sick. It is the same with black pig when many households raise them for 3 years.

**Unwillingness of selling the products:** Raglai people don’t want to sell their cow/pig just because they think that cow/pig are their reserved property but not commodity. This is their choice and is a popular characteristic of poor people not only in Ninh Thuan but also other less developed areas. In the economic environment where welfare security is missing and lack of diversified income sources, local people would prefer the way to cope with unexpected incidents to a business stategy that brings them profit and risks as well.
Language and faith barriers: Kinh people are those who consume most of agricultural products from Raglai community. Most of collectors are Kinh and a very few are Raglai. One of the biggest challenges for Raglai people especially women are language and culture. Often, they do not feel comfortable and have ability to communicate or negotiate with outsider. That is the reason of why they want to sell their products to familiar traders though at a cheap price. This has obviously hindered them from accessing to the market and limited the participation of output actors. It is impossible for some traders who want to buy products directly from Raglai people who are afraid of communicating and lack of faith with strangers. Such kind of barrier has also resulted in vulnerable position of Raglai women in doing business, while men often represent their families to negotiate because they can speak Kinh language.

Lack of market information: At present, there is not any means available in both selected districts to provide farmers with updated market information. Farmers lack information about price of product and input materials. They often get the information from their neighbours or in the market. Before a board with some market information on it was provided by a project, however, the information hasn’t been updated regularly. It is left fallow nowadays. In addition, the information is in Kinh language which obviously limits the understanding of Raglai people and probably results in their decision making.

Great distance from main consumption markets: As it has been shared above that the products from cow, pig and maize of Raglai people have a great demand in the market. People can sell their products any time to collectors. However, given the long distance from the center market and main consuming markets, Raglai people especially women find hard to participate in the market. If people in Bac ai and Thuan Bac districts want to sell their products, they have to go through collectors in Ninh Son and Phan Rang city. Being located far away from the center, people don’t have updated information about price and they have to sell their products at a forced price. Their products are mainly consumed in provinces namely Lam Dong, Khanh Hoa and HCM city. Though the local authority has tried to develop the traffic system so as to facilitate better the products flow, still the infrastructure of trade has been very limited.

Underveloped enterprises and lack of competition: No local enterprises have been found in the two selected districts. There are only small Kinh and Cham collectors and a very few are Raglai. Big collectors and slaughter houses are mainly located in Ninh Son district and Phan Rang city. Also, there are neither farmer’s groups nor cooperatives from which local people could rely on when they need to share experiences and farming technics. So, developing brand name for products produced by Raglai community and helping them improve the capacity of negotiation in business would be a long long term strategy. This has required lots of time, efforts and cooperation from many different stakeholders.

Lack of policies and mechanisms supporting enterprises and local people in accessing the market: local authorities’ Strategies and development plan have only mentioned about inputs and outputs of the production without addressing the issue of how to consume local products. Hence, a supporting policies machenism towards enterprises and producers in accessing the market is completely missing.
In sum up, the agricultural products from cow, local maize and black pig are highly appreciated in the market because of their good quality. However, their disadvantage is low yield and small quantity. The neighbouring provinces namely Lam Dong (mainly restaurants and hotels in Da Lat), Khanh Hoa and HCMCity are the most potential market for those products. Collectors are always ready to buy these products but its quantity is very limited. So what are the main reasons that prevent Raglai community, especially women, from having an access to the potential markets so that they can increase incomes and improve their lives. The answers should be improved awareness of market-oriented production, Improved capacity of calculating production costs of Raglai people including the women. Local authorities, mass organisations, international organisations and Raglai people themselves in the two districts will play a very important role in making the changes happen.

3.2.4. Orientation of socio-economic development

**Ninh Thuan Province**\(^{27}\):

*Overall objective of agriculture: to continuously speed the shift of agricultural structure and rural economy to commodity production in order to ensure the food security.* Each sector and field should make use of its competitive advantages in farming and breeding production so as to improve effective use in each unit of ha and to improve income for households. The objective will include (i) protecting forest/sea resources; (ii) protecting environment in rural and mountainous aras; (iii) improving infrastructure for agricultural production; (iv) combining production and processing/consumption markets.

**Specific objectives and targets:**

- To shift the structure of agricultural economy by increasing breeding density. By 2015, the density of breeding will account for 32%, services by 9%, farming reduced by 59% and food productivity will reach 300,000 tons.

- To put great efforts in forest protection aiming at development of forest resource and improvement of ecological environment, living environment of rural people: the forest coverage will be 46%; percentage of households using hygienic water will be 95%.

- To strengthen management work and effectively exploit infrastructure system for the improvement of agricultural production by (i) increasing an area of cultivated land watered by 84,000ha, accounting for 93% of the total cultivated area (of which 2,700ha increased thanks to Song Sat reservoir’s operation); (ii) Completing construction works of disaster mitigation and preparedness and bringing about 95% works into operation; (iii) Repairing and strengthening canal system with the improvement of operational management.

- To invest in development of trade village by: (i) establishing 3-5 trade villages in each district with the target of building brand name for 2-3 products; (ii) developing handicraft such as

---

brocade weaving, ceramics, bamboo/ratten knitting, embroidery etc. in order to create jobs for free labours and jobless people, of which the majority are women\textsuperscript{28}.

**Women's issue:** It is expected that WU continues to take a lead in implementing supporting women activities with a better quality, for the period 2006-2010. This will include (i) instructing WU at different levels to implement some activities to help Raglai women escape from poverty effectively and sustainably, by assigning WU members to identify the reasons of poverty followed by specific solutions to help poor households in the commune; guiding these households to make plan for farming and animal husbandary so as to help them understand/use the loan appropriately and distribute their work effectively in the family. Apart from this, a book for monitoring such activities, processes and results is made available. (ii) coordinating with the Bank for Social Policies at different level to help local people understand better about loan project for poor households under Project 135, Resolution 30a; (iii) deploying saving and credits projects targeting on poor women; (iv) setting up models of doing business by households and providing women with trainings on production knowledge and reproductive health. (vi) capacity building for officers at different levels so that they can meet with new requirement of work. One of the key tasks of WU is to support women in developing family economy, improving their income for a better life.

