REPORT

Final Evaluation of the Project “Enhancing Market Access and Promoting Economic Leadership for Raglai Women in Ninh Thuan Province” (RVNA93 Project)

Ha Noi, April 2015
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The evaluation team expresses its sincere thanks to all Oxfam staff, especially to Mr. Mai The Long, Livelihood Programme Officer, for his effective collaboration, technical and logistical support in conducting the evaluation.

We are deeply thankful to members of District Project Coordinating Committees, as well as to staff of related departments and mass organisations of Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts for their involvement and help during the field work, and for their valuable contributions to this report.

Last but not least, the evaluation team expresses its special thanks to the members of Communal Management Boards, joint interest groups and people in Phuoc Tien, Phuoc Tan and Loi Hai communes for their great enthusiasm and collaboration during the field mission.

On behalf of the evaluation team,

Team leader

MA. Vu Ngoc Anh,
Director, Centre for Sustainable Development Policy Studies (CSDP)
TABLE OF CONTENT

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT ........................................................................................................... 2

TABLE OF CONTENT .......................................................................................................... 3

List of tables, boxes and charts .......................................................................................... 5

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS .................................................................................... 6

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY ...................................................................................................... 7

I. INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................. 11

I.1 Brief information of the project .................................................................................. 11

I.2 Objectives of the evaluation ...................................................................................... 15

I.3 Contents of the evaluation ......................................................................................... 16

I.4 Methodology ................................................................................................................ 16

I.5 The evaluation process ............................................................................................. 16

I.6 Some limitations of the evaluation .......................................................................... 17

II. MAIN FINDINGS ........................................................................................................... 17

II.1 General findings ....................................................................................................... 17

II.2 Specific findings ....................................................................................................... 23

Project contribution to local social and economic development (SED) ......................... 23

Project’s most appreciated activities ............................................................................. 25

Project’s unsuccessful activities .................................................................................... 28

II.3 Project relevance ..................................................................................................... 29

Right targeting .................................................................................................................. 29

Scientific and appropriate approach ............................................................................. 29

Need to distinguish and combine two main target groups .......................................... 29

II.4 Project efficiency ..................................................................................................... 30

Incremental improvements in household production and income .................................. 30

II.5 Project equality ........................................................................................................ 31

Ensuring equality ............................................................................................................ 31

Little change in decision making ................................................................................... 32
II.6 Project impacts .................................................................................................................. 33
II.7 Project sustainability and replicability ............................................................................. 35
Keeping the current joint interest groups with active members as its core ....................... 35
Results of Oxfam’s policy advocacy work .......................................................................... 36
II.8 Project management and partnership ............................................................................ 36
Project management ........................................................................................................... 36
Partnership between Oxfam and local partners ............................................................... 37
II.9 Project constraints .......................................................................................................... 38

III. SOME LESSONS LEARNT AND RECOMMENDATIONS ........................................... 39
III.1 Lessons learnt ............................................................................................................... 39
III.2 Common recommendations ........................................................................................ 39
III.3 Recommendations for Bac Ai district ......................................................................... 40
III.4 Recommendations for Thuan Bac district .................................................................. 40
III.5 Recommendations for Oxfam ...................................................................................... 41

IV. CONCLUSION .................................................................................................................. 41

V. ANNEXES ......................................................................................................................... 42
1. Case studies ...................................................................................................................... 42
2 Terms of reference .......................................................................................................... 46
3. Field mission plan and schedule (from 31st March to 3rd April 2015) ......................... 50
4. List of interviewees and group discussion participants ................................................. 53
5. Project M&E indicators ................................................................................................. 58
6. Detailed assessment of project results ......................................................................... 62

VI. LITERATURE .................................................................................................................... 68
List of table, boxes and charts

Table 1.1 Project beneficiaries ........................................................................................................ 15
Table 2.1 Number and types of black pigs raised by group members in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts ........................................................................................................................................ 22
Table 2.2 Members’ ranking of project activities .................................................................................. 27

Box 2.1 Assessment of Output 1.1 ................................................................................................... 17
Box 2.2 “If I can do it, anybody can!” .............................................................................................. 18
Box 2.3 Assessment of Output 1.2 .................................................................................................. 19
Box 2.4 Assessment of Output 2.1 .................................................................................................. 19
Box 2.5 Assessment of Output 2.2 .................................................................................................. 20
Box 2.6 Assessment of Outcome 3 .................................................................................................. 21
Box 2.7 Chapi Dream ...................................................................................................................... 33

Chart 2.1 Contribution of different programme/project to investment in Phuoc Tien Commune in 2013 ................................................................................................................................. 24
Chart 2.2 The ways Raglai people prevent and treat pig diseases ...................................................... 25
## ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CPC</td>
<td>Communal People’s Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPMU</td>
<td>Communal Project Management Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSDP</td>
<td>Centre for Sustainable Development Policy Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CWU</td>
<td>Communal Women’s Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DARD</td>
<td>Department of Agriculture and Rural Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPC</td>
<td>District People’s Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPCB</td>
<td>District Project Coordinating Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DWU</td>
<td>District Women’s Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FFS</td>
<td>Farmer Field School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GALS/WEMAN</td>
<td>Oxfam’s Gender Action Learning System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HH</td>
<td>Household</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IEC</td>
<td>Information, Education and Communications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PO</td>
<td>Programme Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PWEL</td>
<td>Poor Women Economic Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PWU</td>
<td>Provincial Women’s Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SED</td>
<td>Social and Economic Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOT</td>
<td>Terms of Reference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VND</td>
<td>Vietnamese Dong (currency unit)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WU</td>
<td>Women’s Union</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The project “Enhancing Market Access and Promoting Economic Leadership for Raglai Women in Ninh Thuan Province” (Ninh Thuan PWEL or RVNA93 Project), was funded by Oxfam and implemented for the period 2011 – 2015. The project’s overall objective was “to improve the economic and social status of 3,000 Raglai women in Ninh Thuan province”, together with three expected outcomes – Outcome 1: Increased income for 3,000 Raglai women and their families (of which 1,000 were direct beneficiaries and 2,000 indirect beneficiaries); Outcome 2: Improved status and roles among Raglai women within their families, communities; and Outcome 3: Government’s plans and programmes have incorporated specific measures and actions to support smallholder producers and enterprises. After four years of implementation Oxfam and its partners in Ninh Thuan contracted a team of consultants\(^1\) to conduct project evaluation in order to: i) measure project achievements/ failures and changes against designed objectives/ expected outcomes, and evaluate partnership between partners & Oxfam; ii) document good/bad practices and lessons learnt from the project for better application by Raglai ethnic women & policy advocacy; and iii) propose concrete recommendations for similar future projects or improving Raglai ethnic women’s leadership and better market access.

Some main findings from the evaluation:

1. Based on the project records, and its impacts on Raglai communities and local partners in general, and on Raglai women in particular, one can conclude the project RVNA93 has achieved its set objectives and results. Of the three expected Outcomes the achievement of the Outcome 1 was most satisfactory, followed by Outcome 2 and Outcome 3. The number of direct beneficiaries – members of joint interest groups and their family reached over 1,000 people\(^2\); the number of indirect beneficiaries was estimated at least equal or even exceeding the number of direct beneficiaries because of the broad coverage of so-called information, communications and education (IEC) campaigns. (For more details see Annex 6).

2. The project achieved some very encouraging results and helped Raglai women improve their status and role in family and communities. 22 joint interest groups were established and/or consolidated with over 300 members, most of whom are poor Raglai women. Group members managed to meet regularly once a month and deposited small amounts of money, as savings, to so-called group revolving funds. The capacity of Raglai women in agricultural production, doing business and accessing market has been improved. However, it is necessary to stress here that the results achieved so far were just initial, and there is still need for continuous and concerted efforts from all stakeholders to make the changes more permanent.

---

\(^1\) The evaluation team consists of Mr. Vu Ngoc Anh, team leader, and Mr. Hoang Xuan Truong, Ms Dao Hoang Mai and Mr. Duong Thanh Trung, team members.

\(^2\) The calculation is based on an assumption that each Raglai family has in average 4-5 members.
3. The project was relevant in terms of approach and target groups. Despite several existing constraints - some ambitious targets, short implementation time, limited budget and coverage, different management modalities, etc., the RVNA93 project has demonstrated a very effective approach to help ethnic minority people in general, and Raglai women in particular, to overcome poverty and improve their economic and social status. Several innovative pilot models have been introduced and helped them apply modern techniques in, and access the markets for their black pig commodities.

4. In general, the project equality was ensured as Raglai women were the main target group. However, the fact that most project activities focused on women and rarely involved men, led to a situation where the application of activities at the household level faced difficulties because men, as main labour force, were unaware of necessary information and thus could not do well. In the context of Raglai communities, the project should consider men as one of main target groups - they need to get involved more actively in household economy and thus will able help Raglai women reduce their workload, and have more time to rest and learn. Besides, young Raglai people aged 15-25 also need to be involved in project implementation as they are capable of learning new things and accessing markets.

5. The project contribution to local social and economic development (SED), though positive, was rather modest compared to the contributions of government programmes/policies, and the efforts made by local government and people. However, the Oxfam’s approach to poverty reduction seems more effective than the government one. 100% of interviewed partners explained it was because the Oxfam approach was practical, scientific, participatory and community/beneficiary-centred. The project planning was bottom-up and participatory, thus it met people’s needs and made use of local advantages. Activities carried out in form of training of trainers (TOT) and farmer field school (FFS), etc. helped majority of trainees including Raglai women understand what the trainers wanted to convey, and then apply in their production.

6. Some of the project’s most appreciated activities include i) capacity building support to group members (e.g. technical training, regular group meetings, support to active Raglai producers to attend trade fairs, study tours, group production planning by applying GALS/WEMAN method, etc); ii) policy dialogues on local economic development, development of small and medium enterprises/cooperatives/groups between groups members and representatives of local government; iii) in-kind support (e.g. supply of breeding piglets and materials for building pig cages, financial support to some active members to start their business models, etc.). Besides, some planned activities under the Component 4 “Market development for local produce” such as support to group leaders and excellent producers to attend provincial/district workshops or fora on relevant sub-sectors; workshop on “Finding sustainable outputs for black pig products” in Phuoc Tien commune; introduction of local agricultural products to supermarkets and restaurants, etc. failed to realise and were replaced by hiring national consultant “to evaluate and research
the sustainable output market for black pigs products; and to develop production plan and business plan for black pig raising.”

7. **The project has very positive impacts on beneficiaries and local partners.** First, awareness on application of modern production techniques and accessing market of Raglai people in general, and of group members in particular, has changed positively. All interviewed – project partners and beneficiaries, considered it the most significant change. After attending training courses and practising, many Raglai people know, for the first time, how to calculate production costs and income, how to buy and sell goods in order to generate profit, how to inquire commodity price and bargain/participate in regular market sessions/use scales, etc. In the past, Raglai people tended to raise black pigs as reserved asset - they only used pigs for family feasts or in case of need for cash. Participating in, and selling goods at, local market place has become a new habit of many group members and their families. Second, Raglai women have become more active and braver at the community/social events (e.g. group meetings, training, village meetings, etc.) by voicing their opinions. Third, the Ninh Thuan black pig has been advertised consistently to markets inside and outside the province. In Bac Ai district there is an outlet which signs contracts on buying pigs from group members, and selling it to buyers in Da Lat town; a similar outlet is operating in Thuan Bac district, which buys pigs from group members and supplies them to Vung Tau and Nha Trang markets. Last but not least are changes in attitudes and behaviours of partner staff – they have become more capable in dealing with their tasks, knowing how to plan, listen and apply participatory approach, etc.

8. **Possible activities which can be maintained after the project ended:** i) interviewed group members shared their belief that although the Oxfam project had finished, most group activities (e.g. group meetings, selling goods at local market places, black pig raising, deposit of savings to group revolving fund, etc.) would continue; ii) district partners mentioned about incorporating project positive aspects into government development programmes/projects in Ninh Thuan province such as Programme 30a (e.g. piloting support to better-off HHs to access markets); Tam Nong project (e.g. establishing cow pig and banana groups, commune participatory and market-oriented development planning, etc.); iii) trained and experienced local partners and active group members are expected to apply participatory approach in their work.

**Some recommendations:**

1. Project beneficiaries – Raglai ethnic women and people, fall into the poorest group in Vietnam and face with a host of difficulties (e.g. backward traditions and habits, harsh natural conditions, low capacity of applying modern production techniques and accessing market, etc.), thus the support to them should be provided in a way that is long term, consistent, and with the involvement of a host of parties – central and local government, international and local organisations, businesses, experts and people. Local governments – People’s Committees from provincial to district and communal level (PPC, DPC and CPC) should consider it their top priority and take part actively, not relying on support from outside organisations.
2. As Raglai communities are matrilineal, working with both women and men, young and elderly people would enable effective application of project activities, and help enhancing its impacts.

3. Bac Ai and Thuan Bac DPC, as well as CPCs in two districts should consider application and replication of good practices of the Oxfam project (e.g. establishing and maintaining regular meetings of joint interest groups; implementation of relevant capacity building activities for Raglai people in agricultural production, business skills and accessing market including participatory planning, farmer field school (FFS) training modality and GALS/WEMAN training; policy dialogue, etc.). They should make best use of the current active members (e.g. CPC, WU, groups), and consider a broader range of support (e.g. cow raising, crop planting), not just black pig raising.

4. In order to maintain and upgrade black pig interest groups (e.g. supplying breeding piglets, credit for group revolving funds, upgrading the quality of the communal veterinary system, establishing village network of veterinary collaborators, supporting good producers to participate provincial/district trade fairs, etc.), partners in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts should consider combining use of resources from other existing programmes/projects such as Tam Nong Project, New Rural Programme, Programme 30a, Poverty Reduction Programme 2016-2020, etc.

5. Oxfam needs to organise documenting and sharing good experience of the RVNA93 project implementation for both local partners in Ninh Thuan province, as well for other interested organisations and individuals at the national level.
I. INTRODUCTION

I.1 Brief information of the project

The Project “Enhancing Market Access and Promoting Economic Leadership for Raglai Women in Ninh Thuan Province” (Ninh Thuan PWEL project, code name RVNA93), was funded by Oxfam for the period 2011 – 2015 with a total budget of £260,000 (equivalent to VND 8.6 bn). The project was designed with a goal to develop the economic leadership for Raglai women - a matrilineal community in three communes namely Phuoc Tan and Phuoc Tien (in Bac Ai district) and Loi Hai (in Thuan Bac district) through supporting commodity production and business orientation; and enhancing opportunities to engage with the markets, and play an active role in household economic activities.

According to the project document Bac Ai is the poorest district of Ninh Thuan province and the home of the largest Raglai community - 94% of the total population of 24,350 people are Raglai people. The poverty rate in 2009 was staggering at 54%, and Bac Ai is one of 62 poorest districts in Vietnam entitled to receive special support under the government Programme 30a. The district has quite a large area of agricultural land (92,200 ha) and 10,000 ha of which is cultivated land (in average 0.42 ha per head). However, the soil quality is very poor and only 20-25% of agricultural land is well irrigated. In addition, a large portion of cultivated land has recently been taken for construction of irrigation systems and hydropower stations. Thuan Bac districtis situated about 10km north of Phan Rang – Thap Cham city. It has a total land area of 31,924 ha and population of 37,850 people and 90% of whom are farmers. Similar to Bac Ai, the Raglai are the main ethnic group here - in some communes like Phuoc Khang and Phuoc Chien they account for almost 100% of the local population. Average cultivated land per head is about a half of the Bac Ai average, and it is almost impossible to expand further. On the other hand, Thuan Bac has a very good irrigation system that supplies water up to 70% of its wet rice cultivated area.