IFAD's plan (International Fund for Agricultural Development) of implementing a poverty reduction programme in Ninh Thuan province, focusing on gender issue and women’s access to market will be a good opportunity to help Raglai people especially women take on the ownership of economy.

**Bac Ai district:** From now to 2020, the district agricultural and forest development plan will be a focus to strive for a sustainable economic development with the combination of production and processing/consumption market. In a short term, food security, malnutrition prevention and sustainable reduction should be prioritised\textsuperscript{29}. Following are district's specific objectives:

- To develop agriculture by (i) selecting plants/trees suitable to local weather, land type in each commune in order to make use its advantages; (ii) increasing rice yield by 10,850 tons by growing wet rice in an area of 3,500ha in locations benefitted from irrigational works such as Song Sat, Tra Co and Tan My reservoirs; hybrid maize yield by 10,000 tons by growing maize in an area of 2000ha/year in uphill land of Phuoc Binh and Phuoc Thanh commune. This will ensure the sufficient food for both human and animals; (iii) expanding area of growing industrial and fruit trees; (iv) studying and allocating area of growing sugarcain, tobacco and wheat in locations near new reservoirs.

- To invest in development of raising cows/buffalow at household scale and striving for semi-industrial raising method. The activities include (i) growing grass fields for 18,300 cows/buffaloes of which 2000 are buffaloes; (ii) implementing well the selection and cross-breed of cows/buffaloes; (iii) ensuring food sources for animals by programming/allocating grass fields and making use of agricultural by-products.

\textsuperscript{28} Interview with the Industry and Commercial Department
\textsuperscript{29} Draft of Political Report by XI Party Committee of Bac Ai District, Summitted to Delegate Congress XII, 2011-2015
- To address the occurrence of epidemics by studying, cross-breeding and developing black pigs and chicken.
- To build two trade villages (Ma Lam village, Phuoc Tan commune and Ma Nai village, Phuoc Thanh commune) in making bamboo products and wine aiming at creating more jobs for local people, mainly for women.

**Thuan Bac District:** the overall objective is to set up economic structure towards Industry-Agriculture-Service, of which industry accounts for 67.1%; agriculture 20.8% and services 12.1%. The total revenue will be 8 billion VND.

- Farming: by 2015 the district’s food productivity will be 30,000 tons. The activities include (i) ensuring the annual increase of growing wet rice area by 4,500ha and other food plants by 3,000ha; (ii) continuing to strengthen the use of reservoirs’ capacity for agricultural production and expanding area of growing in other areas.
- Breeding: to develop farms, improve the quality of animals and raise goat for milk. By 2010, a total of animals will be 38,000, of which 15,000 are pigs and 200,000 are livestocks. Also, the districts aims to increase the rate of cross-bred cows by 40% and of sheep, goat by 60%.
- Forestry: (i) the district continues to implement well the forest growing as per plan to ensure an area of 250ha covered by forest and by 2015 to ensure a big coverage of forest by 42% (ii) activities for forest protection.
- To build brand names for 2 products namely black pigs and local chicken by (i) developing a proposal on “conversion of plants and livestocks” such as bananas, pineapples. Local animals will be further exploited in a longer term.
- To develop trade villages focusing on knitting in Tap La and Dong Thong villages, Phuoc Chien commune in order to create jobs for local women.

### 3.3. Participation of Raglai people in value chains of agricultural products

#### 3.3.1 Horizontal linkage

There is a very close linkage between producers and inputs suppliers/collectors including groceries, partly because of their long standing relationship in doing business. Also, it is because most of producers who buy materials from these actors and owe them sometimes. After harvest, these producers settle down all their payments and owe. Also, Local people even borrow daily essential needs such as rice, oil, foodstuff etc from the groceries in the village. That’s why a practice is formed. Each household can borrow from one actor in the chain and after harvest they have to sell their products to that actor.

As for the households that lack capital for production, this is the popular way for them to maintain their production and meet the minimum needs of daily life while awaiting the harvest.

---

30 Interview with Industry and Trade Department officers.
31 PCom Thuan Bac district: 5 year plan, 2011-2015
32 Interview with district officers, Thuan Bac
33 Interview with officers from the department of industry and trade
season. As for actors like input suppliers and collectors, this is a good way to invest and secure their collecting sources. Though there is not any agreement officially made between these actors and borrowers, there is a negotiation that the latter will enjoy a favourable price of inputs materials, if they sell their products to these actors. In fact, this is how these owners make a good profit while Raglai people don’t think that they borrow with a high interest. The linkage between actors in maize value chain can be seen below

Chart 5: Linkages of actors in the maize value chain

Some big producers have also the same relationship with agents as above. Having commitment of selling their products to agents, these producers are invested in breeding/seed and necessary inputs materials. They will settle down the debt after harvest.

As for small producers, if they sell their products directly to these agents they will get a better deal than going through groceries. However, only a very few households living in Ninh Son district can do the trading directly because they have their own transportation. In this case, sellers and buyers don’t have a close relationship.

Groceries and agents have also set up their good relationship. Each grocery often does their business with one particular agent.

As for big collectors, they tend to make a contact with every agent/dealer because sometimes they have to collect products from many agents to meet high orders.

3.3.2. Vertical linkage

There is no formal institution that links household-producers. Sometimes, during the crops these producers help one another by exchanging labour or they can hire labour in the village. There is neither sharing of farming techniques nor market information amongst producers. This explains why local farmers lack market information chronically.
Also, there is no internal relationship amongst groceries and agents/dealers themselves. Each actor has their own relations and work independently.

3.3.3. Potentials for consumption market development

Encouragement policies of local authority towards consuming market is quite general. An officer at the Department of Industry and Trade shared that the province has a plan to ask for investment from enterprises inside and outside the province to construct a meat processing factory, supermarket, trade center and BOT model market. In general, the consumption markets in Ninh Thuan are currently controlled by private businesses.

Business environment: The local authority plan to form a market system within districts, communes and supermarkets in Phan Rang-Thap Cham. If this project is realiable, it will help introduce and consume local products especially those ones from Raglai people.

Infrastructure: the infrastructure has been improved though the processing industry of Raglai agricultural products processing is not built yet. There are two import/export companies specialising in cashewnut. However, because of low yield of this product these companies have to buy more from other provinces like Binh Phuoc and Lam Dong. Cashewnuts are packed before exporting mainly to China. It is encouraging that Bac Ai district PC has plan to build market places in all of its 9 communes. If realised, Raglai people, especially women, will have a great opportunity to participation in the markets as they do not have to travel far.

Roads: The traffic system is well developed. At present, there are good roads connecting 2 districts with the consumption markets. National Highway 27 connects Bac Ai district with Phan Rang-Thap Cham City and Da Lat; Highway 27B connects Bac Ai with Cam Ranh City and Tan Son township (Ninh Son district). Highway 1A and South-North railways run across Thuan Bac district, connect Nha Trang with Phan Rang-Thap Cham.

3.4. Raglai women’s participation in market development

3.4.1. Level of women’s participation in market development

- The survey from the two districts has revealed that Raglai people’s participation in the markets is very limited and women's participation is even more limited. Phases in value chains, that can generate most profit such as supplying inputs and selling products to big collectors, have been dominated by the Kinh and Cham traders. Only a very few Raglai househols or women (local officers) are able to buy products right in the village/commune.

- In value chains of agricultural products Raglai women are active mainly in production process and selling products to small dealers.

Below is an illustration on how Raglai women participate in value chains.

---

34 Interview with officers at the Department of Industry and Trade
In principle, out of six phases of the chain, Raglai women can participate in the first three and the last two phases. However, the only phase that Raglai women currently participate in is raising cow in a traditional way. In near future, they can participate in the phase of fattening cows before sale. The situation is the same for maize and pig chains.

To some extent, Raglai women participate quite actively in selling products considering their rights in the family. Raglai women have their rights to decide whether cows are sold. 95% of interviewed people said that there was always an agreement between husbands and wives. However, women/wives are often people who have the last word (on how much they want to sell). The result from interviews with local officers, households and the chain analysis has reaffirmed the above observation (see tables 7, 8 and 9 below).

**Table 8: Decision making by gender in cow raising**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Both</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Raising cows</td>
<td>4,0%</td>
<td>40,0%</td>
<td>56,0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buying breeding cows</td>
<td>11,1%</td>
<td>22,2%</td>
<td>66,7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borrowing</td>
<td>0,0%</td>
<td>14,3%</td>
<td>85,7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchasing foodstuff and pay for veterinary service</td>
<td>10,0%</td>
<td>30,0%</td>
<td>60,0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selling cows</td>
<td>20,0%</td>
<td>40,0%</td>
<td>40,0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 9: Decision making by gender in maize growing**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Both</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Planting</td>
<td>10,0%</td>
<td>10,0%</td>
<td>80,0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchasing seed</td>
<td>19,0%</td>
<td>14,3%</td>
<td>66,7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 10: Decision making by gender in pig raising

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Both</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Raising pigs</td>
<td>0,0%</td>
<td>47,1%</td>
<td>52,9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchasing breeding</td>
<td>0,0%</td>
<td>43,8%</td>
<td>56,3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borrowing</td>
<td>0,0%</td>
<td>60,0%</td>
<td>40,0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchasing food and pay for veterinary services</td>
<td>10,0%</td>
<td>60,0%</td>
<td>30,0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selling pigs</td>
<td>0,0%</td>
<td>44,4%</td>
<td>55,6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: The result from interviews with households*

- Market awareness: the interviews made with the Chairwomen of WU of Thuan Bac district and Phuoc Tan commune (Bac Ai district) have revealed that they both have thoughts of market and doing business. Particularly, they know how calculate and manage their budget. They often check the price at agents before selling their products and hire labour if necessary, etc. These typical cases have shown that Raglai women have enough capacity to participate in the market.

#### 3.4.2. Barriers preventing Raglai women’s participation in the market

- **Lack of time:** As it is mentioned in the previous part, matriarchy and the division of labour in Raglai community empower women to take a lead in their families (role of giving birth, taking care of children, doing chores). While the role of men (husbands) is to take care of activities outside such as production, communicating with people. This division of labour is considered as a main reason that limits Raglai women economic ownership in the context of market oriented economy. The information from the three communes Phuoc Tan and Phuoc Thang (Bac Ai district) and Loi Hai (Thuan Bac) mentioned in the above table has shown that Raglai women play an important role in managing their families and economic development; even they seem to be more powerful than men in making decision of selling breeding. Meanwhile men are very passive. They enjoy drinking wine or smoking cigarettes when they have some money. They rarely give their hands to women. Such backwards customs make women spend most of their time on chores and production as well. This has hindered them from having time to rest, recover their health and improve their capacity.

- **Limited capability and unwillingness of communicating:** the reality has shown that many of Raglai women are illiterate. They don’t know how to read and write. They are afraid of
communicating with people outside because they cannot speak Kinh fluently. So in order to help them get access to the market, they should be provided with capacity building, trainings and meetings in the community. Some officers from WU in Thuan Bac district have suggested to organise meetings in the community instead of commune center so that more women can participate. This will be arm's reach of local authority and OGB.

3.4.2. Barriers preventing Raglai women's participation in the markets

- Lack of time: As it is mentioned in the previous part, matriarchy and the division of labour in Raglai community empower women to take a lead in their families (role of giving birth, taking care of children, doing chores). While the role of men (husbands) is to take care of activities outside such as production, communicating with people. This division of labour is considered as a main reason that limits Raglai women economic ownership in the context of market oriented economy. The information from the three communes Phuoc Tan and Phuoc Thang (Bac Ai district) and Loi Hai (Thuan Bac) mentioned in the above table has shown that Raglai women play an important role in managing their families and economic development; even they seem to be more powerful than men in making decision of selling breeding. Meanwhile men are very passive. They enjoy drinking wine or smoking cigarettes whenever they have some money. They rarely give their hands to women. Such backward customs make women spend most of their time on production and chores, thus having less time to rest and learning.

- Limited capability and unwillingness of communicating: the reality has shown that many of Raglai women are illiterate. They don’t know how to read and write. They are afraid of communicating with people outside because they cannot speak Kinh fluently. So in order to help them get access to the market, they should be provided with capacity building, trainings and meetings in the community. Some officers from WU in Thuan Bac district have suggested to organise meetings in the community instead of commune center so that more women can participate. This will be arm's reach of local authority and OGB.