Both districts have natural topography suitable for livestock raising, crop planting and forestation. Forestland is quite large - accounts for four fifth of the Bac Ai district, and about a half of the area of Thuan Bac district. However, harsh climate conditions (e.g. frequent draught, very low level of precipitation and long dry season, etc,) cause scarcity of water for agricultural production as well as for daily consumption of the local population.

The Oxfam’s starting point for poor women economic leadership (PWEL) is that it is considered as a right of women – e.g women have the right to participate equally and fully and enjoy equal control in the economy. Oxfam also bases this work on a fundamental economic argument: gender inequality slows economic growth, and conversely, gender equality can increase the productivity of investments in agriculture and other livelihood initiatives. PWEL involves women gaining both economic and social power to move out of poverty. This means securing economic resources and gaining power in markets whilst
changing attitudes and beliefs so as to enable equal relations with men and equality in economic decision making – at the individual, household, community or wider level.\textsuperscript{3}

The project overall objective was “By 2015, 3000 Raglai women in Ninh Thuan province have gained a greater economic status and social roles in comparison to men within their communities and society,” and the project set out the following specific objectives:

- to enhance women’s knowledge and skills in commodity production and market-oriented approach;
- to strengthen Raglai women’s power in economic relations through promoting cooperation of medium and small production/business groups;
- to develop local commodity production and markets through policy advocacy and direct support to enterprises and producer groups; and
- to promote change in labour division between men and women in the family in order to facilitate women taking part in economic activities, and generating a greater family income.

Three expected outcomes were set with following outputs:

Outcome 1: Increased income for 3,000 Raglai women and their families.
- Output 1.1: Productive, market & business capacities of Raglai women producers in selected sub-sectors have been improved;
- Output 1.2: Quality and functioning of agricultural services have been strengthened.

Outcome 2: Improved status and roles among Raglai women within their families and communities.
- Output 2.1: Raglai men have played a more active role in household economic development, and in sharing of domestic chores;
- Output 2.2: Raglai women have been more active and have stronger voice and better positions in communal formal institutions;
- Output 2.3: Capacity of women organisations in terms of women’s economic leadership has been enhanced.

Outcome 3: Government’s plans and programmes have incorporated specific measures and actions to support smallholder producers and enterprises.
- Output 3.1: Awareness of local government on women’s economic ownership right and capacity has been improved;
- Output 3.2: Smallholder enterprises have developed strategic plans reflecting their views as inputs into government programmes.

Project components:
During the 1\textsuperscript{st} phase (2011-2013) the project implemented six components:

\textsuperscript{3} RVNA93 Project Document
- Component 1: Organisation of gendered market mapping and selection studies and project design;
- Component 2: Capacity building for producer group members;
- Component 3: Improving quality and functioning of veterinary and extension services;
- Component 4: Support for market development;
- Component 5: Improving economic role of women within household and community; and
- Component 6: Advocacy for supportive government policies and programmes for smallholder farmers and enterprises.

Besides, there was an Overheads Component for project partners, which accounted for about 10% of the total project budget. Components 1-4 were supposed to contribute to achieving Outcome 1, whilst Component 5 was supposed to contribute to achieving Outcome 2, and Component 6 was to contribute to achieving Outcome 3.

Since a major revision of its design (in early 2013) until the project end (March 2015) it was decided the project would focus only on developing local black pig production and marketing with the following contents:

- Preparation of group production and business plans;
- Promoting participation of provincial partners in piloting and scaling up new approaches;
- Improving operation of the target producer groups; and
- Policy advocacy.

The first three contents were supposed to contribute to achieving Outcome 1, and the remaining one contributed to achieving Outcome 3 (for more details see Annex 4 – Project M&E Indicators).

**Project partners:** People’s Committees and Women’s Union (WU) at the district and communal level in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts. In addition, the project also worked with provincial Department of Agriculture and Rural Development (DARD) and WU as technical services providers.

- In March 2011, Oxfam signed a three year agreement with the Bac Ai District People’s Committee (DPC) according to which Oxfam committed to support the project implementation in the district during the period 2011-2014 with an estimated funding of £81,270 (equivalent to VND2,675,750,000). This agreement was endorsed by the Ninh Thuan provincial authorities on 24th August 2012 by Decision No.1636/QD-UBND.
- In March 2011, Oxfam also signed another three year agreement with the Thuan Bac DPC and committed to support the project implementation in the district for three
years (2011-2014) with an estimated funding of £80,997 (equivalent to VND2,666,750,000). This agreement was endorsed by the Ninh Thuan provincial authorities on 28th September 2012 by Decision No.1952/QD-UBND.

Though the project size was small, it employed different management mechanisms:

- **At the district level**, there was District Project Coordinating Board (DPCB). The DPCB in Bac Ai district inherited its predecessor of the project RVNA63 and had five members - a Vice DPC Chairman as its head, a Head of DPC Office as deputy head, a DPC staff as coordinator and an accountant. Note there was no representative of District WU (DWU) in the DPCB. The Thuan Bac DPCB was newly established and consisted of seven members - a Vice DPC Chairman as its head, the DWU Chair as deputy head, a DWU Vice-chair as coordinator, together with representatives from the DPC Office, DARD, Department of Economy and Infrastructure, and an accountant. Whilst the Bac Ai DPC coordinated the project implementation, this role was delegated to the Thuan Bac DWU.

- **At the communal level**: Communal Project Management Units (CPMU) were established in two communes of Bac Ai district and involved only CPC members (e.g. the CPC Chair as its head, and a CPC member as secretary). In Loi Hai commune (Thuan Bac District) the project management was fully delegated to DWU and Communal WU, and there was no involvement of CPC. CPMU had responsibilities of supporting DPCB in project planning and implementation, ensuring progress and quality of delegated activities. DPCB met regularly with CPMU every quarter to develop plans, share experience during the project implementation.

- **Partners at the provincial level**: Provincial DARD and WU did not take part directly in project implementation and budget management, but provided it with technical and policy support. For example, DARD was consulted on capacity building needs or some specific plans on strengthening the district extension and veterinary system. DARD and PWU experts were also contracted to provide relevant training courses and technical support. Besides, the project worked with DARD to advocate for incorporation of the PWEL approach into their projects (e.g. the Tam Nong project). PWU provided technical support in enhancing women leadership roles, gender training, communications on gender equality and anti-violence in family, application of so-called Gender Active Learning System (GALS/WEMAN) in group production planning of joint interest groups in two districts.

**Beneficiaries:**
- The direct beneficiaries from the project were the Raglai communities in three selected communes of Thuan Bac and Bac Ai districts, including women, children and

---

4 As shared by Bac Ai project partners the DWU did not have enough personnel to work with the project as about half of its staff were busy taking full time university study at that time.
men. In addition, the project also aimed to support small and medium enterprises working locally in the agricultural sector, agricultural service providers in extension and veterinary so that they would be able to effectively support Raglai people in market-oriented production (see Table 1.1).

Table 1.1 Project beneficiaries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Bac Ai district (02 communes)</th>
<th>Thuan Bac district (01 commune)</th>
<th>Total targeted number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Population</td>
<td>Targeted</td>
<td>Population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total population</td>
<td>5,990</td>
<td>3,007</td>
<td>10,536</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>2,935</td>
<td>1,174</td>
<td>5,163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>3,055</td>
<td>1,833</td>
<td>5,373</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of households</td>
<td>1,375</td>
<td>691</td>
<td>2,549</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Oxfam’s leaflet on the RVNA93 project

Project planning, monitoring and evaluation:

- According to the agreements between Oxfam and its partners, each DPCB prepared annual plans and budgets and submitted to Oxfam for approval. Every change had to be documented and submitted to Oxfam, and Oxfam replied by official document.
- District partners submitted progress and financial reports to Oxfam on a quarterly and annual basis.

I.2 Objectives of the evaluation

- To measure both project achievements and failures and changes against designed objectives/expected outcomes;
- To evaluate partnership between partners & Oxfam;
- To document good and bad practices and lessons learnt from project for better application by Raglai ethnic women & policy advocacy;
- Propose concrete recommendations for similar future projects or improving Raglai ethnic women’s leadership and better market access.
I.3 Contents of the evaluation

The evaluation focused on assessing how project expected outcomes and outputs had been achieved accordingly to the project’s revised logframe. Specifically, the evaluation focused on the following aspects of the project:

- Relevance (with local people’s and partners’ needs as well as with Oxfam’s strategic orientations).
- Efficiency: which activity met or failed expectations.
- Equality: gender and social.
- Sustainability: which activities are likely continued after the project completion.
- Replicability: which activities are likely replicated by project partners into new communes.
- Partnership between Oxfam and its local partners.

I.4 Methodology

- A desk-review of related documents: strategy papers, project documents, reports, database, leaflets, etc. and other sources (e.g. Internet, blogs,...) in order to generate an understanding and overview of project’s context, design, trends and implementation results;
- Individual and group interviews with representatives of local partners at the provincial level (e.g. WU, Tam Nong Project PCU, Agricultural Extension Centre, Veterinary Sub-Department); at the district level (e.g. DPCB, WU, Extension and Veterinary Station); and at the communal level (e.g. CPP Chair and related personnel, CPMU secretary).
- Focused-group discussions with selected participants: beneficiaries in selected communes and villages including women and men from poor ethnic Raglai households. It was suggested 4-5 group discussions (one with communal staff and 3 with villagers) in one selected commune in each of two project’s districts.
- 5-7 case studies of selected project beneficiaries and partners to reflect the positive change brought about by the project.
- Site observations: houses, pig cages, market places, shops, attitudes and behaviours of group members and project partners, etc (see Annex 4).

I.5 The evaluation process

- Oxfam selected an independent consultant team: February 2015.
- Evaluation plan and schedule developed (see Annex 3)

Note: Originally, the project had been designed to provide support to Raglai people in several agricultural production fields – both crop plantation and animal husbandry. However, due to some constraints since 2013 the project only focused on development of black pig and marketing its products.
Field mission in Ninh Thuan province: early April 2015.

I.6 Some limitations of the evaluation

- Relatively short time for field mission;
- Some key project partners were not available due to busy schedule or changes in their position;
- Project partners’ reports were patchy, following different formats and thus made it difficult to compile and do analysis.
- Limited budget.

II. MAIN FINDINGS

II.1 General findings

*Based on the project records and impacts on Raglai communities and local partners in general, and on Raglai women in particular, one can conclude the project RVNA93 has achieved its set objectives and results.* Of the three expected Outcomes, the achievement of Outcome 1 is the most satisfactory, following by Outcome 2 and Outcome 3. The number of direct beneficiaries – members of joint interest groups and their families reached over 1,000 people (the calculation was based on an assumption that in average each Raglai family has 4-5 members); the number of indirect beneficiaries was estimated at least equal or even exceeding the number of direct beneficiaries because of the broad coverage of information, education and communications campaigns. (For more details see Annex 6 – Detailed assessment of project results).

Regarding Output 1.1 “*Productive, market & business capacities of Raglai women producers in selected sub-sectors have been improved*” most set indicators achieved or even exceeded set values (see Box 2.1).

**Box 2.1 Achievement of Output 1.1**

*Indicator 1.1.1 “At least 70% of direct beneficiaries enjoy increase in family income through participating in project activities” was almost achieved* according to partners’ reports (see specific example in Box 2.2).

*Indicator 1.1.2 “Average annual family income of 10% of the total targeted households has increased by 5%” met the set target.* However, one should make clear here that the income increase was a combined result of a host of factors such as government support policies, efforts made by local governments and people, and Oxfam’s contribution.
Indicator 1.1.3 “100% of Raglai women have access to at least one source of market information” clearly met the target, especially considering the members of 22 joint interest groups and their family members.

Indicator 1.1.4 (revised omitting the number of cows) “number of black pig increased by 30% compared to the project first year” exceeded the target (see Table 2.1)

Box 2.2 “If I can do it, anybody can!”

Kator Thi Hong Dep, 22, lives with her husband and their three-year old daughter in Loi Hai commune, Thuan Bac district. In the past, her family’s modest income was generated from growing maize, rice in a land area of 500 sq.m, and a black pig. It covered only 50% of living costs thus their daily meal was rather meager.

One year ago, after participating in two training courses organised by the project on trading skills, price calculation, and organisation skills Dep set up a fruit stall. Now, she has a fruit stall in the village daily market and fast-growing black pigs. Her family is very happy that they have additional incomes from the small business. Her husband works on the field while she sells fruits in the market. “I sell lots of fruits every day, which brings an average income of about VND100,000 and it helps to cover fully our daily living costs - VND20,000 for my daughter’s milk and lunch at school, VND40,000 for better daily meals. The remaining VND40,000 is saved for the future use”. She has been able to build good relationship with other people at the market. She knows how to select good quality fruits and what price to ask for her products. Gaining more and more experience, Dep wants to borrow a loan to expand her business. She also wants to be able to give her customers more information about the products she sells.

“I need more training about the fruits I am selling. I want to give people advice on which fruit to eat – what are their vitamins, and which fruit helps for what kind of illness or improve their health and physical condition.”. Dep wants to encourage other women who just join the project “If I can do it, anybody can! It might be challenging at the beginning but just find a product you want to sell and be confident” she said.

Source: http://www.oxfamblogs.org/vietnam/2015/01/26/if-i-can-do-it-anybody-can/#sthash.KnKOOf5G.dpuf
Regarding **Output 1.2** “*Quality and functioning of agricultural services have been strengthened*” though interviewed people assessed achieved results positively, there are still areas that need to be improved in the future (see Box 2.3).

**Box 2.3 Achievement of Output 1.2**

*Indicator 1.2.1* “Networks of agricultural extension and veterinary workers are strengthened and properly maintained” was **achieved partially**. A number of efforts were made, and local agricultural extension and veterinary networks have been consolidated partly. The most positive changes were mainly with Raglai people’s awareness of common pig diseases and ways to deal with them. However, there are still lots of things to be done with the networks because of the three project communes only Phuoc Tien has a qualified veterinarian, and in two districts there is not any veterinary collaborator at the village level.

*Indicator 1.2.2* “A formal or informal channel of market information is established to serve the needs of local producers” **met the target**. Several channels have been established such as compiling and upgrading catalogues of service providers (e.g. veterinarians, extensionists, business development services); operation of village loudspeakers; asking project staff (e.g. Mr. Hung, Ms. Ha, Mr. Tu, Ms. Tot, etc.); information from relatives and local agents, use of mobile phones.

The implementation of **Outcome 2** “*Improved status and roles among Raglai women within their families, communities*” achieved some initial encouraging results mainly concerning families of active members. There have been some positive indicators showing Raglai men play a more active role in developing family economy, and sharing household workload with women. However, the changes are not profound enough (see Box 2.4 and 2.5).

**Box 2.4 Achievement of Output 2.1**

*Indicator 2.1.1* “The number of hours Raglai men spent on housework increased by 10%” was difficult to assess as **there was no baseline and qualitative information of this indicator**. However, interview results showed that the participation of Raglai women in regular market sales “has liberated” them from some of household chores and these are taken over by men.

*Indicator 2.1.2* “The number of hours Raglai men spent on production and business increased by 20%” was difficult to assess too as **there was no baseline and qualitative information of this indicator**. However, interviewed people shared that men in households, where women participating in regular market sales, seemed more active in helping their wives in preparation of goods for sale, as well as in doing the productive and housework for their wives.

*Indicator 2.1.3* “At least 70% of women receive more support from male members in their families when the project finished” was difficult to assess as **there was no baseline and qualitative information of this indicator**. However, interview results show that most of market active women have received greater support from their family male members.
Concerning Output 2.2 Raglai women, especially group members, became more active than before in terms of application of modern productive techniques and accessing market. However, the progress was still initial, and it is necessary for all stakeholders to make continuous efforts to build on, and strengthen the momentum.

Box 2.5 Achievement of Output 2.2

Indicator 2.2.1 “Number of women with greater status than men in family and communities increased” was difficult to assess as there was no baseline and qualitative information of this indicator. However, one can conclude this indicator met the target in cases of WU officers in Thuan Bac district and Phuoc Tien commune, female leaders and active group members. Their capacity and authority has increased significantly through their active participation in project activities (e.g. training, group activities, production and sale activities, etc.)

Indicator 2.2.2 “The number of hours for rest of women increased by 10%” was difficult to assess too as there was no baseline and qualitative information of this indicator. In reality, the participation in project activities made both Raglai women and men busier than before.

Indicator 2.2.4 “100% of female members of joint interest groups participate regular group meetings” met the target. It was encouraging that all joint interest groups were capable of maintaining regular meetings.

Indicator 2.2.5 “90% of female members of joint interest groups take part in activities - economic, social and cultural events in their communities” met the target if one considers activities such as training, workshops, market sales, group meetings, communications and education campaigns, market fair, study tours, etc.

Indicator 2.2.6 “650 women have contribution in making important decisions in their families (e.g. use of resources, animal husbandry, land use and education of children).” As there was no baseline information of this indicator, it was difficult to assess its achievement. However, all interviewed people – partners, group members said that Raglai women did have a voice in making important family decisions.

Output 2.3 “Capacity of women organisations in terms of women’s economic leadership has been enhanced” achieved some initial results, particularly successful were the members of Thuan Bac DWU and Loi Hai CWU, as well as members of joint interest groups in three project communes. On the contrary, the capacity of Bac Ai DWU and Phuoc Tan CWU officers was questionable as their partipitation in the project implementation was very limited. Planned activities such as “Support to group leaders and active members to attend relevant provincial and district production workshops/fora” were not implemented and budget was transferred to other activities. One of reasons could be, perhaps, the black pig production level in three project communes was rather limited thus there was no need for such workshops/fora.

Regarding the Outcome3 “Government’s plans and programmes have incorporated specific measures and actions to support smallholder producers and enterprises”, fair results were achieved as the project managed to implement series of activities like policy dialogues and advocacy for models of successful women in terms of poverty reduction. The project did a right thing in introducing and supporting several production and business models, and local
communities also appreciated highly its efforts. However, the problem here is how to mobilise enough financial resources for keeping and replicating these models (see Box 2.6).

**Box 2.6 Achievement of Outcome 3**

*Indicator 3.1.1 “A network of WEL applicants will be established and functioning (in form of a forum) so that stakeholders will have the opportunity to discuss/share the WEL approach and application” met the target because i) a task force on Gender Economic Development (GED) was established by Oxfam; and ii) a number of provincial and district policy dialogues, study visits and advocacy workshops were organised. However, the problem here is how to maintain the network after the project has finished.*

*Indicator 3.1.2 “The number of women in leadership positions in communal and village mass organisations increased by 15” has no data and the project seemed to have no significant impact on this matter.*

*Indicator 3.2.1 “20 small businesses/household enterprises received advice on administrative procedures, legal procedures for starting their business” was achieved.*

The project provided several households with modest funding to start their business – three models of semi-free range pig raising (two in Bac Ai and one in Thuan Bac); ten models of vegetable growing for pig food in Phuoc Tan commune; ten models of business household in Phuoc Tien and Loi Hai communes, etc.

*Indicator 3.2.2 “Increase in government budget allocation for small farmers and enterprises is reflected in local government SED plans” recorded some progress as a result of Oxfam’s advocacy work with local government, particularly with the Tam Nong Project and DARD. District partners shared some attempts were made within the Programme 30a and the Poverty Reduction Programme.*

Though there were constraints such as some ambitious targets\(^6\), short implementation time, limited budget and coverage, different management modalities, etc.), the RVNA93 project has demonstrated a very effective approach to help ethnic minority people in general, and for Raglai women in particular, to overcome poverty and improve their social status. Several innovative models have been introduced such as semi-free range black pig raising; growing bananas and sweet potatoes and red worms as sources for pig food, etc. In fact, the project was successful in “making an impossible thing come to life” – helping Raglai people, especially Raglai women, to gradually overcome some backward traditions, biases and habits, to learn and apply modern production techniques, and to access the markets. As a result, their income has increased and living conditions improved. Again, it is necessary to stress that the results achieved so far were just initial, and there is still need for continuous and concerted efforts from all stakeholders to make the changes more permanent.

---

\(^6\) For example: the number of beneficiaries; 80 extension and veterinary staff trained and become trainers; 25% of women are in important positions in local government, mass organisations and CSOs; the number of hours for rest for women increased by 10%, etc.
The project achieved some very encouraging initial results. A number of set indicators met its targets successfully (see more details in Annex 6):

- 22 joint interest groups were established and/or consolidated with over 300 members, most of whom are poor Raglai women (10 groups with 155 members in Bac Ai district, and 12 groups with 180 members in Thuan Bac district). At the beginning, the project provided support to different production activities including growing maize and raising cow, however, since 2013, a major shift occurred and the project focused only on supporting black pig raising and marketing its products. Group members managed to meet regularly once a month and deposited small amounts of money, as savings, to established group revolving funds.
- The number of black pigs in many member households increased steadily from 200 in 2011 to 784 heads in 2014.

Table 2.1 Number and types of black pigs raised by group member in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts (unit count: pig/household)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of pigs per HH by year</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>1.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>4.13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Structure of pig herd of a HH in 2013</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pig for slaughtering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Piglet</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Results of the survey conducted by Mr. Hoang Xuan Truong’s team

However, it is necessary to add here that though positive results were achieved due to project interventions, the level of black pig production of Raglai people in two districts remains rather limited - very small scale (in average just 2.68 pig/household, of which 1.66 is sow), very low birth rate and after weaning survival rate of piglet (just 2.18 piglets/HH per year against the optimal rate of 14-15 piglets/HH). Some of the reasons can be: low quality of sow, poor conceive rate, high postnatal mortality rate due to inbreeding or lack of food, diseases, etc. In addition, Raglai people tend to slaughter black pigs for big occasions such as wedding parties, funerals, etc. thus a large amount of pig is used within communities, and the number of pig sold to market is small – in average mere 0.36 pig/HH. Because of the mentioned reasons, many Raglai households cannot overcome poverty if they rely only on black pig raising at such a low level. In average a Raglai household earned just 1.2 million VND7 every year or just 1/10 of the estimated income of 12 million VND calculated by SCAP research in 2012.

---

7 Results of the survey conducted by Mr. Hoang Xuan Truong’s team in October 2014
The Oxfam’s approach to poverty reduction is more effective than government poverty reduction programmes/projects. 100% of interviewed partners explained because the Oxfam approach was practical, scientific, participatory and community/beneficiary-centred. The project planning was bottom-up and participatory thus it reflected people’s needs and made use of local advantages. Activities carried out in forms of training of trainers (TOT) and farmer field school (FFS) helped majority of trainees including Raglai women understand what the trainers wanted to convey, and then apply in their production. The Oxfam project, though with more modest budget than the government ones reached its beneficiaries better and helped them improve their life. Project partners shared that some government poverty reduction programmes/projects had large investment budgets, but were of low effectiveness and even created a dependency mentality among many beneficiaries. The Oxfam project worked well because:

- It conducted a comprehensive survey of project localities and intended beneficiaries taking into account anthropologic, traditional cultural and livelihood aspects of Raglai people. Then it came up with the most relevant approach.
- Market surveys of Raglai traditional products were organised prior and during the project implementation. This helped Oxfam to make necessary modification to the project design and main activities.
- It chose to support Raglai women as the main target group and their traditional livelihoods (e.g. animal raising and maize growing, etc.).
- It applied a so-called group support, which helped encourage collectivity spirit and community interactions between poor women, and at the same time gave rooms for active members to act as examples.
- It incorporated market aspects into local people’s production and business.
- It provided quite a broad range of support applying relevant and approaches – capacity building went together with practising, training and retraining, farmer field school, building pilot models and doing policy advocacy, etc.

II.2 Specific findings

Project contribution to local social and economic development (SED)

The project contribution to local SED, though positive, was rather modest compared to the contributions of government programmes/policies, and the efforts made by local government and people. At present, Bac Ai district is implementing 62 different government policies/programmes such as Programme 30a, Programme 135, New Rural Programme, Tam Nong Project, Programme 102, Preferential Credit from the Social Policy Bank, etc. covering all nine communes in the district with a total budget exceeding hundreds of billions VND. Thuan Bac district also enjoys a number of national targeted programmes (NTPs), Tam Nong Project, ADB-funded project on supporting ethnic minority people (ADB5), CPI project, etc. Funding from Oxfam project was quite modest compared with the funding from
the above-mentioned programmes/projects. For example, in the SED plan 2013 of Phuoc Tien commune, the total investment sources was VND 19.5 billion, of which government programmes/projects contributed VND 10.5 billion, and the Oxfam project provided just VND 51 million or 0.5% (see Chart 2.1).

**Chart 2.1 Contribution of different programmes/projects to investment in Phuoc Tien Commune in 2013**

The evaluation team observed the activities of the Oxfam project were mentioned very slightly in annual SED plans of Bac Ai district and its two communes, and it was not mentioned at all in annual SED plans of Thuan Bac district and Loi Hai commune. For instance, Oxfam activities were mentioned in Bac Ai District SED Plan 2013 under headings Small Industry, Trade and Services; Phuoc Tien communal SED Plan 2013 did mention about maintaining regular market sales, completing black pig brand name, campaigning on ways to prevent and treat common pig diseases for members of 6 joint interest groups. One explanation for this observation could be in the influence of the project management modality - in Bac Ai district, the project was managed by District and Communal People’s Committees, just it was known and reflected in their annual SED plans. In case of Thuan Bac district, the project was run by DWU and Loi Hai CWU through its village staff and without the involvement of People’s Committees, thus it was not reflected in the PC annual plans. A second reason could be the project’s small coverage (just 2/9 communes in Bac Ai district and 1/6 commune in Thuan Bac district) thus it received inadequate attention of local government. A third reason could be its limited resources and the focus on soft investments (e.g. capacity building activities for group members and partners, campaigning, policy advocacy, etc.) rather than in hard investment (e.g. equipments, breeding piglets, materials, etc).
Project’s most appreciated activities

- Capacity building support to members of joint interest groups—according to project reports nearly 2,000 women, especially groups leaders, received training and had their capacity improved in:
  - Market access (e.g. doing and running business, cost and price calculation, sale skills, etc.): both partners and beneficiaries said these activities were new, interesting and useful. On the other hand, some partners shared that the support was too short – it started in June 2014 while the project ended in March 2015.
  - Application of modern techniques in raising black pig (build cages, applying semi-free range husbandry models; growing vegetable (e.g. bananas, morning glory, sweet potatoes, etc.) as animal feed; preparation of mix feed; identification of some common pig diseases, etc.). As a result, Raglai people gradually became aware of the importance of new techniques in animal husbandry, tried not to let the pigs run freely, knew how to prepare good animal feed from available vegetable and rice bran; learnt some basic veterinary skills (e.g. injection of medicines, sterilisation of male piglets, recognising pig diseases); informed and asked local veterinarians to come when their pig was sick; very few people treated themselves or ignored sick pigs (see Chart 2.2). These changes, though initial, were very important as it helped Raglai people move in the right direction with applying modern production techniques and accessing markets;

Chart 2.2. The ways Raglai people prevent and treat pig diseases (% of HHs)

Source: Result of survey of Mr. Hoang Xuan Truong’s team
Application of so-called Gender Action Learning System (GALS/WEMAN) in production planning of joint interest groups. It is a very new and useful tool which allows people, even ethnic minorities and illiterate people, to make a good plan through drawing simple symbols and icons. GALS/WEMAN helped the group members understand well every step of the pig raising process, strengths and weaknesses, and specific activities they had to do each time.

- **Policy dialogues on local economic development, development of small and medium enterprises/cooperatives/groups between group members and representatives of local government.** Both local partners, at the district and communal level, highly appreciated this kind of activity as it required small investment but brought about very positive impacts – participating local people had an opportunity to raise their hot issues/concerns to relevant government senior officials, while the latter listened and answered questions, and even presented some solutions.

- **Contribution to improve the quality of agricultural extension and veterinary services:** Overall, hundreds of communal veterinarians attended 6 TOT courses on basic knowledge and skills on common diseases such as diarrhea, foot and mouth, fluke worm, congestion, inbreeding and others in cows and pigs. The Head of the Bac Ai District Extension and Veterinary Station boasted that 10 trained veterinarians were capable to provide very good services at the time of interview. He considered good training quality as a reason “This is very different from government training without visual and practice tools” - besides inviting national expert trainers, Oxfam also provided tools for practice thus trainees could master what they had been taught.

- **In-kind support:**

  - Supply of breeding piglets and materials for building cages to member households. Thuan Bac DWU reported by the end of 2012 the project had provided 181 pigs and metal roof materials for 128 households and by the end of 2014 the pig herd had increased to 334 (an increase by 54.2%). Bac Ai DPCB reported in 2013 it provided pigs to 35 households in Phuoc Tien commune and 25 households in Phuoc Tan commune – each HH received two breeding piglets at a cost of 1 million VND. The important thing here was not just providing member households with breeding piglets, but the way it was delivered – the CPMUs had organised group meetings for members to discuss project criteria/requirements, and select households in an open and democratical manner. Moreover, the CPMUs also helped members’ HHs in buying quality breeding piglets.
  - Provision of 1st vaccination and sterilisation (for male piglets), ear-rings (for control purpose);
  - Working with a local NGO named SPIN in piloting semi-free range pig raising models (one model in each of three project communes) together with red worms raising, biological bedding, growing vegetable and feed silage techniques for pigs, etc.
o Provision of financial support to some active members to start their business such as the soup shop for Ms. So (in Ba Rau 2 village), and fruit stall for Ms. Dep (in Ba Rau 1 village) in Loi Hai commune; support to several business projects (e.g. bread shop, vegetable stall, handicraft shop in Phuoc Tien commune, and a porridge shop in Phuoc Tan commune); support signboard and some equipments to two slaughterhouses Thue-Lao (in Phuoc Tien) and Chung-Lieu (in Loi Hai);

o Support tens of group active members to participate in trade fair in Bac Ai district and in Phan Rang-Thap Cham town to promote specialties of Raglai people (black pork, fruits, vegetable, chapi music instrument, arbalest, papoose, etc.);

o Support erect signboards to promote black pork in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac, and to advertise Phuoc Tien market place.