- Limited access to credit and land: Most households' land certificates are in the names of husbands, hence, women will face difficulty access commercial bank credit because it requires collateral (usually in form of land use certificates).

- Though the local authorities have provided poor people, especially ethnic minority people with a number of of supporting projects and activities, there is not a single programme focusing on Raglai community. Concerning the WU's work with Raglai women, local WU's officers face difficulties such as having low capacity and inadequate working conditions, all these result in low effectiveness and efficiency of WU's work.

- Training courses were far away from their houses, so women find hard to participate.

Poverty reduction and socio-economic development for Raglai communities in general, and for Raglai women in particular, are difficult tasks that require a lot of time, efforts and contributions of all stakeholders (central government and local governments, mass organisations and businesses, international organisations and local people). Local female officers, especially WU officers (Pinăng Thị Hôn, Kator Thị Nguyễn…) are the very good examples of the capacity of Raglai women in economic leadership

55
3.4.3. Sufficient and necessary conditions for Raglai women’s participation in the market

Necessary conditions:

- **Right to making decision:** In general, Raglai women have a stronger voice than men in decision making. It is encouraged that both husbands and wives discuss and agree before making decision. This is a necessary condition for women’s economic ownership (see Table 11).

Table 11: Labour division by gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STT</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Who</th>
<th>Who does more</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Wife/daughter</td>
<td>Husband/son</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Growing maize**

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Land making</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓ Husband</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Growing</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>Wife</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Taking care</td>
<td></td>
<td>Wife</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Harvesting</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Splitting seeds</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Drying seeds</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Packing</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Selling</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>Husband/son</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Raising cows**

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Decision of raising cows</td>
<td></td>
<td>Wife</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Grazing</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Decision of raising breeding cows</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>Wife</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Veternary service</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Raising pigs**

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Making decision for</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>Wife</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- **Capacity and participation:** in order to making a right decision, Raglai women need to be educated and have knowledge of socio-economic issues so as to be able to interact with outside people and in the markets. Raglai’s customs and current practices are those factors preventing women from doing this. If the situation remains, women’s role and position become minor within and beyond their families. Therefore the women need i) supporting policies and mechanisms for capacity building of government and mass organisations; ii) campaigns on abolishing backward customs that prevent the development of Raglai people and Raglai women; iii) capacity building activities organised in villages so that more women can participate in.

- **Striving for success:** Raglai women who are officers at different levels are good examples about women’s capacity in overcoming traditional custom barriers. They have tried to take their ownership in economy and society.

**Sufficient conditions:**

- To improve women’s access to resources: as it has been analysed above, Raglai women don’t meet any difficulty in accessing natural resource and government credit source but human, social and financial resources. This work can be tackled by the local authority, mass organisations and the whole community.

- To strengthen and improve the effectiveness of support from the local authority, mass organisations, INGOs so that they can feel confident in doing business and get access to market.

- **To encourage men (husbands) to give a hand to women (wives):** men should reduce heavy burden for women by sharing the chores with them.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>selling</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Purchasing breedings</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>Wife</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Veterinary service</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>Husband</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Taking care</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>Wife</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- To improve women’s access to resources: as it has been analysed above, Raglai women don’t meet any difficulty in accessing natural resource and government credit source but human, social and financial resources. This work can be tackled by the local authority, mass organisations and the whole community.

- To strengthen and improve the effectiveness of support from the local authority, mass organisations, INGOs so that they can feel confident in doing business and get access to market.

- **To encourage men (husbands) to give a hand to women (wives):** men should reduce heavy burden for women by sharing the chores with them.
IV. RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS

4.1. Summary of big issues related to rural market development for Raglai communities and Raglai women

1. Poverty reduction: Raglai communities are among the poorest in surveyed areas and face great difficulties in their life. Despite of the fact that Raglai people have made many efforts and received considerable support from government as well as from local and international organisations for poverty reduction and economic development, the poverty rate of areas with high concentration of Raglai people is much higher than of local total average (for instance the poverty rate of by end of 2009 is 54%, and the figure is 24% for Thuan Bac district compared to 10% of whole Ninh Thuan province). In Bac Ai district there are still 2,257 poor women households and woman-headed households account for 14.3% of total poor households. In Thuan Bac district, the communes with highest Raglai population are also the poorest communes. Thus poverty reduction remains the most important and urgent task of all development agencies working with Raglai people.

2. Improving livelihoods and services: Raglai people’s main livelihood is agricultural production (plantation of food crops and animal husbandry) with backward techniques and very low productivity. A vast majority of Raglai people still pursue traditional upland cultivation (planting mixed maize and beans in their upland plots) without investments for fertilizer. Main products are maize (hybrid maize and local strand), rice, beans, casava, cows, pigs and chickens. Handicraft production is almost non-existent and nearly 100% of services are provided by Kinh and Cham people. Recently a number of Raglai households signed contract with local government on protecting forest land for fees around 200-250,000 VND per hecta per year. Besides, poor Raglai people also work as labour for fees from 40-75,000 VND per day dependent on the nature of work. Women are often hired to do light work whilst men do more physical work (and better paid) such as land preparation, construction work.

3. Knowledge of calculating production costs and access to the markets: a vast majority of Raglai people do not know how to calculate the costs of their production. Backward production knowledge and the self-reliance thinking is deeply rooted in minds of local people. Market awareness is very limited to most Raglai people including women. Traditional barter practice with its simple measurement units is still popular. The most marketed product of Raglai people is hybrid maize, simply because they plant this variety but do not use it and neither how to store it (for sale when the price is good). Other local products are for sale (e.g. cow, pig, fruits, etc.) but only in case of family’s need for big spending and bartering is a very common practice.

4. The markets for agricultural products in two surveyed districts are still quite limited but with great potentials for future development. In spite of the fact that the productive level of Raglai people is very low, their products such as bief, pork, chicken, been, maize (all local varieties) are of high market demand because of it high quality. This is the great potential for market development for Raglai people. Almost 100% of input suppliers and collectors of outputs are the Kinh or Cham. Raglai people consider social factors (kinship, friendliness, neighbourhood, long term relationship etc.) as a basis for exchange, not market factors (cost and profit). They are very simple and faithful, speculation and bargaining are strange to
them, and thus tend to be on the losser side when doing business. The markets in Thuan Bac district seems more developed than markets in Bac Ai district because Raglai people there posses better productive knowledge.