According to interviewed partners, the biggest contribution of the project was to change the mindset of part of Raglai communities, especially of Raglai women in three communes toward applying modern production techniques and accessing market, moving away from bartering towards selling their produce. For example, many Raglai people nowadays raise pigs for sale, not just keeping them for exchange or for family feasts. The evaluation team observed that group members in Bac Ai district raised pigs in larger quantity than in Thuan Bac district (average 5-7 pigs/HH vs. 2-3pigs/HH). On the other hand, group members in Thuan Bac district seem smarter in cost calculation and accessing market. A good example is group members in Ba Rau 1 village (Loi Hai commune) – they can calculate very well profits from growing project pigs as follows: “At the beginning the group members received 21 pigs and after two years, they can produce about 100 piglets. People tend to raise piglets for 1-2 months and sell for 250-350k per pig. Overall, the total income of the group from selling piglets after two years is 30 millions VNDand in average each HH earns 2 million VND”. They also demonstrated their markets skills:“All group members feel confident to bring their produce (e.g. chicken, vegetable, maize, jackfruit, etc.) to sell at the market place, and earn money to buy necessities for their family members. Usually, their income from selling chicken is 500-600k VND, from selling vegetable is 100k VND. They inquire market information by asking neighbours or local agents prior to selling, and only sell their produce to those who pay more. They sell 1-2 chicken first, and if the price is right, they will sell a whole bunch.”

Table 2.2 Members’ ranking of project activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Marking (more stars reflect greater level of satisfaction)</th>
<th>Reason</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Market access</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>Very useful activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production planning</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>Very useful activity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

27
| Gender equality | *** | Very useful activity |
| Selling goods | *** | Very useful activity |
| Pig sterilisation | * | Feel uncomfortable |
| Pig vaccination | ** | Need more training |
| Feed silage | * | New, lacking experience |
| Making compost | * | Very few people practise it |
| Use of biological mattress | ** | Need more practice |
| Growing red worms | * | Very new, lack of breeds |
| Making silage for cow | *** | Very useful activity |
| Planting morning glory, banana, special weed | *** | Very useful activity |

Source: Group discussion in Ba Rau I village, Loi Hai commune

**Project’s unsuccessful activities**

- A number of planned activities under the Component 4 “Market development for local produce” such as support group leaders and excellent producers to attend provincial/district workshops or forums on relevant sub-sectors; workshop “Finding sustainable outputs for black pig products” in Phuoc Tien commune; introduction of local agricultural products to supermarkets and restaurants, etc. failed to be realised. A reason for their failure could be wrong timing – all these activities had been planned base on an assumption that the project was able to establish a black pig value chain in the project communes after two years. However, the assumption failed to materialise and the production level of black pig of Raglai people still remained too low – very few products were sold at the local markets. To remedy this situation Oxfam and its partners agreed to replace the activities with hiring national consultant “to evaluate and research the sustainable output market for black pigs products; and to develop production plan and business plan for black pig raising groups.”

- Despite following SPIN instructions, 2 models of biological bedding in Phuoc Tan and Phuoc Tien were unable to produce enough vegetable and red worms for pig feeding. Due to deeply rooted traditional thinking and difficulties in taming indigenous black pigs, models of semi-free range pig raising still remained as experiment. It seemed that Raglai people in the project sites would need more time and support in order for them to move away from traditional ways of pig raising.

- District Extension and Veterinary Station staff complained Oxfam had not informed them of erecting signboards advertising black pig products in Phuoc Tien commune. They argued that all animal including pigs needed to be quarantined before moving out of an area, and they were the people in charge of it.
II.3 Project relevance

One can conclude the project was highly relevant to local context, conditions, as well to the needs of the intended beneficiary groups—poor Raglai women and Raglai communities.

Right targeting

Ninh Thuan is the poorest province in the south-central region, and Raglai people are the poorest and largest community living in two districts of Bac Ai and Thuan Bac. They face with a host of challenges: harsh natural conditions (e.g. low precipitation, long dry season causing water shortage, infertile soil, etc.). In addition, the level of their production is very low as many of them have no idea of following seasonal calendar and applying modern techniques. Thus Raglai people need support from the government as well as from outside organisations to help them out of poverty.

Scientific and appropriate approach

100% of interviewed local partners and people said that the Oxfam had conducted site survey and consulted all relevant stakeholders prior to designing the project. Thus their problems and needs, as well as target groups were identified correctly and addressed properly “Oxfam understand the area and people better than us (local officials)” (Bac Ai DWU interview). Most project activities were designed and implemented well, meeting local people’s needs (e.g. participation in group and community meetings, capacity building in production techniques for their traditional crops and animal, accessing market, etc.) Oxfam provided local people with a broad range of support including crop production, animal husbandry and marketing of traditional products.

Need to distinguish and combine two main target groups

Older Raglai women may have difficulty in applying modern production techniques and accessing market. They are, however, the people with high authority in the community and thus could be used in campaigning/influencing work. On the other hand young Raglai women are better educated, speak Vietnamese fluently, and know calculation of production costs and benefits. Thus they should be helped as main labour force in applying training knowledge into doing household economy.

Besides, some of project activities were of technical nature and a household approach could be more effective than the one focusing only on women. For example: women in Ba Rau I village shared they had been trained in pig sterilisation, but felt uncomfortable practising the technique, and thought their husbands could do the work better⁸. Too much focusing on women in project implementation could lead to a situation where men were aware of nothing, had no understanding and shared very little workload with women.

⁸ Result of group discussion in Ba Rau I village, Loi Hai commune, Thuan Bac district on 2nd April 2015.
II.4 Project efficiency

The evaluation team agrees with an assessment of PWU partners that the Oxfam project was quite effective and efficient as it helped ethnic minority women and WU cadre improve capacity in economic endeavour, accessing market and reducing poverty.

One of the most significant impacts of the project was the positive change in attitude and behaviours of a number of Raglai women. After attending regular group meetings, training and selling products in local markets, many Raglai women became more self-confident and smarter in communication with outsiders. They are no longer the shy and timid persons they once used to be.

Raising pigs for market has brought about increased income for Raglai households—in average 1-2 millions VND per year.

An idea of appointing village WU officer to assume the group leader roles was proved fruitful as it helped great deal in project implementation. Furthermore, under the context of encouraging Raglai people produce and sell their products to the markets, it would be wiser to make use of capable and dedicated Kinh (Vietnamese) WU officers as “locomotives” together with groups leaders in project implementation. This would mean moving away from a rigid concept of maintaining “100% of poor and ethnic minority HHs”. The cases of Mr. Hung and Ms. Thuy (in Phuoc Tien commune), Ms. Ha and Ms. Tot (in Loi Hai commune) are very good examples to support this argument (see Annex1 for case studies).

Activities such as policy dialogues, advocacy, IEC on gender equality and domestic violence against women, etc. were highly appreciated by partners, beneficiaries and Oxfam as low cost and effective.

**Incremental improvements in household production and income**

- Black pig raising experienced improvements compared to the past but its scale remained too small—in average 5-7 pigs/HH compared with just 2-3 pigs/HH in the past. Farming of Raglai people still depended heavily on natural conditions. The dry season here lasts from December to April and often accompanied with draught, and water shortage was considered the main reason for failure of several project pilot models (e.g. growing bananas and vegetable).

- Though there were some improvements in the quality of black pork, it was far from meeting the market requirements, and there are certain kinds of risk such as pig disease (around 4% of local pigs has diseases9) and inbreeding. In addition, Raglai people sold their pigs at quite high price and only few buyers, who had close contact with the project agreed to buy it. Other middlemen and buyers stayed out because they

---

9Mr. Hoang Xuan Truong’s team, Report on “Supplementary research on the black pig value chain, and technical support to piloting the black pig value chain in Ninh Thuan province”, October 2014
did not see tangible profit from participating in “the black pig value chain”. The evaluation team is of an opinion that it is important for joint interest groups to follow strictly their production plans, and observe their commitments (of supplying black pigs) to local contractors/outlets/businesses so that the latter can enjoy stable supply, and gradually expand output markets for mutual benefit of both sides. This will require time, efforts to increase the scale of pig raising, and good coordination between members within a joint interest groups, and between the groups.

- On the one hand, many group members seemed understood and able to practice training contents on pig injection and sterilisation. However, they faced difficulty in remembering the name of medicines as it was long and complicated. Though all group members received training on cost calculation, they tended to neglect calculating the cost of their own products such as vegetables, bananas, bran, etc. This is another area people need to be aware of if they really want to grow pig at a larger scale than the current one.

Besides the highly appreciated activities, the evaluation also records some serious opinions expressed by local partners:

- Oxfam has introduced a comprehensive approach to poverty reduction and helped poor ethnic minority people and women change their traditional thinking, develop their production and access the markets, and the Raglai women have their economic leadership role enhanced, etc. However, the fact that the project scaled down its support coverage – from production of maize, rice, cow and black pig to only black pig, caused a limitation in its results and impacts. In reality, black pig raising, though a traditional industry of Raglai women, is still a byproduct that can bring about only small incomes (compared to cow raising). In addition, Raglai people have been faced with difficulty in purchasing quality breeding piglets. Therefore a combination of different suitable forms of livelihood – for instance, crop plantation with animal husbandry, can be the best way for Raglai people to overcome poverty in a sustainable way.

- The small project coverage – just in 3 out of 15 communes of two districts, has limited its influence and impacts. Note Oxfam have a history of working in several communes in Bac Ai district. This is considered by local partners as one of the biggest constraints of the project, and they did come up several times with suggestions to Oxfam to address this issue.

### II.5 Project equality

**Ensuring equality**

“Husbands become more helpful to their wives, and family violence is less now compared to the past. Improvements in living conditions contribute to family harmony because poverty makes people angry and causes quarrels. However, there are still cases where a drunk
husband use abusive language with his wife.” (Group discussion in Tra Co 2 village, Phuoc Tien commune)

At first glance, the project’s focus on women as main beneficiaries seemed right. However, considering the Raglai community and its matrilineal traditions and customs, this approach came along with several challenges concerning existing backward traditions and customs of Raglai people. For example, their customs give the wife ownership over their assets and property – if a couple has serious quarrel and divorce, then the husband must leave their home virtually “empty handed”; the assets amassed by a couple will be taken away by their relatives when the wife dies; a family has to spend large amount of money or slaughter cows and water buffaloes in order to hold a proper funeral party, and this often ends with heavy borrowing, etc. Thus these customs sometimes explain why many Raglai men are reluctant to make active contribution to their household economy. It is quite common among men in the over 45 group as many of them think “Even though I contribute to family wealth this will be spent by my wife when I die!” Formal divorce is quite rare in Raglai communities and they tend to solve this issue in-house, not bring it up to the court. However, this way of dealing often results in the woman having to deal with all consequences including debt.

The fact that most project activities focused on women and rarely involved Raglai men, as main labour force, led to a situation where the application of activities at the household level faced difficulties when men could not do well because they were not aware of necessary information. Therefore, a lesson here is that any development project for Raglai people needs to involve men as one of target groups in order to make best use of them as a main labour force. In addition, this would help Raglai women reduce their workload, and have more time to rest and learn.

The traditional work division of Raglai people allows women to be in charge of selling goods and purchasing family daily necessities such as vegetable, dried fish, sugar, salt, etc. while men work in field (e.g. preparing land, collecting banana trunk, fruits, etc.), and help with housework. Both wife and husband prepare goods for sale, and elderly daughter helps mother sell goods at the market place.

**Little change in decision making**

Regarding decision making in Raglai families, interviewed people shared mostly it was made jointly, or by mutual consensus between wife and husband. Before project interventions, women did participate in decision making but at a lesser extent than men. Nowadays, as women participate more actively in market activities and earn more money, it seems they have stronger voice in decision making in their family.

“Wife decides what daily necessities need to be purchased. She is also more active in inquiring commodity prices. However, when a family wants to purchase something costly, wife and husband and daughter will discuss it.” (Group discussion in Tra Co 2 village, Phuoc Tien commune)
Besides, DPCB partners shared the project “had forgotten” the youth group (15-25 year old people), who have physical power, and capacity to learn new knowledge, and socialise better than older women because they are well educated, speak Vietnamese fluently, know calculation and are eager to socialisation. As a result, it would have been more useful for the project to involve this group in its implementation, and the changes could have occurred at quicker pace. It was encouraging that Communal PMU in Phuoc Tien and Loi Hai communes already involved young Raglai women/girls in some activities such as working with school teachers to organise field trips for girls to local market sessions to learn useful experiences.

The project also did not pay adequate attention to older Raglai women. Because of old age, it is very difficult for them to change habits and learn new things, however, they are people who have a very important voice in the family and community. Therefore it would be necessary to involve them in future projects in order to bring about faster and more profound changes in Raglai ethnic minority communities.

II.6 Project impacts

- **Awareness of application of modern production techniques and accessing market of Raglai people in general, and of interest group members in particular, has been changed positively.** All interviewed – project partners and beneficiaries, considered it the most significant change. After attending training courses and practising it, many Raglai people know, for the first time, how to calculate production costs, how to buy and sell goods in order to generate profit, how to inquire commodity price and bargain, participating in regular market sessions, use scales, etc. In the past, Raglai people raised black pigs as a reserved asset - they only used pigs for family feast or in case of need for cash. Since participating in joint interest groups and being trained, knowing how to calculate production costs and benefit, most Raglai women no longer raise black pig for as long as 3-4 years because they know it is very costly and earning is just 1.5-2 million VND/pig. Nowadays, the group members tend to raise a batch of piglets for just 6-7 moths and earn the same amount of money. They have started applying modern production techniques - semi-free range raising, planting vegetable and applying feed silage, vaccination and sterilisation, asking veterinary to come when they pigs are sick, etc.

- **Participating in and selling goods at local market places has become a new habit of many group members and their families.** Phuoc Tien market place was built in 2013 and has been open since that time, attracting a large number of sellers and buyers from within the commune, as well as from other places to come and do business 4 times a month. Loi Hai market place is situated along a short section of the Highway 1A, and also maintains its regular sessions at weekends.

**Box 2.7 Chapi Dream**

Pinang Thi Hiem is a 30 year old Raglai woman living in Suoi Rua village, Phuoc Tien commune, Bac Ai district with husband and four children. In the past, she used to farm in their plot, and raise...
pigs and chickens. She sold pigs and chickens to middlemen at her house when in need for cash. She was often forced to sell at a quite low price because she did not know to use scale in trading (she just roughly estimated or measured animal by span).

When the project “Enhancing Market Access and Promoting Economic Leadership for Raglai Women” being implemented in Phuoc Tien commune, she had an opportunity to participate in training courses on improving business awareness and skills including business planning and small business management.

Thanks to the project support, regular market sessions are organised in Phuoc Tien commune every week (the very first sessions were on Friday of the third week of every month). Thi Hiem has been one of active participants and brought her products here for sale. Nowadays she knows how to calculate expenses and income, and bargain with customers. She has also learned to use units of measurement and scale in selling products. Instead of selling a 1.5 kg chicken to middlemen at home for only 40 – 50k VND as in the past, now she can earn 3 times more money for selling the same amount of chicken. She receives full support from her husband besides farming with her, he climbs up mountains to catch crab, picks pepper and “la bep” (a type of leaf used for cooking). He also cuts bamboo and makes hand products like Chapi music instrument, arbalest, papoose for selling at regular market. Thi Hiem family usually earns 400-500kVND per market session. Thanks to participating actively in the market, her family’s income has increased significantly.

Source: Tran Thu Thuy, Oxfam Intern, http://www.oxfamblogs.org/vietnam/2012/11/22/chapi-dream/#sthash.CFbs88KF.Avl64ZgE.dpuf

- Raglai women have become more active/braver at the community/social events (e.g. group meetings, training, village meetings, etc.) by voicing their opinions.
- Since being involved in the project implementation, Raglai women have become more capable in financial management, producing and selling their products at local markets, and generating higher income compared to the past.
• Active participation at the markets has helped Raglai people in general, and Raglai women in particular, becoming more socialising, acquiring more market, social and cultural information, and thus have their knowledge improved.
• The project has contributed, partly, to solving a common problem of a number of Raglai people’s dependence on (cash and goods from) some local businesses. As their awareness of, and access to, the markets improving, they become less dependent on middlemen and can choose who they would sell their goods to and when.
• Focusing on black pig raising and market activities has helped release Raglai women from some workburden (e.g. working in the field and housework), and earn more stable income (as this workload is being taken over by Raglai men).

II.7 Project sustainability and replicability

*Keeping the current joint interest groups with active members as its core*

Interviewed group members shared though the Oxfam project finished they believed most group activities (e.g. group meetings, selling goods at local market places, black pig raising, etc.) would continue. Active members are expected to act as a core to keep groups operational, and group members pledge to contribute 5-10k VND every month to group revolving funds.

> “Though the project has finished we will maintain group meetings because everyone is committed and contributes to group fund. There is no way our groups will be dissolved.” (Group discussion in Ma Ty and Da Trang villages, Phuoc Tan commune).

District partners mentioned about incorporating project’s positive aspects into government development programmes/projects in Ninh Thuan province such as Programme30a (e.g. piloting support to better-off HHs to access market); Tam Nong project (e.g. establishing breeding cow groups in Cong Ha commune, commune participatory and market-oriented development planning, etc.)

> “Phuoc Tien CPC had asked and used additional funding from the Tam Nong project to organise four training courses on business skills for our people. Two courses were organised in 2014, and we have planned to carry out the remaining two in 2015.” (Interview of Mr. Hoang Van Dang, Chair, Phuoc Tien CPC).

It is very likely that Oxfam successful models – e.g. bread shop in Phuoc Tien commune, Chung –Lieu slaughterhouse in Loi Hai commune, will continue in the future.

Trained and experienced local partners and active group members are expected to apply participatory approach in their work.
Results of Oxfam’s policy advocacy work

Oxfam PO and consultant worked directly with Tam Nong Project Coordinating Unit (PCU), DARD, Agricultural Extension Centre (AEC), Veterinary Sub-department (VS) and Department of Industry & Trade (DOIT) representatives to share project’s results in developing black pig value chain and a business plan for its continuation period beyond 2015, and give some policy recommendations on the needs to for support of black pig producers from above agencies, especially from Tam Nong project. Some preliminary agreements were made as follows:

- Black pig commodity has been institutionalised as one of the 8 value chains for economic development of Ninh Thuan province.
- Tam Nong PCU has agreed to modify the plan of supporting black pig in 2015 to match Oxfam’s recommendations.
- In the long term, black pig commodity will continue to be supported and reflected in Ninh Thuan province’s social-economic development programme (SEDP) as it has been recognized officially as one of the strategic value chains of the province.

II.8 Project management and partnership

Project management

Though small in terms of its scope and range of activities, the project applied two different management modalities in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts with certain advantages and limitations. On the one hand, different management modalities helped Oxfam with building diverse partnerships and making use of different partner’s structure and expertise. On the other hand, a common and obvious limitation of both modalities was the part time involvement of partners, which resulted in a number of constraints including project’s effectiveness and efficiency.

In Bac Ai district, the project management was under DPC and CPC thus it received adequate attention and support from various local government brands and agencies. A good example is the decision of DPC to mobilise local resources to build a new market place in Phuoc Tien commune. It was a result of several factors – one was the strong participation of local people and business in market activities, another one was the positive attitude of project partners. Another good example was the incorporation of project activities into annual district and Phuoc Tien communal SED plans. In addition, this management modality also created opportunities for coordination of activities across different projects under DPC/CPC management. For example, with Tam Nong project in establishing joint interest groups for black pig and cow raising. However, the role of the Women’s Union in project implementation here was rather limited, though they were supposed to play a key role. As a

---

10 The evaluation team finds it very difficult to explain why the Phuoc Tan CPC did not do the same as Phuoc Tien CPC, except a harsh conclusion of the former’s weak commitment and capacity.
result, one can conclude that the project has failed in strengthening the capacity of WU in Bac Ai district.

In Thuan Bac district, though the DPC assumed a formal management role in its DPCB, practical implementation in six villages of Loi Hai commune was done by the WU - from district to communal and village level. In this case the WU managed to make best use of its organisational structure and staffing for the sake of both beneficiaries and WU itself. On the other hand the role of Loi Hai CPC was rather unseen. The evaluation team has an impression that the Loi Hai CPC, similar to the Phuoc Tan CPC, paid very little attention to project activities considering it as mere WU’s activities. Looking at most recent annual communal SED plans 2013 and 2015, there was not any mentioning about the project activities even though it was carried out in 6 villages of Loi Hai commune. Another explanation could be the very weak coordination and sharing information between WU and CPC.

**Partnership between Oxfam and local partners**

Overall, a strong working partnership was established and maintained throughout the project implementation. Oxfam signed funding agreements with Bac Ai and Thuan Bac DPC in the 1st quarter 2011. Local government also created favourable conditions for project implementation – the Ninh Thuan PPC issued two decisions on approval of project funding and establishment of two DPCBs. Oxfam fulfilled all its commitments/obligations and assigned a PO to act as focal point person.

*There have been a number of outstanding persons who contributed significantly to the project successful implementation* - group leaders and members like Ms. Eamxixit Thi So, Kator Thi Hong Dep, Kator Thi Huong (Loi Hai commune); Kator Thi Thue and Kator Lao, Pinang Thi Hiem (Phuoc Tien commune); active partners like Mr. Vo Van Hung and Ms. Do Thi Thanh Thuy (Bac Ai district); Ms. Mai Thi Ha, Ms Nguyen Thi Tot (Thuan Bac district), and many other people (see Annex 1).

Local partners shared the following assessments:

- All Oxfam staff, especially Mr. Long, were with attitudes - friendly and community and task-oriented, always in time; understood and supported their partners and communities very well.
- Oxfam’s financial management was very systematic and sound.
- Oxfam paid great attention to all steps of project implementation. Partners highly appreciated its information/knowledge sharing and flexibility in making project modification.
II.9 Project constraints

- Project beneficiaries - Raglai women and communities are among the poorest people in Vietnam, and facing with a host of difficulties – backward traditions and customs, harsh natural conditions, low production level, limited access to the markets, etc. Though it had been found out that in average raising 4-5 black sows per household could help a Raglai family climb out of poverty, it was very difficult to reach this target because of people’s lack of capital, lack of food for pig (especially in the dry season), and lack of good quality breeding piglets. Other difficulties were subjective – Raglai people tended to participate actively in government activities if they paid no fees. For example, the government provided free vaccination. However, they felt reluctant to call veterinarian to their home to treat sick animal because it would mean some payment from their pocket. Among Raglai people, there is still a psychological barrier to animal vaccination because they think their pig would die after being vaccinated.

- Some local government partners, particularly DPCB members, did not perform as required because of their part time involvement (they were often busy with other tasks including study for higher degrees).

- Limited project budget led to a major project modification – narrowing project activities to support only development of black pig value chain in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts, though expectations of local partners and people were higher.

- Embryonic markets for black pig commodity – pig raising was largely spontaneous and limited at the household level. There was lack of sources capable of supplying quality breeding pigs to local HH; lack of feeding sources (bananas, vegetables, bran, etc.) during the dry season; people’s low awareness of having their pigs vaccinated on a regular basis. Many HHs still kept their pigs running freely thus made it difficult to control diseases, and led very low birth rate and after weaning survival rate of piglet; people were forced to sell pig at lower price by middlemen because of their lack of market information, etc.

- Constraints related to low qualification and capacity of veterinarian cadre at the grassroots level (communal veterinarians and village collaborators). According to local district partners (e.g. District Veterinary Station) only 5 out of 9 communes in Bac Ai district has qualified veterinarians, and the number for Thuan Bac district is just one out of 6 communes. A reason was the government was reducing number of its workers and the agricultural sector was affected most severely – from 3 staffs to just one to cover all three sub-sectors: agriculture, extension and veterinary.
III. SOME LESSONS LEARNT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

III.1 Lessons learnt

- Strong partnership based on clear working principles, including the financial ones, contributes to smooth project implementation, timely and effective dealing with emerging issues. Oxfam and its partners were successful in this regard and some project modifications were made in a timely way.
- Involvement of both local government and mass organisation partners in project management is necessary as it helps mobilise their capacity for common purposes. Besides, it may also help advocacy work to achieve its goal. The construction and function of Phuoc Tien market is a good example.
- As Raglai communities are matrilineal, working with both women and men, young and elderly people helps effective application of project activities, and enhancing its impacts.
- Broad-based consultation in project planning and implementation is necessary to mobilise full participation and contribution of all stakeholders, especially key partners and poor people.
- Combined use of resources is necessary in poor and difficult areas as development needs of local partners and people often exceed available resources.
- Proactive people (e.g. partners, members, local people and businessmen, and Oxfam staff) are the key factors for project success. They do not only strongly believe in what they are doing, but also work tirelessly and patiently to overcome difficulties and achieve set targets. A good example are active project partners and group leaders/members in case studies.

III.2 Common recommendations

- Project beneficiaries – Raglai ethnic women and people, belong to the poorest in Vietnam, and are facing with a host of difficulties (e.g. backward traditions and habits, harsh natural condition, low capacity of applying modern production techniques and accessing market, etc.), thus support to them should be provided in a way that is long term, consistent, and with the involvement of a host of parties – central and local government, international and local organisations, businesses, experts and people. Local governments – PPC, DPC and CPC should consider it their top priority and take part actively, not relying on support from outside organisations.
- Bac Ai and Thuan Bac DPC, as well as CPCs in two districts should consider application and replication of good practices of the Oxfam project (e.g. establishment and maintaining regular meetings of joint interest groups; implementation of relevant capacity building activities for Raglai people in agricultural production, business skills and accessing market; policy dialogue, etc.). They should make best use of the current
active members (e.g. CPC, WU, groups), and consider a broader range of support – e.g. cow raising, crop planting, not just black pig raising.

- Local partners in two districts should also consider replication of participatory planning, farmer field school (FFS) training modality and GALS/WEMAN training.
- In order to maintain and upgrade black pig interest groups (e.g. supplying breeding piglets, credit for group revolving funds, upgrading the quality of the communal veterinary system, establishing village network of veterinary collaborators; support good producers to participate provincial/district trade fairs, etc.), partners in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts should consider combining use of resources from existing different programmes/projects such as Tam Nong Project, New Rural Programme, Programme 30a, Poverty Reduction Programme 2016-2020, etc.
- Given the current level of, and the shortage of food for pig raising, for generating enough income it is recommended to maintain at least 2-3 sows per HH. However, it is very important to increase the mating rate and the birth rate, percentage of piglet survival to weaning. Raising pig in cages or with crank fence around to ensure the good quality of meat, low fat and disease control, as well as hygienic surroundings. Select quality net boars to mate with sows, and then gradually replace the current sows to stop inbreeding.
- Local partners in in Ninh Thuan province, in particular DARD and DPC of Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts, should i) start standardising two technical processes of black pig raising, and slaughtering; ii) continue consolidation of the black pork brand recognition kit (including logos, labels, leaflets, posters, etc.) developed by Oxfam in communes with good potential to develop black pig herds.

III.3 Recommendations for Bac Ai district

- DWU and CWU need to enhance their capacity and role in poverty reduction work.
- Local authorities and people maintain operation of Phuoc Tien market.
- There is a need to help local people establish a slaughterhouse in Phuoc Tien commune.
- Local authorities should promote application of modern techniques in crop plantation and animal husbandry of Raglai people in order to produce sufficient commodities for the Da Lat market.

III.4 Recommendations for Thuan Bac district

- DPC needs to play a more active role in poverty reduction, together with other mass organisations.
- DPC is to work with DARD and its units to implement measures (e.g. supply of breeding piglets and medicines, provision of technical training, etc.) in order to
increase black pig herds in joint interest groups, and supply input to Ho Chi Minh City and Nha Trang markets.

III.5 Recommendations for Oxfam

It is necessary for Oxfam to organise documenting and sharing good experience of RVNA93 project implementation for both local partners in Ninh Thuan province, as well for other interested organisations and individuals at the national level.

IV. CONCLUSION

Project “Enhancing Market Access and Promoting Economic Leadership for Raglai Women in Ninh Thuan Province” demonstrated a very effective approach to help ethnic minority people in general, and for Raglai women in particular, to overcome poverty and improve their social status by enhancing their production capacity and access to the markets, together with piloting several innovative models. In fact, the project was successful in making something impossible become a reality by implementing a set of well-designed activities (e.g. establishing and maintaining operation of joint interest groups, organising series of training courses on relevant topics, IEC campaigning, policy dialogue and advocacy, etc.). As a result the project has brought about very positive impacts on thinking and acting of Raglai people in general, and of Raglai women in particular.

However, the achieved results were still initial, and there is a lot of follow-up work required from local partners and people in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts so that they will be maintained and consolidated. One way to do so is to draw lessons learnt from project implementation, and then incorporate them into existing government development policies/programmes such as Programme 30a, New Rural Programme, Tam Nong Project, Poverty Reduction Programme, etc.

With high commitment and dedication of local government, mass organisations and people, it is very likely that positive results will be achieved in poverty reduction, economic and social and development of Raglai communities, as well in improving the living condition and status of the Raglai women.
V. ANNEXES

1. Case studies

Phuoc Tien market day and the joy from attending it of Raglai women

Back to Bac Ai district after 4 years we were surprised by the changes in Raglai women we had a chance to meet. Our group discussions were so lively with full and active participation of Raglai women, some of them even made jokes and laughed loudly. It was such a contrasting atmosphere to what we had experienced four years ago. Kator Thi Kinh, CWU Chair of Phuoc Tien commune, revealed with a smile: “They have become so active and self-confident because of attending market sessions”.

The first Phuoc Tien “market day” started in July 2011 at an open space nearby the CPC office, along the Highway 27B. At that time, the PMU managed to organise a handful of group members to bring and sell their own products at the market once a month. Pinang thi Phuoc (Vice-chair, Phuoc Tan Communal Fatherland Front) recalled: “During my first time attending the market day my thought was that I did so because I was asked by the PMU. I really did not believe myself of being able to sell something and earn some money. Thus I brought few sugarcane sticks there, and was surprised it was sold in a moment. Then I run home quickly and asked my husband to go to field cutting more sugarcane sticks and bringing it back to the market. After that I feel comfortable and joyous every time I bring goods to the market and sell it. When we run out of goods, I go around buying vegetable from neighbours and sell it at the market”. Seeing Raglai people getting used to market activities, the PMU decided to increase the number of market day from two to three, and to four times a month (every Friday from 5-9 a.m.). Local authorities had been convinced and understood the importance of market access, and decided to use government budget to build a new big permanent market in Phuoc Tien commune near the temporary one in early 2012. Raglai people tend to bring to the market what they have planted or collected (e.g. pork, chickens, fish, crabs, snails, vegetable, fruits, etc.). Other businessmen from around areas also attend market days and sell goods like clothes, groceries, production tools and food. Attending market day every Friday has become a joy for many Raglai women.
Mr. Vo Van Hung, 43 (in striped short shirt), was the person who has helped Raglai women to have joy from attending market days. Every market goer - Raglai women in Phuoc Tan and Phuoc Tien commune talked of Mr. Hung with great affection and thankfulness. Mr. Hung used to work for Oxfam since 2007 as project secretary. Since November 2011, after the market model was piloted under the project RVNA93, Mr. Hung has become officer of the Phuoc Tien CPC Office.