5. Socio-economic development based on significantly improved local infrastructure. During the past five years, the central government and local governments in Ninh Thuan province, in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts invested heavily in and improved significantly infrastructure (roads, systems of reservoirs and canals, electricity grids, post and telecommunications, schools, health centres, market places, etc.) in the two districts. In addition, a number of development policies (Programme 135, Programme 134, Programme 30a...) have been implemented and brought about significant improvements in local extension sytems (forestry, agriculture and animal husbandry), in credit provision to farmers, in public social services, and in poverty reduction. Several international organisations including OGB have been supporting poverty reduction interventions for Raglai people. An emerging issue here is how to make best use of these investments and support to elevate the production of Raglai people, including Raglai women, to a higher level so that they will be able to overcome poverty, improve their living conditions and access better market opportunities.

6. Lack of supporting mechanisms and policies for local business and people access the markets. Support from local government and mass organisations to local population, though plays the most crutial and decisive role in their socio-economic development, but has so far targeted whole local population, and lacking specific policies/measures for Raglai people. Development strategies and plans of local governments have so far dealt mainly with economic inputs and outputs and totally neglected the markets for products, collectors of outputs. Development of experimental models in Raglai communities has so far focused on production models, not on business models.

7. Women’s Union and international organisations seem the only organisations which support Raglai women. In reality, supporting activities to Raglai women to overcome poverty and play a more important role in economic development have been carried out mainly, if not exclusively, by local WU and international NGOs including OGB. The role of the governemnt and other mass organisations seems not clear. In addition, there is a lack of replicable good development models.

4.2. Recommendations

Based on practical arguments and analysis of current poverty reduction policies in Ninh Thuan province, the research team comes up with some recommendations on major supporting measures for Raglai people, especially for Raglai women to develop their economy, reduce their poverty and access better market opportunities follows:

4.2.1. General recommendations

- Poverty reduction and socio-economic development for Raglai communities in general, and for Raglai women in particular, requires a lot of time, efforts and contributions of all stakeholders (central government and local governments, mass organisations and businesses, international organisations and local people). In order to help Raglai people
access to the markets, the first step to do is to help them overcome poverty, followed by helping them gradually develop a commodity production.

- It is important to define clearly roles and functions of each and every stakeholder:

  - Government: a key player in charge of long term and big undertakings such as developing development strategies and plans; issuing policies and mechanisms for good governance; investing in infrastructure; building quality cadres of civil servants including Raglai cadres...

  - Mass organisations (WU, FA, Fatherland Front, Youth Organisation, etc.): to implement their mandates such as political education and for its members, community mobilisation, running credit funds, building cultural villages, models for poverty reduction and doing good farming, etc.

  - Oxfam Great Britain and other international organisations: to link local communities with government, build capacity for both, and, at the same time implement relevant development interventions to support disadvantaged communities and people (ethnic minorities, poor people, women, etc.). These organisations have strengths in applying participatory and gender sensitive approaches to community development work (community mobilisation and training), introducing and piloting best practices, building some infrastructure (canals, schools...)

  - Raglai communities: to make their own efforts in improving their productive knowledge and techniques, addressing (and gradually abandoning) backward customs and dependency mentality, etc. The first thing for them is to learn how to calculate costs of their production, once they have acquired this knowledge and skills it is very likely their production will be more effective and productive, generate more income for a better life. This, however, will take time and great efforts and the people to start with are local Raglai officers and youths.

  - Local businesses: to be committed to provide a good quality of services and buying local products at reasonable prices. It is important that local government should issue some supporting policies for local businesses (e.g. simple licensing procedures, preferential credit, tax exemption for certain period, etc.)

4.2.2. Recommendations for local governments

- A shift towards the market economy at different pace has been set in policy documents and five year socio-economic development plans for the period 2011-2015 of Ninh Thuan province, as well of Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts. It is encouraging that the above mentioned documents have also set a clear goal of enhancing the scale and productivity of agricultural production of common products of Raglai people (maize, rice, water buffaloes, cows, pigs and chicken). What local governments, especially district and commune People’s Committees, need to do now is to prepare its annual SED plans with specific measures and activities, as well as with corresponding resource allocation and implementation responsibility.

- It is necessary to renovate the process and procedures of local SED planning at all levels taking account of market economy principles, identifies most potential value chains of local
products for intensification of its specialised production, and links them with broader domestic markets. By doing so, Raglai farmers will have an opportunity to gradually participate in relevant market value chains.

- Current planning of local agricultural products should not be prepared in a general way, rather it should be done specifically on the basis of in-depth and comparative analysis of main products of Ninh Thuan province as well as of two districts.

- There should be a sound inter-sectoral approach to local SED planning that integrates different resources into local SED plans: investments in infrastructure, completing land planning and land use certification, improving agricultural extension and veterinary services at both district and commune level … with a goal of helping Raglai people develop their production process so that they can earn more for a better life and chances for for market opportunities.

- Concerning the implementation of poverty reduction policies it is recommended that local governments make a right balance between provision of direct support (giving) and improving access to the markets for poor people (development). In order to do so, local governments in Ninh Thuan need to: i) identify and classify target groups among Raglai communities – who actually need aid, and who need just knowledge and credit for their economic activities; ii) enhance capacity of local cadres (extension worker, veterinarian, WU officers, etc…) who work directly with Raglai communities. Besides common technical knowledge, these officers also need to be equipped with basic knowledge on market economy.

- To issue specific supporting policies for Raglai women, and avoid the gap, in which WU is the only responsible organisation to involve in poverty reduction and development for Raglai women.

- To conduct campaigns and training courses on new productive knowledge and skills for Raglai people with the hope of being able to promote commodity production. Grassroots cadres (commune and village officers) should be trained and act as core groups for these activities. Promote models of “excellent households in doing economy” through forming and running clubs, interest groups in villages and communes. In terms of effectiveness and gender sensitivity, it is important to organise training courses and different activities in villages so that more women can participate. Local language should be used to help people understand better training contents). Local mass organisations and OGB can play an active role in these matters.