He worked tirelessly since the very first market day to mobilise Raglai people to attend it and Hung did not miss any market day so far though he had been busy with various tasks. Few years ago, many Raglai people had no idea of selling and buying goods. All the things produced by them were either used within their family, or bartered for other things. Because of their habit of bartering, Raglai people were often forced by middlemen to sell their pigs or chicken at very low prices disregarding the size of animal. Within the framework of project activities, all group female members received training on market access. They, however, still felt uncomfortable with practising. Thus, Mr. Hung had to accompany them during first market days instructing them how to use scales, setting price, and calculating costs and benefits. He also helped them in finding new suppliers or even in purchasing additional goods. Nowadays, most Raglai women feel comfortable with market activities and they are grateful for Mr. Hung for that. Group members in Tra Co 2 village, Phuoc Tien commune shared “We always ask Mr. Hung for commodity price, in case he is not available we would ask Ms. Thuy, Mr. Tu, our friend, or use our mobile phones.”
Black pig of Raglai people

Passing the main roads of Thuan Bac district, Ninh Thuan province travelers can see small billboards with Oxfam’s and IFAD’s logos and Thuan Bac DPC title advertising “Using black pork of Raglai people is both delicious and safe, and it helps develop their economy as well”. In fact, it is about an indigenous breed of black pig, which has been raised by Raglai communities for many generations. However, most recently the black pig has been sold to the markets as a Ninh Thuan specialty thanks to the support of the project “Enhancing Market Access and Promoting Economic Leadership for Raglai Women in Ninh Thuan Province”.

In the past, Raglai people raised black pigs as a reserved asset - they only used pigs for family feast or sold it in case of need for cash. Since participating in joint interest groups and being trained, knowing how to calculate production costs and benefit most Raglai women no longer raise black pig for as long as 3-4 years because they know it is very costly and earning is just 1.5-2 million VND/pig. Nowadays, the group members tend to raise a batch of piglets for just 6-7 months and earn the same amount of money. They apply modern production techniques - semi-free range raising, planting vegetable, feed silage, vaccination and sterilisation, asking veterinary to come when they pigs are sick, etc. However, because of their poverty, people are still reluctant to pay money unless they are sure of the result of a treatment/advice.

After attending training courses and practising it, many Raglai people know, for the first time, how to calculate production costs, how to buy and sell goods in order to generate profit. They are no longer dependent on middlemen as in the past – in case of wanting to sell a pig they would contact either middlemen or slaughterhouses, or use mobile phone to inquire prices, and they will choose the one with the best price offer. In Bac Ai district, Mr. Vo Van Hung, project secretary, is a trusted source of information, which people call when they want to sell pig. In Thuan Bac district, producer groups have signed contracts with the Chung-Lieu slaughterhouse to sell their pigs.
The most important thing is that many Raglai people now pursue market-oriented production. For example, some households are specialised in selling small piglets weighted 5-9kg to pork processing shops; other households sell 20-30 kg pigs to restaurants; and only few households sell big 40-60 kg pigs to local markets. The current selling price of 45-50k per kg of live weight brings about good profits to Raglai people.

“A skilled midwife” of joint interest groups in Loi Hai commune

Ms Nguyen Thi Tot, 51, has been Chair of Loi Hai communal Women’s Union (CWU) for 15 years. Since the beginning of project implementation, Ms. Tot has been working closely with the PMU in establishing joint interest groups, members of which were voted and selected from around 2,500 CWU members. As a result 12 groups have been established based on WU units in 6 villages of Loi Hai commune. Group leaders have also been selected among the village WU cadre. Every year, each group member deposits 50k VND to the group revolving fund, which provide additional credit to group members. Interest money is used to cover costs of group operation. The group fund and groups activities are supposed to be maintained even after the project finished.

Ms. Tot participates in monthly meetings of all groups with Raglai women. At the meeting, besides listening to members’ sharing of their issues and experiences, she also helps them in revisiting what they have learnt in training courses, and answers their questions. In order to be fully competent, Ms. Tot also took part at the training together with group members. She speaks Raglai language fluently and uses it to explain training content to Raglai women and helps them understand it better.

Living within Raglai communities and speaking their language, Ms. Tot understands well their culture and habits, and knows how to help them best. She shares that Raglai CWU officers though having authority in their community, are often elderly people and have low education level. On the other
hand, there are some young Raglai women, though more active and having better education, are not fully recognised by the community because of their young age. Thus it is important to have these young women in groups in order to lend group leader with helping hands in calculating figures and writing reports. Younger women are also more capable in learning and applying new production techniques and thus are expected to act as core members of groups.

2 Terms of Reference

FINAL EVALUATION OF NINH THUAN WEL PROJECT

1. Background

Oxfam in Vietnam is looking for a team of consultants to conduct a final evaluation for project entitled “Enhancing market access and promoting economic leadership for Raglai women in Ninh Thuan province” (Ninh Thuan WEL project) which is funded by Oxfam for a period 2011-2015. The project is designed to develop economic leadership for Raglai women in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts – a matrilineal community – through:

- supporting commodity production and business orientation;
- enhancing opportunities to engage with the market and play an active role in household economic activities.

The project will phase out by March 31, 2015.

Overview, WEL approach of Oxfam refers to the processes and outcomes through which poor women are able to effectively participate in, and meaningfully contribute to, economic decision-making and to gain control over economic resources, on an equal footing with men – at the household and community and global levels. For more information, please click to [http://growsellthrive.org/resources/learning-resources#Presentations](http://growsellthrive.org/resources/learning-resources#Presentations)

The Ninh Thuan WEL project has the following objectives:

**Overall objective**

By 2015, 3000 Raglai women in Ninh Thuan province will have gained a greater economic status and social roles in comparison to men within their communities and society.

**Specific objectives**

- Raising women’s knowledge and skills in commodity production and the market-oriented approach;
- Strengthening Raglai women’s power in economic relations through promoting cooperation of medium and small production/business groups;
- Developing local commodity production and markets through policy advocacy and direct support to enterprises and producer groups;
- Promoting change in labour division between men and women in the family in order to facilitate women take part in economic activities to generate a greater family income.

For more information about the Ninh Thuan WEL project (partners, beneficiaries, approaches, outcomes, impacts etc.), please click to [http://goo.gl/aqJLVX](http://goo.gl/aqJLVX) (in Vietnamese) and [http://goo.gl/yEqTYi](http://goo.gl/yEqTYi) (in English).

2. Objectives of the final evaluation for Ninh Thuan WEL project

- To measure project (achievements/failures and changes against designed objectives/ expected outcomes), and evaluate partnership between partners & Oxfam and partners’ capacity;
• To document good/bad practices and lessons learnt from project for better application by Raglai ethnic women & policy advocacy;
• Propose concrete recommendations for similar future projects or improving Raglai ethnic women’s leadership and higher market access in the value chain.

3. Process and methodology
• A set of participatory, creative and visual tools that might include focus group discussion, observations, in-depth interview, and case study collection as well as indicators for evaluation will be developed by consultant team and agreed by Oxfam in advance;
• The review will be a combination between literature review and field work. Literature review includes (but not limited to) discussions with Oxfam staff and review of relevant project appraisals, reports and documents by Oxfam, its partners and beneficiaries;
• Field work must be taken place in Ninh Thuan province from 3rd week of March 2015;
• Oxfam will be kept updated about the evaluation progress for further feedback or advice;
• Indicate how the program constitutes “value for money” by addressing the “4Es” of economy, efficiency, effectiveness and equity. Consider the questions in the following table to help address the “4Es”:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economy</th>
<th>How effectively and efficiently have our resources been used?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Are the financial controls adequate? Do they adequately minimise wastage of resources?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Is the nature and magnitude of the outcomes / changes / impact sufficient to justify the resources invested?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Efficiency</th>
<th>How effectively and appropriately have those we seek to benefit been involved at relevant stages through the process?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>How effectively and appropriately have we worked with others and involved them in relevant stages through the process?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Do the delivery mechanisms efficiently translate inputs into outputs, with minimum wastage?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Are risks to the production of outputs identified and successfully managed?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effectiveness</th>
<th>What significant changes have occurred in women’s, men’s, boys’ and girls’ lives and to what extent are these likely to be sustained?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What changes in policies, practices, ideas, beliefs and attitudes have occurred in specific institutions, groups and individuals?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What evidence is there that the theory of change is working? What evidence is there that the program is achieving the desired outcomes and objectives in a timely manner?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Are the changes being brought about by the initiative valued by stakeholders? Which stakeholders? To what extent?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Equality</th>
<th>How far has greater equity been achieved between women and men, boys and girls, and other groups? (Were the benefits of the initiative equitable distributed between girls/women and boys/men?)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What evidence demonstrates that marginalised and vulnerable individuals and communities – including girls and women, persons with disabilities and persons with disadvantages – are meaningfully engaged in the development, delivery and assessment of the program?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What evidence is there that the benefits of the initiative reach poor and vulnerable individuals and communities?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. Output

- Output of the evaluation will be documented in one report which takes into account entire review process and findings. The report should be prepared in both English and Vietnamese following Oxfam format.
- For comment convenience, first draft report should be in Vietnamese.
- A presentation on initial findings to Oxfam and its partners for feedback and recommendation will be held after the field visit to Ninh Thuan province.
- The final report should include an executive summary, main body (that clarifies research methodology, progress and key findings), conclusion, recommendations and annexes.

5. Timing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Submission of proposal</td>
<td>By Jan 30, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Field work</td>
<td>From 3rd week of March 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submission of first draft</td>
<td>By April 15, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submission of second draft</td>
<td>By April 20, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submission of final report</td>
<td>By April 29, 2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. Profile of desired consultant team

The consultancy team should have different and complementary profiles (composition of team of men & women with more or less similar programme / project experience is preference):

**Team Leader**

- At least master’s degree either in economics, development studies or social sciences.
- In-depth knowledge of rural development, value chains, livelihood development and gender issues;
- At least 10 years experiences with demonstrated monitoring and evaluation knowledge, skills and experiences of mountainous or rural development programme;
- In-depth knowledge of research methods with particular focus on participatory methods, including in-depth interviews, focus group discussions and product or behavior trials;
- Excellent analytical and writing in English and Vietnamese;
- Having understandings of customs and practices, gender relations, livelihoods of ethnic groups in Ninh Thuan province is an asset;
- Good understanding of Oxfam works in Vietnam would be an advantage;
- Vietnamese national.

**Team member(s)**

- At least a Bachelor’s degree in development studies, agricultural, social sciences or economics;
- At least 5 years of participatory monitoring and evaluation experiences;
- Good knowledge of rural development, agricultural value chains and livelihood development;
- Good knowledge of research methods with particular focus on participatory methods, including in-depth interviews, focus group discussions and product or behavior trials;
- Team work experience.
- Good analytical and writing skills in English and Vietnamese.
- Competent in using statistical software.
- Vietnamese national.

7. Submission of proposal

Closing date for application: by 5pm, Friday, January 30, 2015.

Application package should include:
- A technical proposal in English or Vietnamese detailing design, methodology, work plan, CVs that highlighting relevant qualifications and experience and proof of past consultancy services.
- 01 – 02 similar evaluation reports made by applicant team of leader and members;
- A financial proposal stating consultancy fees and other related expenditures;

Proposals should be submitted via email to:

**Mr. Mai The Long**  
Livelihoods Programme Officer  
Oxfam, 22 Le Dai Hanh, Hanoi  
Tel: 043945 4448 (ext: 702)  
Email: mtlong@oxfam.org.uk
### 3. Field mission plan and schedule (from 31\(^{st}\) March to 3\(^{rd}\) April 2015)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Consultants</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Tentative time</th>
<th>Note</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Monday 30(^{th}) March</td>
<td>Hanoi</td>
<td>Duong Thanh Trung Dao Thi Hoang Mai Hoang Xuan Truong</td>
<td>Fly from Hanoi to Ninh Thuan (with Oxfam staff)</td>
<td>p.m.</td>
<td>Oxfam book tickets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quang Nam</td>
<td>Vu Ngoc Anh</td>
<td>Go by train from Quang Nam to Ninh Thuan</td>
<td></td>
<td>Booked by CSDP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tuesday 31/3/2015 Morning</td>
<td>Phan Rang-Thap Cham city</td>
<td>4 consultants</td>
<td>Interviews, group discussions with projects' partners at provincial level:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Provincial DARD</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Industrial and Commercial Extension Centre</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Tam Nong Project PMU</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Provincial WU</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8h-9h</td>
<td></td>
<td>Arranged by consultants and Mrs. Hien (Vice - chair of PWU)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8h-9h</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9h30h-10h30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9h30h-10h30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Tuesday 1/4/2015 Afternoon</td>
<td>Bac Ai district</td>
<td>Group 1 (2 consultants) – in the afternoon</td>
<td>Interviews, group discussions with project partners at the district level:</td>
<td></td>
<td>Arranged by local partner in Bac Ai district</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- District Project Coordinating Board (DPCB)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- DARD</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- WU</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>14h30-15h30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>16h – 17h</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Phuoc Tan commune in Bac Ai district (afternoon)</td>
<td>Group (2 consultants) – work in the afternoon</td>
<td>Interview with Head of Commune People Committee (or Head of Commune Project Management Board) Group discussion with communal officers (from PMB, WU, YU, Farmer Union…) Group discussion with Heads of villages Group discussion with 01 group of beneficiaries (12-15 households, at least half are poor ethnic women)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Arranged by local partner in Bac Ai district.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>14h30 – 15h15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>15h15 – 17h</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>14h30-15h30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>15h30-17h</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 3  | Wednesday 1/4/2015 | Phuoc Tien commune in Bac Ai district (whole day) | 02 group of consultants | Morning (group 1): working at CPC  
- Interview with Head of Commune People Committee (or Head of Commune Project Management Board)  
- Group discussion with communal | 8h30-9h30 | Arranged by local partner in Bac Ai district. |
|    |                 |                            |                                                                            | Note: select 01                                                                                      |                |                                           |
| 4 | Thursday 2/4 | Thuan Bac district (in the morning) | **Group 1 (2 consultants) – working in the district (DPC) at the morning, working at Loi Hai commune in the afternoon** | Interviews, group discussions with projects’ partners at district level: | 8h-9h | 9h-10h | **village that have good project’s results, and 01 village that have worse project’s results for field visits** |
| 4 | Thursday 2/4 | Thuan Bac district (in the morning) | Group 1 (2 consultants) – working in the district (DPC) at the morning, working at Loi Hai commune in the afternoon | **District Project Coordinating Board (DPCB)** | 8h-9h |
| | | | | **DARD** | 8h-9h |
| | | | | **WU** | 9h-10h |
| | | Loi Hai commune in Thuan Bac district | Group 2 (2 consultants) – whole day | **Morning (group 2): working at CPC** | 8h30-9h30 | Arranged by local partner in Thuan Bac district. |
| | | | Group 1 (2 consultants) – in the afternoon | **Interview with Head of Commune People Committee (or Head of****|

**Group discussion with Heads of villages**

**Visit 2-3 households**

**Morning (group 2): working at village 1 (Da Trang village)**

- Group discussion with 01 group of 10 women from poor ethnic households)
- Group discussion with 01 mixed group of 10-15 beneficiaries (at least half number are poor ethnic women)
- Interview for 1-2 case studies
- Site observation

**Afternoon (group 1): working at village 2**

- Group discussion with 01 group of 10 women from poor ethnic households)
- Group discussion with 01 mixed group of 10-15 beneficiaries (at least half number are poor ethnic women)
- Interview for 1-2 case studies
- Site observation

**Afternoon (group 2): working at commune**

- Interview for 1-2 case studies
- Interview other local actors (collectors, slaughter, retailers…)

**9h30-11h30**

**8h30-10h30**

**10h30-11h30**

**8h30-10h30**

**10h30-11h30**

**14h-16h**

**14h-17h**

**8h-9h**

**8h-9h**

**8h-9h**

**9h-10h**

**8h30-9h30**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Day</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Team</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Friday 3/4/2015</td>
<td>Phan Rang-Thap Cham</td>
<td>4 consultants</td>
<td>Review the information and broad results of the field works to Oxfam’s staff and provincial partners, collect further feedbacks from partners. Investigating further local actors at provincial level, who have involved with project’s activities</td>
<td>8h30-10h30</td>
<td>Arranged by consultants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Saturday 4/4/2015</td>
<td>Phan Rang-Thap Cham</td>
<td>Vu Ngoc Anh Duong Thanh Trung Dao Thi Hoang Mai Hoang Xuan Truong</td>
<td>Flight back from Ninh Thuan to Hanoi with Oxfam staffs</td>
<td>On date</td>
<td>Booked by Oxfam</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: select 01 village that have good project’s results, and 01 village that have worse project’s results for field visits
4. List of interviewees and group discussion participants

Total 146 people, of which:
- Provincial officers: 3
- District officers: 14
- Communal officers: 11
- Group members: 117
- Case studies: 2
- Slaughterhouse: 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Partners/ Beneficiaries/ Other actors</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Gender</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Provincial partners</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Phan Quang Thủ</td>
<td>Vice Director of DARD</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Cao Chí</td>
<td>Head of Value chain unit, Tam Nong Project</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lê Thị Thu Hiền</td>
<td>Vice-chair PWU</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>District partners of Bac Ai</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Nguyễn Văn Cường</td>
<td>Vice president of DPC, Head of DPCB</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nguyễn Văn Cánh</td>
<td>Head of DPC Office, Vice Head of DPCB</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nguyễn Văn Tú</td>
<td>Officer at DPC Office, Project Coordinator</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pi nằng Thị Mai</td>
<td>Chair of DWU</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Đỗ Thị Bích Liên</td>
<td>Vice-chair of DWU</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nguyễn Hồng Vinh</td>
<td>Deputy head of Agricultural Extension Station</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lê Ngọc Chiến</td>
<td>Head of Veterinary Station</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>District partners of Thuan Bac</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Võ Chí</td>
<td>Vice-Chair of DPC, Head of DPCB</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Phạm Thị Lụm</td>
<td>President of DWU, Deputy Head of DPCB</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mai Thị Hà</td>
<td>Vice-Chair of DWU, Project Coordinator</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Officers in Phuoc Tan commune</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Phan Ngoc</td>
<td>Head of CPC, Head of PMU</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Phan Chum</td>
<td>CPC office staff</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pham Thi Phuoc</td>
<td>Vice-president of Fatherland Front</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Chamalla Thi Hung</td>
<td>Vice-chair of CWU</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Phan Thuong</td>
<td>Head of YU</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Officers in Phuoc Tien commune</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Hoang Van Dang</td>
<td>CPC Chair, Head of PMU</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kato Chinh</td>
<td>Chair of CWU</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kato Chuyen</td>
<td>Head of YU</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Dinh Thanh Hue</td>
<td>Veterinary officer</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Vo Van Hung</td>
<td>CPC office staff</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Officers in Loi Hai commune</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Nguyen Thi Tot</td>
<td>Chair of CWU</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Beneficiaries in Phuoc Tan commune</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Kato Hanh</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kato Huyen</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Chamalla thi K’trong</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pham thi Am</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pham thi Thao</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pham thi Nhep</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pham thi Khum</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Chamalla thi Chay</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kato Lep</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kato Hue</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pham thi Hup</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Chamalla thi Khan</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pham thi On</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pham Khio</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kato Kodem</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Beneficiaries in Da Bac village, Phuoc Tien commune</td>
<td>Beneficiaries in Tra Co 1 village, Phuoc Tien commune</td>
<td>Beneficiaries in Suoi Rua village, Phuoc Tien commune</td>
<td>Beneficiaries in Tra Co 2 village, Phuoc Tien commune</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Chamalea Bé, Chamalea thị Ém, Chamalea thị Hèm, Chamalea thị Kim, Chamalea thị Hẹp, Chamalea thị Túc, Pinăng thị Nguyệt, Katro thị Ngữ, Pinăng thị Đạo, Katro Phượng</td>
<td>Pinăng thị Huyền, Katro thị Hàng, Pinăng thị Nghiên, Pinăng Núm, Chamalea thị Uyên, Pinăng thị Ninh, Chamalea thị Huấn, Pinăng thị Đạm, Pinăng thị Lý, Pinăng thị Ngoàn, Katro Kiêng, Pinăng thị Ngâm, Pinăng thị Thuynthia</td>
<td>Pinăng thị Nhuận, Pinăng Ngúng, Pinăng thị Hiệm, Katro thị Nho, Katro thị Nghiền, Pinăng thị Thiên, Katro Hôm, Katro thị Đạt, Katro Ảng, Pinăng Thong, Pinăng Xin, Katro Hoa, Pinăng Lào</td>
<td>Chamalea thị Hằng, Katro thị Hừng, Katro thị Nhím, Katro thị Biểu, Katro thị Xếp, Chamalea thị Bửa, Chamalea thị Loan, Katro Lao, Pinăng Ảng</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 12 | Beneficiaries (group 1) in Ba Rau 1 village, Loi Hai commune | 14 | Kato thị Em  
Patauxá thị Yến  
Chamalea thị Mơ  
Chamale thị Sứ  
Kató thị Đạnh  
Chamalea thị Thánh  
Kató thị Chí  
Emasít thị Lý  
Kató thị Tá  
Kató thị Dung  
Kató thị Đám  
Kató thị Nghị  
Kató thị Men  
Jeak thị Đạt | Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female | 13 | Beneficiaries (group 2) in Ba Rau 1 village, Loi Hai commune | 15 | Kato thị Hoanh  
Kató thị Phương My  
Kató thị Sỹ  
Kató thị Hồng Đẹp  
Emasít thị Lý  
Emasít thị Nghị  
Kató thị Tuyết  
Kató thị Nị  
Jeak thị Ti  
Chamale thị Em  
Ta-pa thị Bay  
Emasít thị Sanh  
Chamale thị Chí  
Emasít thị Noanh | Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female  
Female |
| Case studies | 3 | Kato Hiêu | Phuoc Tan commune |
| Tala thị Nai | | Loi Hai commune |
| Lê Văn Chung | | Slaughterhouse owner Chung-Liêu in Loi Hai |
## 5. Project M&E indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall objective</th>
<th>Impact</th>
<th>Indicators and project’s achievements</th>
<th>Information resources</th>
<th>Assumptions &amp; Risks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Raglai women have gained a greater economic status and social roles by enhancing women’s active participation in commodity production and market-oriented agricultural value chains ... | • Ratio of Raglai women that have active role in decision of their lives, and hold economic leadership in family and community  
• Ratio of Raglai women that have capacity to participate to and benefit from market and economic activities. | • Independent evaluations  
• Projects final reports  
• Project progress reports  
• Official Statistical data  
• Government’s social and economical development reports  
• Case studies | • Poverty reduction is a priority of Government and Province authorities.  
• High market demand, and commitment from partners and beneficiaries.  
• No serious natural disasters in the project time. |
| Specific objectives | to enhance women’s knowledge and skills in commodity production and market-oriented approach;  
• to strengthen Raglai women’s power in economic relations through promoting cooperation of medium and small production/business groups;  
• to develop local commodity production and markets through policy advocacy and direct support to enterprises and producer groups; and  
• to promote change in labor division between men and women in the family in order to facilitate women take part in economic activities to generate a greater family income. | • Average households’ annual income (70% of targeted households) increase by 40% in compare to the households’ income in first project year.  
• At least 80% Raglai women have more active role and better leadership in their family, community, and even higher level  
• At least 1 activity or group of activities to strengthen Raglai women’s power in economic relations was engaged in development plan/program of local authorities. | • Annual PRA  
• Evaluation  
• M&E reports  
• Project annual reports | • Market oriented activities are not familiar with minor ethnic people and local partners  
• Limited capacity of local production groups  
• More national disasters occurred in recent years, that have bad impacts on agricultural production  
• The barrier of languages that prevent market access of ethnic women, that so to block project achievements. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Expected results</th>
<th>Mid-term outcome 1: Increased income for 3,000 Raglai women and their families.</th>
<th>Output 1.1: Productive, market &amp; business capacities of Raglai women producers in selected sub-sectors have been improved; Output 1.2: Quality and functioning of agricultural services have been strengthened.</th>
<th>Year 1:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gender market mapping and selection to identify potential products in Thuan Bac and Bac Ai districts</td>
<td>The system of production groups was examined, and at least 22 groups were strengthened to effectively implement project activities.</td>
<td>44 head and vice-head of the groups were trained on leading skills, presentation skill, and organizing skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>800 Raglai women were trained on business plan and family economic management skills</td>
<td>76 veterinary workers was participated in TOT training</td>
<td>600 Raglai women were trained on business plan and family economic management skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Average annual family income of 10% of the total targeted households has increased by 5%</td>
<td>Year 2:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>80 veterinary workers was participated in TOT training</td>
<td>8 training courses on agricultural extension and veterinary 240 Raglai women</td>
<td>System of agricultural extension and veterinary were strengthened and effective maintained</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>500 Raglai women were trained on trained on business plan and family economic management skills</td>
<td>A market information channel (formal or informal) was established to meet the need of producers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100% Raglai women have access to at least one source of market information</td>
<td>Year 3:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>At least 70% of direct beneficiaries have increased household’s income by project activities</td>
<td>The number of feeding black-pig increase by 30% to the number of the first project year.</td>
<td>100% Raglai women have access to at least one source of market information</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Focus group discussion, M&E reports
- Annual reports
- Independent evaluation
- Gender market mapping report
- List of trainees
- Training reports

- No epidemic diseases
- Continuously supports from local authorities in the case of epidemic diseases
| Expected results |  
|-----------------|--------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|
| **Mid-term outcome 2:** Improved status and roles among Raglai women within their families, communities. | **Output 2.1:** Raglai men have played a more active role in household economic development and sharing of domestic chores. | **Year 1:**  
- Number of women with greater status than men in family and communities increased  
- The number of hours for rest of women increased by 10%  
- Activities with men focus to encourage men participation in economic activities have been implemented. | **Year 2:**  
- 12 training course on gender equality.  
- 4 information campaigns for changes in gender equality  
- A network of PWEL established at national level through NGO centre and/or WU (may have the linkage to present network in Lao Cai).  
- Capacity of women organizations in terms of women’s economic leadership has been enhanced  
- At least 1 visit of mass media to locality to investigate good practices of the project. | **Year 3:**  
- The number of hours Raglai men spent on housework increased by 10%  
- 100% of female members of interest groups participate regular group meetings.  
- 90% of female members of interest groups take part in activities - economic, social and cultural events in their communities  
- At least 70% of women receive more support from male members in their families when the project finished  
- 25% important positions in local authorities/organizations are women.  
- 650 women have contribution in making important decisions in their families (e.g. use of resources, animal husbandry, land use and education of children)  
- The number of hours Raglai men spent on production and business increased by 20% | **Year 2:**  
- 12 training course on gender equality.  
- 4 information campaigns for changes in gender equality  
- A network of PWEL established at national level through NGO centre and/or WU (may have the linkage to present network in Lao Cai).  
- Capacity of women organizations in terms of women’s economic leadership has been enhanced  
- At least 1 visit of mass media to locality to investigate good practices of the project. | **Focus group discussion, M&E reports**  
**Annual reports**  
**Independent evaluation** | **Focus group discussion, M&E reports**  
**Annual reports**  
**Practice results**  
**Trainees**  
**Training reports**  
**Case studies** |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Expected results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mid-term outcome</strong>: Government’s plans and programs have incorporated specific measures and actions to support smallholder producers and enterprises.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Output 3.1</strong>: Awareness of local government on women's economic ownership right and capacity has been improved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Output 3.2</strong>: Smallholder enterprises have developed strategic plans reflecting their views as inputs into government programs.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Year 2:**
- At least 02 advocacy meetings organized with district authorities to engage supports to SMEs and small producers in local development plans or programs.
- 02 local workshops for product chains organized. (not implemented and converted to activity of “Research on markets for black-pig value chain, and set-up production plan, and business plan for CIGs”).
- A network of WEL applicants will be established and functioning (in form of a forum) so that stakeholders will have opportunity to discuss/share the WEL approach and application.
- The number of women in leadership positions in communal and village mass organizations increased by 15%.
- 20 small businesses/household enterprises received advice on administrative procedures, legal procedures for starting their business.
- A study on the strength and challenges to SMEs leaded by women.
- Experiences and best practices on WEL sharing on website, blog, workshop, information updating, and field visits.

**Year 3:**
- A workshop or field visit organized for policy makers (people assembly, government officers) at local and national level.
- Best practice or model on WEL replicated in poverty reduction programs of government and province.
- Increase in government budget allocation for small farmers and enterprises is reflected in local government SED plans.
- Experiences and best practices documented and shared to various national, provincial, and districts stakeholders.

**Outputs reports:**
- Local 5 year SEDP
- Group meeting records
- Researches
- Field visit reports
- Researches
- Website, Blog, Field visit report, Workshops
- SEDP reports
- Outputs reports
6. Detail assessment of project results

**Outcome 1: Increased income for 3,000 Raglai women and their families.**

**Output 1.1: Productive, market & business capacities of Raglai women producers in selected sub-sectors have been improved**

*Indicator 1.1.1* “at least 70% of direct beneficiaries enjoy increase in family income through participating in project activities” was almost achieved according to partners’ reports.

*Indicator 1.1.2* “Average annual family income of 10% of the total targeted households has increased by 5%” met the set target. However, one should be make clear here that the income increase was a combined result of a host of factors such as government support policies, efforts made by local governments and people, and Oxfam’s contribution.

*Indicator 1.1.3* “100% of Raglai women have access to at least one source of market information” clearly met the target, especially considering the members of 22 interest groups and their family members.