- To make best use of favourable conditions including natural resources, newly built reservoirs and canal systems to expand scale of farming and breeding for Raglai people (maize, rice, beans, cow, pig, chicken, etc…).

- PWEL: to establish a pilot of women production groups in Raglai communities in which local female officers play a pivotal role. They can start with production of some local products of high market demands (cow, chicken, pig, fruits).

- District and commune WU and FA can pilot some business models (groups or households of Raglai people) that supply inputs for agricultural production (seeds, fertilisers, tools, etc…) and buy products. Provincial and district PCs to issue favourable policies for these special
businesses (provision of business training and preferential credit, and applying tax exemption for first 3-5 years, etc…).

4.2.3. Recommendations for Oxfam Great Britain

Broad interventions:

- Oxfam’s mission is to work with other to eradicate poverty and suffering. Thus, OGB needs to define its role and functions towards Raglai communities in Ninh Thuan for the period 2011-2015. The research team is of the opinion that **OGB should play a bridging role between Raglai communities and local government in order to ensure that rights and interests of the former are fully realised. OGB needs to provide continuing support to Raglai communities, especially women in implementing poverty reduction and socio-economic development activities with clearer market orientation. Participation and capacity building for communities and grassroots partners should be the main approaches.**

- In order to fulfill the above-mentioned objectives, on the one hand OGB needs to work closely with local government partner at various levels, in particular with PCs, Planning, Agricultural and Industrial sectors to ensure that matters of concern with Raglai people are put into local SED plans and implemented properly. On the other hand, OGB needs to continue its strong partnership with WU and grassroots governments, and work closely with Raglai communities in implementing development activities, applying participatory and gender sensitive approaches, introducing and fostering new development initiatives for poverty reduction and market access.

- OGB should consider a good coordination with other international organisations working in Ninh Thuan (e.g. IFAD, UNICEF…) in order to ensure a good synergy of development initiatives. One area is to help local governments in Ninh Thuan, particularly in project areas with large Raglai communities, to improve their SED planning towards the market orientation and strong participation of all stakeholders.

- It is advised that OGB evaluates results of its current interventions in Ninh Thuan (projects RVNA60 and RVNA63), draws useful lessons before designing new development interventions for Raglai communities for the period 2011-2015.

- Though OGB’s new strategy of market oriented poverty reduction is in the right track, its realisation is not simple because the level of market development of Raglai people (including of local government officers) in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac district is very low. Therefore, OGB should consider implementing in tandem traditional community development approaches (rural development and Poverty reduction) with a new market-oriented approach (commodity production).

- Key OGB partners for the period 2011-2015 include the current “traditional partners” such as PCs and Agricultural sector (extension, veterinary, water); WU, FA, YO; commune and village officers; interest groups; national consultants. In addition, there should be new partners such as district sections for Finance and Planning, Industry and Trade (play key roles in local SED planning, setting market orientation and providing support to local businesses); local businesses (suppliers of inputs and buyers of local products); other
international organisations active in Ninh Thuan province with whom OGB can work on advocacy and share experiences, etc...

- Working approaches: advocacy and campaign, provision of technical support, capacity building for both partners and communities, piloting new development models/initiatives, monitoring and evaluation, networking and information sharing.

- OGB needs to work with local government in building a pool of development workers with good understanding of rural markets. This means that commune and village officers (PC, WU, FA, YO...) will be trained and updated with knowledge and information on community development under the conditions of market economy. For that purpose OGB can use national consultants in fields of development, poverty reduction, gender and market economy.... They will provide consultancy services (research, surveys, M&E and training) for local partners and people.

- OGB needs to work with communes on detailed plans to improve capacity of technical staff (extension staff, veterinarians) as well as of mass organisation officers so that they will be capable of helping Raglai women participate better in socio-economic development processes, contribute more actively to improving their family economy.

- OGB needs to work with relevant local government agencies (PCs, Planning, Industry and Trade, Agriculture) and with mass organisations (WU, FA, YO...) on a roadmap and conditions to help realise PWEL and better participation of Raglai women in developing local value chains.

**Specific Interventions:**

- Conduct participatory poverty assessment (PPA) in combination with rapid market assessment (RMA) exercises of project sites in Ninh Thuan province in order to identify big development problems, potentials, opportunities and threats, as well as reasons and priorities for poverty reduction, rural development and market development. It is advised OGB should implement these activities at the same time with the evaluation of its interventions in Ninh Thuan during the period 2006-2010: this should be conducted end 2010 or the first half of 2011 at the latest.

- Based on the information gathered from the above exercises and on OGB’s Country Strategy for the period 2011-2015, OGB should develop its Strategy for Ninh Thuan for the period 2011-2015 with participation of OGB staff, key partners in Ninh Thuan and national consultants: first half of 2011.

- Some main activities recommended for OGB’s programme in Ninh Thuan during the period 2011-2015:

  1. *Continue poverty reduction interventions for Raglai people* in which local governments and communities play a key role (allocating and stabilising cultivated land, providing preferential credit and production techniques for cultivation of crops and animal, improving infrastructure, capacity building for grassroots cadres, etc...) OGB and mass organisation play a catalist and supplementary role (policy advocacy with provincial and district governments, promoting and applying participatory and gender sensitive approaches, piloting new development initiatives for poverty
reduction and accessing markets...) OGB should consider continue activities of RVNA60 and RVNA63, but within a framework of a single project only.

2. **Enhance capacity** on community mobilisation, participation, economic activities for both grassroots partners and communities, however, priority should be given to women officers and Raglai women.

3. **Strengthen partnership and networking:** one of important tasks for OGB is to ensure the realisation of government poverty reduction and development policies in local communities, particularly in Raglai communities. In order to accomplish this task effectively and efficiently, it is advised that OGB works closely with international organisations, mass organisations, researchs and local communities. OGB needs to understand well what other international organisations are doing in Ninh Thuan so that they can design supplementary activities and not overlapping with other activities.

4. **Help Raglai people and women have a better access to the markets:** to help them become aware of commodity production, and know calculation of production costs. It should start first with “relevant” Raglai people such as local officers and better off households, as role models. OGB can implement this kind of activity by working closely with local government and mass organisations (WU, FA, YO...), hiring national consultants to work on value chains of local agricultural products, piloting new development initiatives (promoting models of farming economy and interest grups).

   Raglai people need only improve production of their traditional products with good market potentials such as water buffaloes, cows, black pigs, chicken, beans, fruits, maize, etc..., and OGB can help them in applying new production techniques to increase productivity and outputs.

5. In order to pilot **WEL for Raglai women** OGB should consider designing a new project with WU in two districts with an objective of building some pilots in villages where Raglai people and Raglai women can run same business activities currently managed by Kinh and Cham people (supplying input materials and services for planting rice and maize, raising cows, black pigs and chicken). After 2-3 years, this project should be evaluated and its possibility of replication be assessed. Potential targeted groups are current female officers, retired Raglai officers and young people with good technical and productive knowledge. WU and local government can play an important supporting role: provision of technical knowledge and skills, preferential credit...

6. **Gender issue:** OGB works with WU and domestic consultants on raising gender awareness for not only Raglai women, but more importantly, for local male officers and Raglai men. In addition, encouragement and mobilisation of Raglai women’s participation in communities events is another area of priorised work.

7. **Community development:** OGB needs to focus on promoting good traditional values of Raglai people, and gradually abolishing backward customs.
8. *Other OGB traditional activities*: emergency preparedness and aid, small-scale infrastructure projects, etc...

9. *For specific recommendations on three value chains: see Annexes 1, 2 and 3*

- Participatory project planning, M&E (annual, quarterly and monthly)
- Documentation of best practices and lessons learnt, information sharing domestically and internationally...

4.3. Conclusions

Approach to poverty reduction for ethnic minority people which is based on market-oriented production development and promoting WEL, is a right approach. If applied successfully it will not only help local government officers and people overcoming the mentality of dependence and relying on outside support, but more importantly, it will also help mobilising local internal resources for economic development, improvements in living conditions and integration with mainstream development.

However, application of this approach with Ragali people in the two districts of Thuan Bac and Bac Ai, Ninh Thuan province is not simple, rather it requires times and concerted efforts of all stakeholders including local government, mass organisations, businesses and people. International organisations including Oxfam Great Britain certainly have a vital role to play in this undertaking.

At present, the markets for traditional agricultural products of Raglai people in Thuan Bac and Bac Ai districts are still very small, but the potential of its development in the future is really great, as shown by results of this reaserach. Raglai women, though facing many dificulties in assuming their economic leading role, will be capable to do so with support from the above mentioned actors and with their own efforts.

For Oxfam Great Britain as a renown international development organisation with vast experience and capacity, its commitment to help Raglai communities and Raglai women will play a crucial role in attaining and ensuring their progress and women’s economic leadership.
V. ANNEXES

ANNEX 1: COW VALUE CHAIN

ANNEX 2: BLACK PIG VALUE CHAIN

ANNEX 3: MAIZE VALUE CHAIN

(files attached)
## ANNEX 4: TOOL FOR IDENTIFYING LOCAL MAIN PRODUCTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Core criteria</th>
<th>Secondary criteria</th>
<th>Product 1</th>
<th>Product 2</th>
<th>Product 3</th>
<th>Product 4</th>
<th>Product 5</th>
<th>Product n</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Has good potential of market development</td>
<td>Easy to sale (high market demand, many collectors come to buy…)</td>
<td>Good price and profit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Raglai women’s participation and benefiting</td>
<td>Many Raglai women can participate in</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bring about stable income to Raglai women</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Contributing to improvement of people’s life, especially poor Raglai people</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Create jobs for local people, especially poor people</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Poor people can participate easily (low requirements of capital, technique, suitable to local customs, etc…)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Low harmful effects on the environment and efficient use of natural resources</td>
<td>Production and trade of product do not create harmful effects on the environment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Make efficient use of locally available natural resources (land, water, forest…)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. Possible intervention of the WEL programme

Relevant to the goals of the WEL programme (encouraging Raglai people participate in value chains and earn for their living)

Raglai women are the owners of businesses (in their villages)

6. Relevance to local SED directions

Product is on the list of priorities for period 2006-2010

Product is on the list of priorities for period 2011 – 2015.

Total points (10 point mark)