*Indicator 1.1.4 (revised omitting the number of cows):* number of black pig increased by 30% compared to the project first year: Exceeded the target (see Table 2.1)

*Indicator 1.1.5:* Increase productivity of corn and okras by 15%. Not relevant for evaluation

**Activities to achieve Output 1.1:**

- Research on “Gender market mapping and selection studies” to determine feasible products in Thuan Bac and Bac Ai districts. In November 2012, Oxfam hired a consultant group from Southern Centre for Agricultural Strategy and Policy Studies (SCAP) to do the research, with the recommendation that local black pig is the most suitable value chain to enhancing Raglai women’s market accessing and economic leading. According to that, the effective production scale is 3-4 black pigs per household, using available feeding resources of the household, and with the supports (of breading pigs, pigsty materials, vaccine, training…) from the Project to about 200 Raglai women. The expected income from pigs would be about 12 million VND per household per year.

- In October 2014, the Project implemented an additional research on “Analysis on Black pig value chain, and technical assistant for CIGs activities”. This research helped to do a mapping on the black pig value chain; accessing potential markets, and demand on pig quality of trading actors (collectors, slaughters, retailers…); pointing out opportunities and challenges to strengthen the market linkages among producers and other actors in the value chain to improve their income; analyzing on agricultural development policies, business development services in Ninh Thuan, and opportunities for improving service quality, for reducing production cost, and increasing income for black-pigs breading farmers.

- The results: the Research has: recommended a Black –pig Value chain Up-grading Plan in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac districts, and a strategic plan for RVNA93 project in 2015-2020; consulted on a set of commercial trademark (logo, marking, leaflet, posters…) for black-pig product of Ninh Thuan province; set-up 2 commercial chains for local black-pig products, and standardized a technical production process for local black-pig.

- The system of production groups was examined, and at least 22 groups were strengthened to effectively implement project activities; Met the target: 22 production groups (4 groups in Phuoc Tan commune, 6 groups in Phuoc Tien commune, and 12 groups in Loi Hai commune) have been strengthened capacity in the project time.
- Monthly meetings of production group to review production results, to share experiences and plans: Met the target, 100% groups have monthly meeting.
- 44 head and vice-head of the groups were trained on leading skills, presentation skill, and organizing skills. Met the target, by 3 training courses organized in two districts.
- Training courses on agricultural extension and veterinary organized for hundred number of Raglai women: Met the target.
- 600 Raglai women were trained on business plan and family economic management skills: Meet the target by trainings on GALS/WEMAN and group meetings.
- Support outstanding group members to create production and business models. Met the target. The models of feeding pig in pigsty (by SPIN, 2 failures in Bac Ai), growing red worms, vegetables, slaughter, retailer...implemented by project.
- Support group members to go to commune market. Met the target. Especially increased the number of periodical market in Phuoc Tien from 1 to 4 times per month. About 30-35 Raglai women regularly participated in these markets.
- Support group members to participate in agricultural market fair in province and district: 2 fairs in 2013-2014 for Bac Ai members, and have achieved positive results.
- At least 1 visit of mass media to locality to investigate good practices of the project. Photo journal report on local black pig implemented in 2013 and 2014.
- Calendar 2014 with project information and propaganda given to group members; a leaflet on black pig market.
- Visits and workshops between member from Bac Ai and Thuan Bac to share experiences on plan application tools (GALS/WEMAN) and WEL model.
- Training on business plan and production expense calculation for group member. Have been implemented with good results.
- Meeting with staff of Agricultural expansion and veterinary department: did not organized in Bac Ai.
- Training on leading skills and organizing skills for head and vice-head of the groups. Have been implemented.
- Training on GALS/WEMAN: Member of Bac Ai participated training in Lao Cai, one TOT training for Thuan Bac member by ONL.

From 2015, Project added: Input service (Component 1 and 2); modified Component 2: Organizing production suitable to group capacity and market demand; modified Component 3: Market and product promotion. Met the target according to project reports.

- Create group’s credit fund, with contribution from self group members (from 2014): Met the target – all groups have fund (in Bac Ai, each member contributes 5-10 thousand VND per month).
- Growing vegetables (bananas, vegetables, sweet potatoes...) to expand foodstuffs and to sell for further household’s income: Not met the target – only a limited number of active groups members have done successfully up on the availability of water resources.
- Need assessment for group meeting activities: Met the target.
- Training and technical assistance on business and production planning up on market orientation for 10 groups, applied GALS/WEMAN approach: Met the target and highly appreciated by group’s members.
- Supply turn able breeding pig for members: Met the target.
- Guiding on food processing and feeding for pigs: Implemented.
- Support to maintain group’s monthly meetings: Met the target.
- Up-grading consuming chain for black-pigs, assuring veterinary requirements, supporting slaughter house (Thuan Bac): Supporting Chung Lieu slaughter house.
- Set-up consuming chain for black-pigsof 8-15 kg in Bac Ai: implemented in Phuoc Tien commune.
- Promoting the establishment of cooperative for trading black-pig products (workshop in Phuoc Tan commune)
- Building feeding centre for cooperative in Phuoc Tien commune: implemented in Tra Co 2 village
- Printing the set of recognizing trademark for black-pigs (logo, marking, leaflet,..): implemented
- Advertising black-pig products on mass media (newspapers, bulletins of GED, blog of Oxfam...): implemented + posters along national roads 1A and 27B.
- Assisting group members to participate in periodical fairs: implemented in 3 project’s communes

Output 1.2: “Quality and functioning of agricultural services have been strengthened”

Indicator 1.2.1 “Networks of agricultural extension and veterinary workers are strengthened and properly maintained” was achieved partially. A number of efforts were made and local agricultural extension and veterinary networks have been consolidated. The most positive changes were mainly with Raglai people’s awareness of common pig diseases and ways to deal with them. However, there are lot of things to be done with the networks because of three project communes only Phuoc Tien has a qualified veterinarian, whilst in two districts there is not any veterinarian at the village level.

Indicator 1.2.2 “A formal or informal channel of market information is established to serve the needs of local producers” met the target. Several channels have been established such as compiling and upgrading catalogues of service providers (e.g. veterinarians, extensionists, business development services); operation of village loudspeakers; asking project staff (e.g. Mr. Hung, Mss. Hà, Mr. Tú, Mss. Töst, etc.); information from relatives and local agents, use of mobile phones.

Activities to achieve Output 1.2:
- 80 veterinary workers were participated in TOT training: Met the target. According to the Oxfam’s reports, there were 6 TOT courses on cow and pig disease treatment implemented for 180 veterinary workers at commune and village level. Bac Ai reported that there are 22 worker trained (10 of them are working effectively). Thuan Bac reported that there are 60 worker trained
- Training core farmers on basic breeding skills: Met the target (see Output 1.2)
- One day workshop for group members on Agricultural expansion and Veterinary services: 180 participants
- Training on regular disease of black – pig, impact of closed blood cross and prevention methods: 180 participants
- Guiding on building pigsty (support materials): 3 households (each household in a commune) were selected for trial work.
- Guiding group members to arrange and to stock foodstuff for black-pig from available resources: implemented.

Outcome 2: “Improved status and roles among Raglai women within their families, communities” – achieved some first encouraging results, mainly concerning families of active members.

Output 2.1: Raglai men have played a more active role in household economic development and sharing of domestic chores. There have been some positive indicators showing Raglai men play a more active role in developing family economy, and sharing household workload with women. However, the changes are not profound.

Indicator 2.1.1 “The number of hours Raglai men spent on housework increased by 10%” was difficult to assess as there was no baseline and qualitative information of this indicator. However, interview results showed that the
participation of Raglai women in regular market sales “has liberated” them from some of household chores and these are taken over by men.

Indicator 2.1.2 “The number of hours Raglai men spent on production and business increased by 20%” was difficult to assess too as there was no baseline and qualitative information of this indicator, however, interviewed people shared that men in households, where women participating in regular market sales, seemed more active in helping their wives in preparation of goods for sale, as well as in doing the productive and housework for their wives.

Indicator 2.1.3 “At least 70% of women receive more support from male members in their families when the project finished” was difficult to assess as there was no baseline and qualitative information of this indicator. However, interview results show that most of market active women have received greater support from their family male members.

Activities to achieve Output 2.1:

Activities with men focus to encourage men participation in economic activities: 12 training course on gender equality; 4 information campaigns to make changes on gender preconception have been implemented to improve commodity awareness. Met the target. These activities were implemented in proper timetable with direct participation of Raglai men (though events in the communes). From 2012, films about family violence prevention were showed for local people, in combination with Q&A activities. However, almost all interviewed partners said that the participation of men is in limitation, the main participation is still women only.

Output 2.2: Raglai women have been more active and have stronger voice and better positions in communal formal institutions. Raglai women, especially group members, became more active than before in terms of application of modern productive techniques and accessing the market. However, it was still an initial progress and it is necessary for all stakeholders to make continuous efforts to build on and strengthen the momentum.

Indicator 2.2.1 “Number of women with greater status than men in family and communities increased” was difficult to assess as there was no baseline and qualitative information of this indicator. However, one can conclude this indicator met the target in cases of WU officers in Thuan Bac district and Phuoc Tien commune, interest groups leaders and active group members. Their capacity and authority has increased significantly through their active participation in project activities (e.g. training, group activities, production and sale activities, etc.).

Indicator 2.2.2 “The number of hours for rest of women increased by 10%” was difficult to assess too as there was no baseline and qualitative information of this indicator. In reality, the participation in project activities (e.g. application of modern production techniques and market sales) made both Raglai women and men busier than before.

Indicator 2.2.3: A network of PWEL established at national level through NGO centre and/or WU (may have the linkage to present network in Lao Cai). Met the target. (Oxfam has established GED – Gender Economic Development assistant group).

Indicator 2.2.4 “100% of female members of interest groups participate regular group meetings” met the target. It was encouraging that all interest groups were capable to maintain regular meetings.

Indicator 2.2.5 “90% of female members of interest groups take part in activities - economic, social and cultural events in their communities” met the target if one consider activities such as training, workshops, market sales, group meetings, communications and education campaigns, market fair, study tours, etc.

Indicator 2.2.6: 25% important positions in local authorities/organizations are women. There is no baseline information and present information.

Indicator 2.2.7: 650 women have contribution in making important decisions in their families (e.g. use of resources, animal husbandry, land use and education of children). As there was no information of this indicator
thus it was difficult to make a correct assessment of the indicator. On the other hand every interviewed people – partners, group members said that Raglai women did have a voice in making important family decisions.

**Output 2.3: Capacity of women organizations in terms of women’s economic leadership has been enhanced** - achieved initial results, particularly successful were the members of Thuan Bac DWU and Loi Hai CWU, as well as members of interest groups in three project communes.

**Activities to achieve Output 2.2 and 2.3:**
- Training on enhancing women’s power and gender network promotion.
- Support WU member to participate in forum/workshop on related issues at province and district levels: implemented.
- Support head and vice-head of groups, outstanding group members to participate in value chain workshops, forums at province and district levels: implemented, but not met the expectation, some activities were paused or converted to other activities.

**Outcome 3: “Government’s plans and programs have incorporated specific measures and actions to support smallholder producers and enterprises”**

**Output 3.1: Awareness of local government on women’s economic ownership right and capacity has been improved**

*Indicator 3.1.1 “A network of WEL applicants will be established and functioning (in form of a forum) so that stakeholders will have opportunity to discuss/share the WEL approach and application” met the target because i) A task force on Gender Economic Development (GED) was established by Oxfam; and ii) a number of provincial and district policy dialogues, study visits and advocacy workshops were organized. However, the problem here is how to maintain the network after the project finished.*

*Indicator 3.1.2 “The number of women in leadership positions in communal and village mass organizations increased by 15” has no data and the project looked to have no significant impact on this matter.*

**Activities to achieve Output 3.1:**
- At least 02 advocacy meetings organized with district authorities to engage supports to SMEs and small producers in local development plans or programs.
- At least 02 local workshops for product chains organized.
- Experiences and best practices on WEL sharing on website, blog, workshop, information up-dating, and field visits.
- A workshop or field visit organized for policy makers (people assembly, government officers) at local and national level.
- Best practice or model on WEL replicated in poverty reduction programs of government and province: implemented in Bac Ai and Thuan Bac.

- Experiences (including failures and best practices) documented and shared to various national, provincial, and districts stakeholders.

**From 2014, modified Component 4: Advocacy for intervention on Black-pig value chain**

4.1 Review on supporting policies of province and districts on husbandry sector: breeding resources, foodstuff resources,
infrastructure (water reservation, well-water, piggery…), breeding location scheme to commune level…: Implemented by an supplemental study

4.2 Review on supporting policies to trading agents; slaughter houses, collectors, retailers…: Supporting slaughter houses to meet with veterinary requirements (need a separate policy of province/district, can not apply government requirements as they are not suitable with local conditions): Implemented by an supplemental study

4.3 Organize workshop to share development plan for black-pig value chain, and to find the assistance to project communes: implemented at province and district level

4.4 Organize Project evaluation workshop (in combination with policy recommendation to support black-pig producers to create farmhouse): tentative workshop in April 17, 2015

4.5 Hand-over all research results to Tam Nong Project: a workshop organized, in combination with field visits to real implemented models (link market with production). Workshop in October, 2014 in Thuan Bac district.

**Output 3.2: Output 3.2: Smallholder enterprises have developed strategic plans reflecting their views as inputs into government programs** - Established an agricultural co-operative in Phuoc Tien, assisted business households

**Indicator 3.2.1** “20 small businesses/household enterprises received advice on administrative procedures, legal procedures for starting their business” was achieved. The project provided several households with modest funding to start their business – three models of semi-free range pig raising (2 in Bac Ai and 1 in Thuan Bac); ten models of vegetable growing for pig food in Phuoc Tien commune; ten models of business household in Phuoc Tien and Loi Hai communes, etc.

**Indicator 3.2.2** “Increase in government budget allocation for small farmers and enterprises is reflected in local government SED plans” – some progress has been recorded as result of Oxfam’s advocacy work with local government, particularly with the Tam Nong PMU. District partners shared some attempts were made within the Program 30a and the NTP on poverty reduction.

**2014 additional activities:**

4.6 Group production planning tools (WEMAN): implemented.

4.7 Visits and workshops between members from Bac Ai and Thuan Bac to share experiences on plan application tools (GALS/WEMAN) and WEL model: implemented
VI. LITERATURE

2. Annex 1: Logic framework of Project RVNA93
3. Oxfam, Updated Indicators of project RVNA93, January 2012
4. Oxfam documents: https://www.dropbox.com/sh/6utgcvt6k6uyn8o/AABcXgxMOo0MyBCsF2rb2Jw8a?dl=0
5. Southern Centre for Agricultural Strategy and Policy Studies (SCAP), Research on “Gender market mapping and priority selection for value chain in Bac Ai districts, Ninh Thuan province”, 2013
6. Oxfam, Leaflet No 091014 about Project RNVA93;
8. Hoang Xuan Truong and group, Report “Supplemental Study on Black-pig value chain, and technical assistant recommendation in Ninh Thuan province”, 10/2014
13. Plan and progress report of Project RVNA to 31/3/2012 of Bac Ai district
14. Project progress report from 10/2011 to 3/2012 of Bac Ai district
15. Project progress report from 10/2011 to 3/2012 of Thuan Bac district
16. Plan and progress report 2012-2013 of Bac Ai district
17. Plan and progress report 2012-2013 of Thuan Bac district
18. Plan and progress report 2013-2014 of Bac Ai district
19. Plan and progress report 2013-2014 of Thuan Bac district
20. Plan and progress report 2014-2015 of Bac Ai district