Ranking
## ANNEX 5: LIST OF INTERVIEWED OFFICERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Office</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Provincial Level</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Vu Minh Tuyen</td>
<td>Vice- Director</td>
<td>Department of Planning and Investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Ho Van Hung</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Department of Natural Resources and Environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Huynh Thi Phuong</td>
<td>Manager</td>
<td>Provincial WU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Le Van Nguyen</td>
<td>Vice- Director</td>
<td>Department of Industry and Trade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Nguyen Van Ket</td>
<td>Deputy Manager</td>
<td>Department of Industry and Trade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Nguyen Tin</td>
<td>Manager</td>
<td>DARD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Nguyen Van Tinh</td>
<td>Manager</td>
<td>DARD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Thuan Bac District</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Nguyen Phi Long</td>
<td>Vice – Chairman</td>
<td>Thuan Bac DPC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Nguyen Duc Hung</td>
<td>Head</td>
<td>Section of Agricultural and Rural Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Nguyen Hung</td>
<td>Head</td>
<td>Section of Finance and Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Pinang Thi Hon</td>
<td>Chairperson</td>
<td>District WU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Tran Phung</td>
<td>Chair</td>
<td>District FA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Nguyen Thi Tot</td>
<td>Vice – Chairperson</td>
<td>WU of Loi Hai commune</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 Tran Thi Nhu Anh</td>
<td>Chair</td>
<td>FA of Loi Hai commune</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 Nguyen Thi Hanh</td>
<td>Extension Officer</td>
<td>Loi Hai commune</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 Le Huu Tu</td>
<td>Vice - Chairman</td>
<td>Loi Hai Commune People’s Committee (CPC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bac Ai District</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 Vo Khanh Khang</td>
<td>Vice – Chairman</td>
<td>Bac Ai DPC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 Tran Thi Van</td>
<td>Administrative Chief</td>
<td>Bac Ai DPC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19 Hoang Van Dang</td>
<td>Vice- Administrative Chief</td>
<td>Bac Ai DPC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 Nguyen Van Cuong</td>
<td>Head</td>
<td>Section of Finance and Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21 Truong Tho Toan</td>
<td>Vice - Chair</td>
<td>District FA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22 Do Thi Bich Lien</td>
<td>Vice - Chair</td>
<td>District WU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Name of householders</td>
<td>Hamlet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Pinang Hoan</td>
<td>Cha Dung</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Pi Lao Cach</td>
<td>Cha Dung</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Kator Thi Tranh</td>
<td>Cha Dung</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Pinang Xanh</td>
<td>Cha Dung</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Chamalea Tam</td>
<td>Cha Dung</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Kator Huong</td>
<td>Cha Dung</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Kator Quang</td>
<td>Cha Dung</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Kator Dong</td>
<td>Cha Dung</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Kator Dung</td>
<td>Cha Dung</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Kator Thi Bien</td>
<td>Cha Dung</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Pi Lao Buoc</td>
<td>Cha Dung</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Pinang Anh</td>
<td>Cha Dung</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Pa Tơ A Sa Thi Nhım</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Pa Tơ A Sa Thi Linh</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Village</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Pa To A Sac Thi Khoa</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Chamalea Xuo</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Chamalea Han</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Patau Axa Thi Nghiem</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Patau Axa Thi Tam</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Chamalea Sam</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Chamalea Thi Nanh</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Chamalea Thi Thu</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Chamalea Sinh</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Chamalea Them</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Kator Thai</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Maize production households**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Village</th>
<th>District</th>
<th>Province</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Pinang Thi Hut</td>
<td>Da Trang</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Pinang Son</td>
<td>Da Trang</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Kator Tuan</td>
<td>Da Trang</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Pinang Thi Linh</td>
<td>Da Trang</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Chamalea Thi Ut</td>
<td>Da Trang</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Pinang Nhieiu</td>
<td>Da Trang</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Pinang Thi Tinh</td>
<td>Da Trang</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Pilau Thuong</td>
<td>Da Trang</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Chamalea Xung</td>
<td>Da Trang</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Pinang Pang</td>
<td>Da Trang</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Pinang Thi Phem</td>
<td>Da Trang</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Pinang Phong</td>
<td>Da Trang</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Pinang Thi Ha</td>
<td>Da Trang</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pinang Anh</td>
<td>Cha Dung</td>
<td>Phuoc Thang</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Kator Dong</td>
<td>Cha Dung</td>
<td>Phuoc Thang</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Chamalea Tam</td>
<td>Cha Dung</td>
<td>Phuoc Thang</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Kator Thi Guong</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Kator Thi Kham</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Kator Thi Sach</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Chamalea Thi Thi</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Chamalea Thi Hem</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Kator Thi Huong</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Kator Thuoc</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Pinang Ngoc</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Pinang Thi Xem</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Kator Thi Kiem</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Kator Xuan</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Pinang Xuat</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Kator Xuan</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Kator Thi Nghien</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Chamlea Thi Phinh</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Pinang Tong</td>
<td>Ma Ty</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Black pig raising households**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Chamalea Thi Lu</th>
<th>Suoi Da</th>
<th>Loi Hai</th>
<th>Thuan Bac</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Chamalea Thi Mai</td>
<td>Suoi Da</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Ta Xa The</td>
<td>Suoi Da</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Chamalea Thi Tim</td>
<td>Suoi Da</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Chamalea Thi Bi</td>
<td>Suoi Da</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Village</td>
<td>District</td>
<td>Province</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Chamalea Thi Xo</td>
<td>Suoi Da</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Chamalea Thi My</td>
<td>Suoi Da</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Chamalea Thuong</td>
<td>Suoi Da</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Kator Chanh</td>
<td>Suoi Da</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Chamalea Sang</td>
<td>Suoi Da</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Pa Tau Xa Thi</td>
<td>Suoi Da</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Chamalea Do</td>
<td>Suoi Da</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Tala Thi Mai Quy</td>
<td>Kien Kien 2</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Chamalea Hai</td>
<td>Kien Kien 2</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Tala Bin</td>
<td>Kien Kien 2</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Chamalea Thi No</td>
<td>Kien Kien 2</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Kator Nhu</td>
<td>Kien Kien 2</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### ANNEX 7: LIST OF INTERVIEWED VALUE CHAIN ACTORS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Commune</th>
<th>District</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cattle value chain Actors</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Tran Van Thanh</td>
<td>Collector</td>
<td>Phuoc Dai</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Ngo Thi My Dung</td>
<td>Retailer in market</td>
<td>Phuoc Dai</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Le Cong Chanh</td>
<td>Collector</td>
<td>Tan Son Township</td>
<td>Ninh Son</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Nguyen Thanh Trung</td>
<td>Slaughter-house</td>
<td>Tan Son Township</td>
<td>Ninh Son</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Nguyen Van Hai (Kieu)</td>
<td>Slaughter-house</td>
<td>Tan Son Township</td>
<td>Ninh Son</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Nguyen Van Mung</td>
<td>Slaughter-house</td>
<td>Tan Son Township</td>
<td>Ninh Son</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Nguyen Thi Loan</td>
<td>Slaughter-house</td>
<td></td>
<td>Phan Rang-Thap Cham City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Maize value chain Actors</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Pupu Thi Dieu</td>
<td>Collector</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Pinang Thi Ngheo</td>
<td>Collector</td>
<td>Phuoc Tan</td>
<td>Bac Ai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Nguyen Thi Hai</td>
<td>Collector</td>
<td>Tan Son Town</td>
<td>Ninh Son</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Black pig value chain Actors</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Nguyen Thi Dao</td>
<td>Collector</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Tran Van Ba (Diep)</td>
<td>Collector</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Tran Van Hoa</td>
<td>Collector</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Nguyen Thi Hoa</td>
<td>Slaughter-house</td>
<td>Loi Hai</td>
<td>Thuan Bac</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
REFERENCES


13. Oxfam GB: RVNA60 Project Document


15. 2009 Statistics Yearbook, Thuan Bac District

16. 2009 Statistics Yearbook, Bac Ai District

17. 2009 Statistics Yearbook, Ninh Thuan Province


